

GLOBALIZATION VS. NATIONAL SOVEREIGNTY

A thesis presented to the Faculty of the U.S. Army
Command and General Staff College in partial
fulfillment of the requirements for the
degree

MASTER OF MILITARY ART AND SCIENCE
Homeland Security Studies

by

CORY J. PETRO, MAJOR, U.S. ARMY
B.S., Point Park University, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, 2000

Fort Leavenworth, Kansas
2017

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited. Fair use determination or copyright permission has been obtained for the inclusion of pictures, maps, graphics, and any other works incorporated into this manuscript. A work of the United States Government is not subject to copyright, however further publication or sale of copyrighted images is not permissible.

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE			<i>Form Approved</i> <i>OMB No. 0704-0188</i>		
Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing this collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden to Department of Defense, Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports (0704-0188), 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. PLEASE DO NOT RETURN YOUR FORM TO THE ABOVE ADDRESS.					
1. REPORT DATE (DD-MM-YYYY) 9-06-2017		2. REPORT TYPE Master's Thesis		3. DATES COVERED (From - To) AUG 2016 – JUN 2017	
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE Globalization vs. National Sovereignty			5a. CONTRACT NUMBER		
			5b. GRANT NUMBER		
			5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER		
6. AUTHOR(S) Cory J. Petro, Major			5d. PROJECT NUMBER		
			5e. TASK NUMBER		
			5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER		
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) U.S. Army Command and General Staff College ATTN: ATZL-SWD-GD Fort Leavenworth, KS 66027-2301			8. PERFORMING ORG REPORT NUMBER		
9. SPONSORING / MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)			10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)		
			11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)		
12. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for Public Release; Distribution is Unlimited					
13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES					
14. ABSTRACT Does the continuing increase in globalization particularly in the areas of economic, technological, travel, immigration, and multiple citizenships decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? This increase in globalization may cause unintended interdependencies. This thesis investigates the relationship between globalization, national sovereignty, and homeland security. If this increase continues without a balance will the government not be able to respond to an incident or will this impact the nation's willingness to unite to secure the homeland? Since the end of the Cold War (1991) the change of scale in international business exchange is unlike any other phase in history. Since the 1990s countries allowing or offering dual citizenship have also been increasing in number. This citizenship may cause confusion of allegiances to those that have more than one.					
15. SUBJECT TERMS Globalization, Sovereignty, Declaration of Independence, and The Constitution of the United States					
16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:			17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT	18. NUMBER OF PAGES	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON
a. REPORT (U)	b. ABSTRACT (U)	c. THIS PAGE (U)			19b. PHONE NUMBER (include area code)
			(U)	87	

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 8-98)
Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39.18

MASTER OF MILITARY ART AND SCIENCE

THESIS APPROVAL PAGE

Name of Candidate: Major Cory J. Petro

Thesis Title: Globalization vs. National Sovereignty

Approved by:

_____, Thesis Committee Chair
Heather Karambelas, M.A.

_____, Member
O. Shawn Cupp, Ph.D

_____, Member
Matthew Broaddus, M.A.

Accepted this 9th day of June 2017 by:

_____, Director, Graduate Degree Programs
Prisco R. Hernandez, Ph.D.

The opinions and conclusions expressed herein are those of the student author and do not necessarily represent the views of the U.S. Army Command and General Staff College or any other governmental agency. (References to this study should include the foregoing statement.)

ABSTRACT

GLOBALIZATION VS. NATIONAL SOVEREIGNTY? by Major Cory J. Petro, 87 pages.

Does the continuing increase in globalization particularly in the areas of economic, technological, travel, immigration, and multiple citizenships decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? This increase in globalization may cause unintended interdependencies. This thesis investigates the relationship between globalization, national sovereignty, and homeland security. If this increase continues without a balance will the government not be able to respond to an incident or will this impact the nation's willingness to unite to secure the homeland? Since the end of the Cold War (1991) the change of scale in international business exchange is unlike any other phase in history. Since the 1990s countries allowing or offering dual citizenship have also been increasing in number. This citizenship may cause confusion of allegiances to those that have more than one.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The experiences and lessons gained in life to this point are priceless, and I am extremely grateful for the love, discipline, guidance, challenges, and opportunities granted to me. My parents taught and enforced the value of work, commitment, humility, life, and spiritual growth. My brother and sister in law have also played an important role in my commitment and growth.

I would like to express my gratitude to my wife and children for allowing me to focus on these studies. My wife has taken on the family challenges and commitments to give me the time to complete this task. She has done an amazing job keeping the family and all that goes along with the day to day life moving forward.

My committee, instructors, and peers have provided an incredible amount of guidance, focus, and critical thoughts. This guidance and help kept me on track and moving forward. My committee has dedicated their personal time to me to help me produce this study, their guidance and commitment to my success is greatly appreciated. This level of commitment and professionalism by these great Americans is why we, as a nation, are able to endure such great challenges.

I am thankful for all the wonderful people in my life, the opportunities and experiences granted to me. I will continue to strive and give back in any way that I can for the effort of these people. I hope they have also benefitted from these experiences.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
MASTER OF MILITARY ART AND SCIENCE THESIS APPROVAL PAGE	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	vi
TABLES	viii
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
Purpose.....	2
Primary and Secondary Research Questions	3
Definitions	4
Assumptions.....	8
Scope.....	9
Limitations	9
Delimitations.....	10
Summary.....	11
CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW	14
Introduction.....	14
Literature Review Area 1	15
The Challenges Presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland	15
Literature Review Area 2.....	20
Organizations, Policies, and Processes in place to Secure and React to Incidents in the United States	20
Literature Review Area 3.....	22
The Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals	22
Results of Literature Review	24
Summary.....	27
CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY	30
Introduction.....	30
Criterion 1: How was the Original Sample Selected? What Grounds?	30
Criterion 2: What Major Themes Emerged?.....	30
Criterion 3: What were some Events, Incidents, and Actions that pointed to some of these Major Themes?.....	31

Criterion 4: On the basis of what Themes did Theoretical Sampling Proceed? Guide data collection? Was it Representative of the Themes?.....	32
Criterion 5: What were some of the Hypotheses pertaining to Conceptual Relations, and on what Grounds were they Formulated and Tested?.....	32
Criterion 6: Were there Instances where Hypotheses did not hold up against what was actually seen? How were these Discrepancies Accounted for? How did they affect the Hypotheses?	33
Criterion 7: How and why was the Core Themes Selected? On what grounds?	34
Focus Areas.....	35
The Challenges presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland.....	35
Organizations, Policies, and Processes in place to Secure and React to Incidents in the United States.....	36
The Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals	36
Conclusion	38
 CHAPTER 4 ANALYSIS	 39
Introduction.....	39
Focus Areas.....	40
Focus Area 1: The Challenges presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland	40
Focus Area 2: Organizations, Policies, and Processes, in place to React to Incidents in the United States	43
Focus Area 3: The Declaration of Independence and Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals	46
Conclusion	49
 CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS.....	 55
Introduction.....	55
Conclusions.....	57
Findings—Recommendations.....	58
Areas for Future Study.....	62
Summery.....	65
 APPENDIX A SIGNIFICANT WORDS	 68
 APPENDIX B SIGNIFICANT THEMES	 71
 BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	 77

TABLES

	Page
Table 1. Key Words Found in the Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States that Guide this Research.....	39
Table 2. Significant Words for Focus Area 1	68
Table 3. Significant Words for Focus Area 2	69
Table 4. Significant Words for Focus Area 3	70
Table 5. Significant Themes for Focus Area 1	71
Table 6. Significant Themes for Focus Area 2	73
Table 7. Significant Themes for Focus Area 3	75

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Since the early 1990s or the same time period the Cold War ended, the rate and scale of interaction between the people, companies, and government of the United States with different nations is unprecedented in our history.¹ This study investigates globalization particularly in the areas of economic, technological, travel, immigration, and multiple citizenships. This along with government policies that support free market economics and advancements in information technology have proliferated. In the midst of all these, one might ask how these interactions might impact homeland security in the United States. International interactions are not a new phenomenon; however, the pace and scale of current interaction is. This increased interaction challenges the nation-state paradigm and potentially the allegiance of individual citizens.² It appears now, more than ever, small and large businesses can interact around the world without leaving the country. Individuals and groups can communicate throughout the world even though separated by large geographic distances. This study investigates what affect this change in scale will have on homeland security. What are the opportunities and vulnerabilities; is there a balance that will continue economic prosperity for business owners as well as employees and not pose an increasing security threat to the United States?

This topic is significant to military professionals and other scholars because it affects our ability to carry out our duties and responsibilities to secure our nation. This thesis will attempt to fill the gap in scholarly literature by identifying what major policies, processes and social shifts could be jeopardizing our ability to secure the United

States. The problem statement for this thesis is how the United States government will insure the sovereignty of the nation is not challenged from our diplomatic, information, military, and economic ties with the rest of the world, and also strike the correct balance in scale and expansion of globalization to secure the homeland and retain unity of effort among all government agencies and the citizens of the United States. A gap in the literature exists in making the connection between existing research into the challenges facing homeland security with the principles stated in the Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States, and this thesis attempts to address that issue.

Purpose

The purpose of this study is to investigate implications to homeland security with increased interactions of economic, technological, travel, and migration by individuals in the process of globalization. This study's intention is to highlight areas of concern for military organizations, government organizations and non-government organizations to look at potential areas of concern and identify additional research. Organizations and individuals could conduct required planning to develop potential courses of action to help address the identified problems and effects, as necessary, or additional research suggests. This study could also identify some of the possible gaps in security and uncover potential solutions.

The results could advance scholarship in the field of military art and science by identifying specific areas in which globalization threatens our national security. Those results could help point to solutions before issues cause a negative effect on our ability to

secure the homeland. This study will analyze current literature and connect themes as they relate to globalization, security, and national sovereignty.

Primary and Secondary Research Questions

The primary research question: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? To make this analysis, I covered existing research and developing trends from the end of the Cold War to 2016. This study will cite the basic tenets of The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States and compare important issues arising in this time period, which is one of continued growth of globalization. The possible consequences of the global interactions potentially could affect our national sovereignty especially if we demonstrate that there are important challenges to our most basic principles of freedom enumerated in these fundamental documents of United States identity and culture.

Secondary research questions:

1. How should the United States react to globalization to better protect the homeland, and
2. As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

The secondary research question number one is used to investigate what can be done to provide a balance in economic and military expansion throughout the world and national sovereignty to secure the homeland. The secondary research question number two is investigated to understand where individuals place their allegiances beyond nationalism. The problem statement for this thesis is how the United States Government will insure the sovereignty of the nation is not challenged from our diplomatic, information, military,

and economic ties with the rest of the world, and also strike the correct balance in scale and expansion of globalization to secure the homeland and retain unity of effort among all government agencies and the citizens of the United States.

This thesis intends to provide additional research recommendations on how the United States Government and the citizens of the United States continue to be united to confront the challenges globalization presents to securing the homeland. We must also realize the opportunities created by globalization such as the reduction of poverty in developing nations without the continuing separation of wealth in the United States; as companies expand or open businesses in other nations, jobs and industry suffer in the United States.

Definitions

Below definitions of words and terms used in this thesis for clarification:

After Actions Review: Professional discussion of an event, focused on performance standards, that enables soldiers to discover for themselves what happened, why it happened, and how to sustain strengths and improve on weaknesses. An After Actions Review is a process that leaders can use to improve the organization.³

Capitalism: An economic system characterized by private or corporate ownership of capital goods, by investments that are determined by private decision, and by prices, production, and the distribution of goods that are determined mainly by competition in a free market.⁴

Citizenship: Security and belonging within a bounded political territory.⁵

Contested Norms: Increasingly powerful revisionist states and non-state actors will use any and all elements of power to establish their set of rules in ways unfavorable to the United States and its interests.⁶

Cyberspace: The online world of computer networks and the Internet.⁷

Defense Support of Civil Authorities: Is support provided by United States federal military forces, Department of Defense civilians, Department of Defense contract personnel, Department of Defense component assets, and National Guard forces in response to requests for assistance from civil authorities for domestic emergencies, law enforcement support, and other domestic activities, or from qualifying entities for special events.⁸

Department of Homeland Security: The Department of Homeland Security has a vital mission: to secure the nation from the many threats we face. This requires the dedication of more than 240,000 employees in jobs that range from aviation and border security to emergency response, from cyber security analyst to chemical facility inspector. Our duties are wide-ranging, and our goal is clear - keeping America safe.⁹

Diplomatic, Information, Military, and Economic: Instruments of national power. These are tools the United States uses to apply its sources of power, including its culture, industry, science and technology, academic institutions, geography, and national will.¹⁰

Federal Emergency Management Agency: The Federal Emergency Management Agency's mission is to support our citizens and first responders to ensure that as a nation we work together to build, sustain and improve our capability to prepare for, protect against, respond to, recover from and mitigate all hazards.¹¹

Free Market: An economic market or system in which prices are based on competition among private businesses and not controlled by a government.¹²

Global Commons: Resource domains or areas that lie outside of the political reach of any one nation state. International law identifies four global commons namely; the high seas; the atmosphere; Antarctica; and, outer space.¹³

Globalization: The process of growing international activity in many areas that is creating ever-closer ties, enhanced interdependence, and greater opportunity and vulnerabilities for all.¹⁴

Homeland: The United States homeland is the physical region that includes the continental United States, Alaska, Hawaii, United States territories, and surrounding territorial waters and airspace.¹⁵

Homeland Defense: Homeland Defense is the protection of United States sovereignty, territory, domestic population, and critical infrastructure against external threats and aggression, or other threats as directed by the President.¹⁶

Homeland Security: A concerted national effort to ensure a homeland that is safe, secure, and resilient against terrorism and other hazards where American interests, aspirations, and ways of life can thrive.¹⁷

Meliorism: The belief that the world tends to become better and that humans can aid its betterment.¹⁸

National Sovereignty: The idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, have a right to exist without other nations interfering. It is the unspoken rule of a nation's right to exist.¹⁹

National Will: “We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal, that they are endowed by their creator with certain unalienable rights that among these are Life, Liberty and the pursuit of happiness. That to secure these rights, Governments are instituted among Men, deriving their just powers from the consent of the governed, that whenever any form of government becomes destructive of those ends, it is the Right of the People to alter or to abolish it, and to institute a new Government, laying its foundation on such principles and organizing powers in such form, as to them shall seem most likely to affect their Safety and Happiness.”²⁰

Nationalist: An advocate of or believer in nationalism.²¹

Nationalism: Love of country plus a negative evaluation of other countries, national identity.²²

Patriotism: Set of attitudes and beliefs that refers to individuals’ attachment and loyalty to their nation and country-to the ‘homeland,’ the conjunction between country and nation-the loyalty to one’s people and its land.²³

Persistent Disorder: An array of weak states that become increasingly incapable of maintaining domestic order or good governance.²⁴

Political Discord: Lack of agreement between people, ideas.²⁵

Political System: The system that governs, the checks and balances of our government as the United States.²⁶

United States Northern Command: Is the command responsible for the defense of the homeland.²⁷

Unity of Effort: Uniting in effort and resources to accomplish a defined or set of defined end states.²⁸

Assumptions

There are a few assumptions believed to be true and necessary for completion of this study. The first assumption is that globalization creates challenges among analysts and law enforcement officers in assessing potential threats from people living, visiting, and working in the United States. The current ability of people to maintain dual or multiple citizenships challenges traditional methods of determining allegiance, since a dedication to nation cannot be presumed in these situations. The ability to maintain citizenship in multiple countries confuses the historic nation-state paradigm.²⁹ Next, an exponential growth in investments, business decisions, advancement in information technology, and government policies that support free-market economics caused a dramatic increase in the scale of international trade, since the end of the Cold War.³⁰ The advancement and availability of information technologies created a fast and easy way of transportation and access to global communications.³¹ Technology has made it possible to interact and embed in more than one society known as transnationalism.³² Vertovec (2004) defines transnationalism as a set of “sustained long-distance, border-crossing connections.” Vertovec (2004) also conducted analysis of the flow of migrants and how they embed in more than one society, this raises the question of allegiance among these people. In the context of globalization dual citizenship allows migrants to maintain citizenship in two countries. This allows migrants to simultaneously have commitments to two nation-states by being embedded in more than one society.³³ Being citizens of

multiple nations creates obligations and ties to those nations, this raises the question of where does individual allegiance belong?

Scope

The primary method of collecting research for the development of this thesis is through my analysis of narratives discussing similar or supporting topics. The data analyzed in this study can be found in military, education, and professional organizations collection of studies. This research focuses on understanding what has been written and the outcomes of research conducted. This research will focus on identifying gaps in current research, the implications of the research question and what research or planning requires further investigation for the United States to secure the homeland.

Limitations

There are several important inherent limitations in the study framework that the researcher cannot control or influence. These limitations may be reflective in the level of detail provided in this thesis. The qualitative research conducted for this study is not being conducted in a natural setting, which is collecting data in the field.³⁴ This research will be conducted in conjunction with the United States Army Command and General Staff College studies and will be limited on time, the window of the study is seven months in duration.

This study will not assess the current political environment in the United States and other nations of the world. It cannot be determined how contemporary political events in the United States will change globalization and emigration trends. President Trump's new administration is likely to issue new strategic directions, but this study will

not attempt to predict any decisions which might alter guidance for future impacts of global issues.

Delimitations

Delimitations are choices made by the researcher to put restrictions on time, or limit scope to focus on a specific problem or area of study. The research analyzed for this thesis is limited in history from the end of the Cold War to 2016. During this period of time research indicates the greatest increase in participation in globalization from the United States and its citizens. The analysis of research through this period of time could show impacts to national security and identify future concerns. This study focuses the literature review using key words and themes embedded in the Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. These key words and themes are used to assess what is written regarding globalization and the impacts on national sovereignty, allegiance, patriotism, crime, and related topic and their relation to homeland security challenges. The study will examine the potential positive and negative implications caused by individual interaction in the globalization process. The study is focusing on what effect this participation will cause on homeland security. The analysis from this research should also set the stage for more detailed conversation on possible ways to slow down the negative effects of globalization as they apply to national sovereignty and allegiance to the United States. This study will not assess implications outside of the effects on homeland security. This study will not involve interviews and be strictly conducted using narrative research.

Summary

Due to the increasing amount of trade in and out of the United States, the number of United States businesses operating in other countries, trade agreements and opportunities for established businesses and entrepreneurs has spread citizens throughout the world. Some individuals live in other countries, some travel frequently, and others conduct primarily actions through the internet. This frequent travel and creation of interests outside the United States may cause some of these individuals to question allegiance to their own native countries or to their hosts' country.³⁵ These examinations may uncover trends and gaps in the current environment within the United States. Examined in this thesis is the primary research question: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? Secondary research questions include: How should the United States react to the issues associated with globalization to better protect the homeland? As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go? I intend to study this phenomenon by reviewing literature discussing each area as well if any exists on multiple aspects of globalization. I intend to analyze research dealing with economic globalization, the impacts of technology developments, the flow of people between countries, citizenship, migrant people, and current national strategy documents of the United States. I intend to nest the literature with basic principle in The Declaration of Independence and laws as written in The Constitution of the United States.

Chapter 2 will highlight what others have written about this topic, and will provide a framework to establish a perspective on the thesis research questions and the approach to research. The literature review will demonstrate to the readers a broad grasp

of knowledge to this field of investigation. The literature review will also begin to uncover common themes as related to globalization and securing the homeland.

¹ Katherine L. Herbig, “Allegiance in a Time of Globalization” (Technical Report, Defense Personnel Security Research Center, Monterey, CA, 2008), vii.

² *Ibid.*, Highlights.

³ Department of the Army, Training Circular (TC) 25-20, *A Leader’s Guide to After-Action Reviews* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1993), 1.

⁴ Merriam Webster, s.v. “Capitalism,” accessed 5 November 2016, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/capitalism>.

⁵ Herbig, “Allegiance,” 25.

⁶ Joint Chiefs of Staff, *Joint Operating Environment 2035 (Joe 2035): The Joint Force in a Contested and Disordered World* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2016), 4.

⁷ Merriam Webster, s.v. “Cyberspace,” accessed 5 November 2016, <https://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/cyberspace>.

⁸ Joint Chiefs of Staff, Joint Publication (JP) 3-27, *Homeland Defense* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2013).

⁹ Department of Homeland Security, “Mission,” accessed 5 November 2016, <https://www.dhs.gov>.

¹⁰ Joint Chiefs of Staff, Joint Publication (JP) 3-0, *Joint Operations* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2011).

¹¹ Federal Emergency Management Agency, “Mission,” accessed 5 November 2016, <https://www.fema.gov>.

¹² Investopedia, “Freemarket,” accessed 5 November 2016, <http://www.investopedia.com/terms/f/freemarket.asp>.

¹³ United Nations Environment Program, “Global Commons,” accessed 5 November 2016, <https://UNEP.org>.

¹⁴ Stephen J. Flanagan, Ellen L. Frost, and Richard L. Kugler, *Challenges of the Global Century* (Washington, DC: Institute for National Strategic Studies, 2001), 7.

¹⁵ Joint Chiefs of Staff, Joint Publication (JP) 3-27, *Homeland Defense* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2013).

¹⁶ *Ibid.*

¹⁷ Department of Homeland Security, *Quadrennial Homeland Security Review* (Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2010).

¹⁸ Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary, "Meliorism," Deluxe Ed., 1998, 1140.

¹⁹ *Declaration of Independence*, 1776.

²⁰ *Ibid.*

²¹ Merriam-Webster's Collegiate Dictionary.

²² Herbig, "Allegiance," 39, 41.

²³ *Ibid.*, 4.

²⁴ Joint Chiefs of Staff, *Joe 2035*, 4.

²⁵ Merriam Webster, s.v. "Political Discord," accessed 5 November 2016, <http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/discord>.

²⁶ *The Constitution of The United States*.

²⁷ U.S. Northcom, "About us," accessed 5 November 2016, <https://www.northcom.mil/>.

²⁸ Joint Chiefs of Staff, JP 3-0, I-4.

²⁹ Herbig, "Allegiance," Highlights.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, vii.

³¹ *Ibid.*

³² *Ibid.*, 8.

³³ *Ibid.*

³⁴ John W. Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*, 3rd ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2007), 37.

³⁵ Herbig, "Allegiance," 2.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

The problem statement for this thesis is how the United States Government will insure the sovereignty of the nation is not challenged from our diplomatic, information, military, and economic ties with the rest of the world, and also strike the correct balance in scale and expansion of globalization to secure the homeland and retain unity of effort among all government agencies and the citizens of the United States. The primary research question of this thesis is: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? If research indicates that globalization is or can affect national sovereignty the secondary research questions may provide some recommendations for future research to uncover some solutions to the problem. The secondary research questions are:

1. How should the United States react to globalization to better protect the homeland?
2. As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

The review of literature for this thesis is conducted into three areas organized in themes:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes currently in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The Constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

The Constitution of the United States and The Declaration of Independence are used to provide key words and definitions as they apply to sovereignty, security, and allegiance. These key words and definitions from the Constitution are applied to literature to develop supporting or contradicting results.

These supporting or contradicting results are then focused into key themes intended to answer the research questions. This study will investigate these areas and assess historical facts and trends causing a potential challenge or gap in the ability to secure the homeland. This study will also identify trends and conditions that may shape the future security environment.

This study mentions that globalization also has some opportunities and it is necessary to find a balance where these opportunities may help with national security. One of the most significant of these opportunities is the reduction in world poverty even though it has created a separation within the United States. The United Nation's Millennium Development Goals were set during the period of this study and is aimed to reduce the world's extreme poverty by at least 50 percent through 2030. In 1990 43 percent of the population in developing countries was considered in extreme poverty defined by those making \$1.00 dollar a day or less, by 2010 this number is estimated to be at 21 percent.¹

Literature Review Area 1

The Challenges Presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland

There are positive outcomes from globalization such as the spread and amount of wealth around the world, technological innovation, creation of new markets, and the

encouragement for cooperation.² All of these improvements are great but each of these opportunities looked at separately does not help us understand at what cost to homeland security. The connections between the citizens and the government of the United States around the world and how it affects the security environment within the United States could be better understood.

Some of these questions are difficult to talk about because we want to do good things and improve the quality of life for all, but studies and trending should be conducted so we can manage the impacts on our security. For example “Globalization does not stop wars, prevent aggression, end arms races, erase centuries of hatred, or eradicate power politics.”³ If war and other violent activities continue to exist around the world some research is necessary to understand why the push for globalization is still necessary at the current rate. Understanding the connections to security would be helpful to counter the security risks especially if this rate of increase in globalization is causing security risks in the homeland. All the liabilities of globalization must be understood, policies that keep it in check must be understood, instituted, and practiced.⁴ Strategic documents outline the need to enforce our laws and protect our interests around the world. After the Cold War era, the process of growing international activity is known as globalization, it has created many opportunities as well as vulnerabilities.⁵ The current research investigates areas of opportunities and vulnerabilities but does not look at the holistic affect, for example reduction in the poverty rate, which has a monetary cost of 18.3 billion per year, but what are the other costs, what is the risk, these questions should be answered to understand the globalization activities holistic impacts.

Literature exists in Japan studying globalization in the two largest economies, the United States and Japan with a focus on the effects of the global transformation.⁶ This literature concurs with the studies read from institutions in the United States in that the acceleration of globalization entered a new historical age in the years after the Cold War. There is also agreement from the Japanese study that this acceleration is undermining the sovereignty of nation states.

The United States and Japan lead the world in post-war globalization and both nations benefited from this and also absorbed the effects.⁷ The benefits are mostly economic, the interesting finding is that analyzing perceived threats like materialistic, ethno culture, existential, and global, is that global threats are perceived as the greatest threat.

The level of perceived danger by individuals to their security and identity drive the level of nationalistic support.⁸ As indicated the greatest threat perceived is the global threat, this is both from people and environmental as well for example global warming. Understanding that individual's value security above materialistic pleasures will help us understand or determine a level of risk the American people feel comfortable with. Risks and dangers exist in both the United States and Japan, each country has similar concerns and some unique concerns, the level of understanding by individuals will drive the level of concern.⁹ Dr. Emmanouil Tsatsanis a social science professor in Japan questions the future of the nation state and believes the strength or future of the nation state will be determined by the level of understanding of the risks and dangers defined by the changing globalizing societies.¹⁰ Additional research regarding if the view of nationalism

is changing to be more favorable could be helpful to understand if the industrial world's view of globalization is changing. Current research suggests that the view of nationalism should be considered as dominant not extremism.

The developments of globalization set the condition to achieve economic prosperity, political freedom, and peace.¹¹ Many developments since the end of the Cold War are helping this process. The spread of knowledge, dispersion of advanced technologies, and the movement of people all contribute to economic growth and prosperity. These developments are not only producing opportunities they are creating challenges. These developments create powerful forces that cause social fragmentation, critical vulnerabilities, violence, and conflict.¹² Some of these powerful forces are the proliferation of Weapons of Mass Destruction, cyber-attacks, spread of diseases, effects on the environment, creation of mega-cities, and food shortages.

All of these factors create potential security implications and create interdependences in many or all aspects of our lives.¹³ The September 11, 2001 attacks brought to light these dangers with the use of technology, movement of people, and use of financial networks to provide resources to allow preparations and training for the execution of attacks.¹⁴ Understanding how people are able to use technology to act globally, will help security professionals to better grasp international trends and make policy decisions to increase financial security and also put in place restrictions, or plans to secure the mobility of people.

The 2003 RAND Issue Paper Global Security Implications analyzes the threats and opportunities of globalization and how economic policy-making communities each

have a stake in the solution and must work together.¹⁵ The point of this paper is to suggest a new way of security in the coming years, that economic growth and prosperity should not be separated from security policies and implementations. The issue paper suggests that the international community is aware of the threats and opportunities of globalization but not in agreement on how seriously to take these threats.¹⁶ More research is required to understand what are the vulnerabilities created from these opportunities or advancements and how will we counter these vulnerabilities. As research suggests nation states are already starting to slow down or put restrictions in place to help offset the negative effects of globalization, some are even breaking ties or unions with other nations to retain the ability to control the environment.

According to multiple sources of literature, globalization challenges the nation state paradigm, because it can fundamentally alter how national allegiances are formed and maintained. And this despite the fact that the nation-state paradigm has existed for hundreds of years.¹⁷ In particular, a Northrop Grumman study investigating how to determine or assess a population's allegiance during increasing activity globally. What are the related issues of foreign influence, recognizing these issues, addressing the effect of these issues and what are foreign preferences? The Northrop Grumman study concludes that there is concern within the personnel security community and counterintelligence agencies. This study concludes that it is difficult to assess allegiance in the context of globalization. Some scholars suggest that because globalization is challenging the traditional nation-state thoughts of allegiance, to respond to this we may be required to imagine a new paradigm.¹⁸ This thought is supported by the increased

migration and travel throughout the world and the increasing in terrorism around the world. The phenomena of homegrown terrorists or citizens radicalized by outside influence are a challenge to traditional views of allegiance. More research is necessary on citizenship, allegiance, and nationalism to better understand the risks of individual globalism diminishing the commitment to one nation.

The methods of determining allegiance of a person born and raised in one nation-state and residing in that state may need to be relooked. In the global environment, many states allow dual citizenship; families live in multiple countries separated from each other for work reasons.¹⁹ These situations of family separated from each other in multiple nation-states dilute the meaning of citizenship and confuses the current paradigm of allegiance. More research is necessary to understand or to continue to investigate how to assess allegiance based on the current environment. What are some additional measurements or variables that could be added into security questions or conversation in general to understand a person's intentions?

Literature Review Area 2

Organizations, Policies, and Processes in place to Secure and React to Incidents in the United States

What are the necessary restructures of agencies in support of securing the United States? Colonel Brummond United States Air Force, focused his research at the United States Army War College on the wake of the September 11th terrorist attacks and subsequent events that have revealed deficiencies of government functioning. Since this study in 2003, there have been several iterations of strategic document, different presidents, as well as agency and department heads change out. All of these strategic

documents whether they focus on homeland security or homeland defense wrestle with solutions through the ends, ways, and means methodology. Additional research is necessary to understand how well the organizational structure and creation of the Department of Homeland Security are coordinating efforts against the threats to the United States both internal and external. Some guidance from strategic documents states the need for economic growth around the world and strengthening partnerships and agreements with our allies. This growth spreads technological advancements that are not always used for the greater good of all, as well as the spread of people.

A common theme through literature and strategic documents like the National Strategy for Homeland Security is that homeland security must be a shared responsibility across our entire nation. Homeland security is not limited to attacks by terrorist it also includes reaction to natural disasters. This study does not discuss this aspect of national security in any detail but it is important to consider; as this is also of critical importance in strategic documents and for the security of the nation. Homeland security is defined by national strategy; as “Homeland Security is a concerted effort to prevent terrorist attacks within the United States, reduce America’s vulnerability to terrorism, and minimize the damage and recover from attacks that do occur.” This definition acknowledges that we must prevent if at all possible, but also that attacks will occur or natural disasters and we must be prepared to react. Americans have a history of uniting to help those in need either from war, aggression, or natural disasters. This compassion by Americans makes us vulnerable to those that wish to do us harm. Transnational terrorist organizations have taken advantage of globalization and technological developments and the vulnerability of

the United States society to inflict casualties anywhere in the world.²⁰ Protecting the homeland against the enemy operating within the borders of the United States will take unified action between government and civilians.²¹

The creation of the additional government departments is a top down approach to security, protection from the bottom up may be a more useful focus.²² After the attacks on the United States Homeland on September 11, 2001 the Department of Homeland Security stood up. This is an example of a top down approach. A bottom up approach starts with every citizen and government organizations at the lowest level. This bottom up approach, even though there is talk of it and systems in place has not grabbed as much momentum as anticipated. The average person on the street and the security guards are the people that will keep the homeland safe not the big government.²³

Literature Review Area 3

The Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals

Learning the tenets of good citizenship, critical thinking and the ability to self-govern provides the foundations for a collective national identity and enhances the potential for adequate homeland security.²⁴ Good citizenship is very broad, for the purposes of this study we will keep this term focused on national security. There is guidance scattered throughout The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. Let us consider a few of the principles. In the opening paragraph of the Declaration of Independence “a decent respect to the opinions of mankind requires that they should declare the causes which impel them to the separation” enshrined in this is that all men are created equal and that the majority should not impose their will or

opinions on the minority. This concept is helpful to understand even today as we look at our political divide and how different masses want to impose their will on the other. Just as the Declaration of Independence started with this idea that others should not impose their will with the intentions of control it ends with “mutually pledge to each other our Lives, our Fortunes and our sacred Honor” this is of such importance that men and woman would give up everything for these decencies. The Constitution of the United States is organized and the law of the land to insure that these decencies are not violated by restricting the evil nature of man. Research exists that investigates citizenry and the importance of it as related to homeland security.

Terrorist organizations use a variety of tools and tactics to recruit, and much of their focus is on young people. Better civic education may help combat these recruiting efforts.²⁵ Further studies could be helpful in establishing an importance of this education into strategic documents. The National Assessment of Education Progress reported in 2010 that the offering of education in civics as a class is declining in the United States.²⁶ It would be helpful to understand why this decline exists in the United States. Is there merit as some studies suggest because families may be separated due to the effects of globalization, work in different countries for years of their lives, conduct social networking and business through cyberspace. Civic education received while a child will bind them to an allegiance with the United States.²⁷ Understanding the level or depth of education could be helpful. Current statistics show a very low percentage of the youth in the United States understand civics, data in the low to mid 20 percent are proficient in

civics.²⁸ “If we forget what we did, we won’t know who we are” President Ronald Reagan.²⁹

Results of Literature Review

During my review of research trends several principle themes emerge. These principle themes, words and statements are nested within The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. These themes are the national allegiance of individuals, the possible fragility of the nation-state paradigm, and national sovereignty as an important concept related to both of these issues. This literature review has exposed gaps in what is known about globalization and the potential vulnerabilities to national sovereignty. The objectives of this study are to identify what existing research has been presented, what are the common themes and recommendations, what are the gaps, and what are potential future requirements of research.

Some of the focused research deals with allegiance, nationalism, restructuring, and civic education and the effects of homeland security. The most critical phases of history to provide context for this study are The Treaty of Westphalia signed in 1648, The American Revolution in 1776, the French Revolution in 1787, Mexican independence in 1821, end of the Cold War in 1991, and the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001. These phases of history are selected because they have significant impact on societies, areas and collectiveness of the world.

The Treaty of Westphalia brought the end of the 80 years’ war between Spain, the Dutch, and the German phase of the 30 years’ war. The reason for the 30 years’ war was more religious or ideological in nature. This is worth consideration as part of the concept

of the nation state and national sovereignty and as a building block of interconnectivity of the world today. This treaty made it possible to have freedom of religion or agree in the differences in worship within sovereign borders. This period is prior to the creation of the nation state; this is widely referred to as the sovereignty of the state. A state does not give the rights to the people or the recognition of a citizen like the nation state does.

The American Revolution expanded on concepts that all people should have rights and that governments should have limited control and this formed a new government in the world. This new government recognized people deserved rights and that all men are created equal. This new government spread fear throughout the monarchies of Europe. This thought of individualism and citizenry allowed Napoleon to unite the masses for the French Revolution. This period also started the notion of patriotism and obligations of the citizens to unite for a common good.

The French Revolution capitalized on this birth of patriotism and citizenship to build large armies comprised of all classes of citizens. During this period in Europe populations doubled, and the peasants were becoming more aware of their situation. This awareness led to challenges to the status quo of the government system. The peasants at this time were starting to own land as well as becoming educated, the taste of a better life of freedoms.

Mexico, a territory of Spain declared independence during Napoleon's occupation of Spain. This called for the end of Spanish rule in Mexico. This allowed the redistribution of land to the peasants across Mexico. Again, this notion of citizenry and individual freedoms continued to spread and form a constitutional monarchy in Mexico.

The end of the Cold War was the start of large-scale free market trade giving birth to our current age of globalization. The improvements in transportation, communications, and other technologies fueled by the desire to grow the worlds' economy enabled the scale and speed of interconnectivity.³⁰ Economic wealth is spread to a small number of individuals, even though poverty has dropped in developing nations. Technologies are also spreading throughout the world due to this age of globalization. These advancements and interconnectivity also allows those wishing to do harm around the world to fund and conduct operations as well as create great separations in income and separating classes of people again to an extreme.

On September 11th 2001, the world witnessed Al Qaeda terrorists take advantage of the opportunities of globalization to conduct an attack on the United States. Osama Bin Ladin seized opportunities to appeal to people dealing with the challenges of modernity and globalization to recruit individuals for his cause.³¹ He used globalization against the past and greatness of Islam. Al Qaeda operatives conducted training within the United States on an expired visa and learned how to fly large aircraft being funded from Al Qaeda. Today, The Islamic State of Iraq and Syria recruits and funds operations around the world benefiting from globalization.

The central objectives of this study are to identify what existing research has been presented, what are the common themes and recommendations, what are the gaps, and what are potential future requirements of research. This framework should allow expert planners and executers responsible in developing homeland security strategies and the execution of obligations to continuously improve the security posture of the United

States. The conclusion of this study could help those charged with securing the United States homeland potential thoughts on improvement especially identify cultural or educational changes that may be necessary.

Summary

This chapter examines research in areas of the effects of globalization. Research highlights areas of concern that may affect our national sovereignty and the allegiance of individual citizens to the United States as well as challenge the nation-state paradigm. This research is examining literature to answer the primary and secondary research questions. Common themes are present throughout the literature, some of these themes are opportunities, vulnerabilities, allegiance, globalization, security challenges and understanding. The problem that this study intends to address or provide additional research recommendations to answer is how the United States Government and the citizens of the United States continue to be united to confront the challenges globalization presents to securing the homeland? The focus area identified while conducting this study are, what are the challenges of globalization to national security, what currently exists to secure or react, and what does the Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States say about these challenges and the reaction to these challenges. The research questions are chosen to answer if enough evidence is present to say that globalization will affect our sovereignty.

Chapter 3 explains how the research questions will be answered in three areas of focus. These focus areas are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

Chapter 3 will identify the means and criteria I will use to collect, analyze and interpret the evidence.

¹ The Economist, “Poverty: Not Always with Us,” June 2013, accessed 5 November 2016, <http://economist.com/news/briefing/21578643-world-has-astonishing-chance-take-billion-people-out-extreme-poverty-2030-not>.

² Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler, *Challenges*, Executive Summary.

³ Ibid.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid., 7.

⁶ Emmanouil Tsatsanis, “Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Japan and the United States” (Working Paper, Sophia University Institute of Comparative Culture, Tokyo, Japan, 2009), 1.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid., 24.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Lynn E. Davis, “Globalizations Security Implications” (Issue Paper, RAND Corporation, 2003), 1.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Ibid.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Ibid., 7.

¹⁷ Herbig, “Allegiance,” 38.

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ Ibid., Background.

²⁰ COL Stephen Brummond, “Restructuring for Homeland Security-What is Really Necessary?” (Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2003), 5.

²¹ Ibid., 7.

²² Ibid., 2.

²³ Ibid., 22.

²⁴ Brian P. Ravert, “Protecting America Through Better Civic Education” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2013), 1.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Ibid., 3.

²⁷ Ibid., 16.

²⁸ Ibid., 8.

²⁹ Ibid. 16.

³⁰ Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler, *Challenges*, 7.

³¹ Commission Members, *The 911 Commission Report*, accessed 2 May 2017, <https://govinfo.library.unt.edu/911/report/911report.pdf>, 48.

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

Introduction

Qualitative methodology narrative design using document review will be used to analyze data for this thesis.¹ Narrative writings produce themes that can be extracted to help guide findings and conclusions. The researcher prepared and organized the data gathered and reduced into themes. The data from themes was coded and placed into tables for discussion.² The researcher uses seven criteria to ground the research data, Creswell's Second Edition *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design* outlines these seven criteria.

Criterion 1: How was the Original Sample Selected? What Grounds?

Samples in this study are selected based on sources, for example other military institutions, universities, and respected organizations like RAND and Northrop Grumman. Then what writings from these institutions and organizations study the different effects from globalization. The research analyzed is grounded in themes present in The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States as related to sovereignty and security. See Appendix 1 for selected sample.

Criterion 2: What Major Themes Emerged?

Key words extracted from The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States dealing with sovereignty and security are used to focus research.

These key words are used to extract key themes from research data. The three major themes emerged are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

See Appendix 2 for a list of major themes.

Criterion 3: What were some Events, Incidents, and Actions that pointed to some of these Major Themes?

Some of the events, incidents, and actions that emerged are the difficulty in determining allegiance, the relationship between citizenship and terrorism, globalizations security implications, challenges of the global century, defining homeland security; homeland security is every-one's responsibility, restructuring for homeland security, and education. These themes address challenges in determining allegiance, identifying the challenges presented by globalization, education on globalization and civics, and the current government structure as it relates to homeland security. Other major themes that have positive implications are reduction in world poverty and quality of life improvements in developing countries. These positive improvements have contributed to attacks around the world brought to the public eye on September 11, 2001 when terrorists conducted an attack on the United States.

Criterion 4: On the basis of what Themes did Theoretical Sampling Proceed?
Guide data collection? Was it Representative of the Themes?

Theoretical sampling initiated on themes from The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. These themes are allegiance, immigration, citizenship, border, terrorism, crime, homeland, globalization, security, sovereignty nationalism, and patriotism. These themes are the basis of the theoretical sampling as they apply directly to the problem statement and research questions.

These themes guide data collection and research to identify what theories exist when applied to these themes and the research questions.

Criterion 5: What were some of the Hypotheses pertaining to
Conceptual Relations, and on what Grounds
were they Formulated and Tested?

Allegiance is difficult to assess in the current age of globalization, the concept of the nation state is being challenged. This hypotheses is formulated on the grounds of mass migrations of people, multiple citizenships that question allegiance with continued ties to place of origin. This hypotheses also tests business relationships' and other economic dependencies. Migration numbers are at a level never seen in the history of the United States, the process of naturalization and assimilation and how well we currently facilitate this process affects allegiance. Research exists indicating that in some cases citizenship determines when an individual may conduct a terroristic attack versus an illegal alien. This theory is formulated and tested based on statistics and the conclusion that citizens have rights and are guided by a legal process. Globalization creates environments and opportunities for terrorist organizations to operate globally more easily, being undetected, and funded due to transportation, information, and financial

technological improvements. Statistical data is used to formulate and test this theory. Sovereignty is challenged as the world becomes more interconnected and dependent on other nation states. This is grounded in the definition of the key words, themes and historical examples used in this study.

Criterion 6: Were there Instances where Hypotheses did not hold up against what was actually seen? How were these Discrepancies Accounted for? How did they affect the Hypotheses?

Literature being surveyed for this study is from books, military institutions, other educational institutions, and professional research organizations. A breakdown of sources includes two books, twenty-four thesis works, four military doctrinal reviews, and three different strategic documents from the United States Government. This thesis uses a continuum from 1 to 10 for instances where the hypotheses may not be the most convincing, least convincing is 1 and most convincing or grounded in the constitution is 10. The strategic documents and Joint Military Doctrine are nested within the constitution and will be used as guiding principles for selected hypotheses, and if they hold up against what is actually seen or part of strategy or doctrine. These documents are at the right of the continuum or a 10. The two books surveyed are Kaplan, Robert D. 2000, *The Coming Anarchy*, First Vintage Books Edition, February 2001 and Harvey, Robert, *Global Disorder*, Carroll and Graf Publishers. These two books are not used to form new hypotheses, but rather as sources to understand how the research theses tie together and what is written outside education institutions and professional think tanks. I would rank these two books at a 7. Most of the literature from education institutions and professional think tanks are between 6 and 8 on the continuum and added grounded value to this

study. One article that stands out as not being a convincing hypotheses is that citizens are more likely to commit a terror attack in the United States than illegal aliens. The statistical data presented does not seem complete or there to be enough data to prove the hypotheses.

This data is not used to prove or disprove the question of this study but as information requiring more studies and monitoring. I rank this hypotheses at the left of the continuum or a 3.

Criterion 7: How and why was the Core Themes Selected?
On what grounds?

These core themes were selected using The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. The Declaration of Independence establishes the reasons why we, as a nation, dissolved political bands with the crown. Men and women were willing to give up everything including their lives, to be free of the bonds of tyranny for a safer, more prosperous life. The constitution outlines laws for the government and the military to keep political and military powers in check to preserve these rights. These documents also outline the right to be a free and sovereign state. Our strategic documents, though not authoritative, are nested in constitutional principles. The strategic documents used for purposes of this study are the Quadrennial Homeland Security Review, National Homeland Security Review, and the National Security Strategy.

This thesis investigates possible vulnerabilities created by globalization. This research could be of significant importance to the security of the homeland. This thesis investigates challenges globalization presents to national sovereignty, the impacts on nation-state paradigm and how this may affect homeland security. Much of the research

in this topic focus on specific areas such as how do we assess allegiance, the challenges to the nation-state, restructuring government agencies, civic education, and several other potential trends. This study is necessary to start to tie these common themes together and understand how globalization reduces sovereignty and creates security challenges.

The primary research question asks if the continuing increase in globalization decreases our national sovereignty and our ability to secure our homeland. Secondary research questions are how should the United States react to globalization to secure the homeland and as national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

Focus Areas

Research for this thesis is broken into three areas. The focus areas are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

Research in these focused areas could link the common themes together to determine a gap in literature and the requirements of additional research. This study could identify some potential alternative ways to plan and execute homeland security operations and potential organizational change to secure the homeland?

The Challenges presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland

Research and understanding the challenges presented by globalization will help with assessing risk to homeland security. Risk is defined in Joint Publication 3-0 by what

is the likely chance of failure or unacceptable results in performing the sequence of actions. This is one of the steps in answering the research question. If it is possible to link risk, vulnerabilities, and opportunities together, this may identify if that gap in research is finding the balance between too much and too little involvement in the globalization movement. Challenges are presented in research regarding allegiance, national sovereignty, challenges to the nation-state paradigm, and the separation of wealth.

Organizations, Policies, and Processes in place to Secure and React to Incidents in the United States

Understanding what the current organizational structure, policies, and processes that are in place to secure the homeland or respond to an incident are critical.

This is key to answering the research question to determine how globalization will affect these organizations if national sovereignty is being dissolved and allegiance is questionable. The United States witnessed major changes in homeland security and defense organizations after the terrorist attacks of September 11th. Many of the positions of management as well as responders require a security clearance, the question of allegiance is disputed regarding granting of these security clearances. Understanding these challenges and the implications of globalization will help to answer the research question.

The Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals

Understanding what binds us together as Americans is the third focus point of this investigation. Understanding what will preserve national sovereignty and preserve the nation state will help tie the identified security challenges together and answer the

research question. In 2010 the Department of Homeland Security published the Quadrennial Security Review, which defines homeland security as a concerted effort to ensure a homeland that is safe, secure, and resilient against terrorism and other hazards where American interests, aspirations, and ways of life can thrive. Understanding the feelings of allegiance to the United States and how globalization effects allegiance will help understand commitment to a safe, secure, and resilient America.

For the purposes of this investigation the United States Constitution will be used as the uniting document to establish why national sovereignty is important to the United States. National sovereignty is defined as the idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, and have the right to exist without other nations interfering.

Appendix A Significant Words, tables 2 through 4 are nested with words and definitions of those words from The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States. Key words from The Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States are allegiance, immigration, border, citizenship, nationalism, homeland, security, sovereignty, patriotism, globalization, crime, and terrorism. These words are used to analyze current literature to determine what is being studied regarding these words as they apply to globalization, security and national sovereignty.

Appendix B Significant Themes, tables 5 through 7 are a compilation of themes extracted from literature using the key words established in Appendix A. These themes

are the basis in which the literature is being reviewed for this study. The key themes are broken down per each focus area.

Conclusion

This chapter outlines three primary focus areas for research, several narratives in these focus group are examined. Themes from these narratives will be used in chapter 4 for analysis and data presentation. This data will be key in answering the research questions for this thesis. The focus areas are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

The criteria used for determining suitability and validity of the narratives for this study are, military institutions such as the United States Army War College, Naval Post Graduate School, Institute for National Strategic Studies, Northrop Grumman Technical Services, and others of similar reputation.

Chapter 4 will examine these narratives in detail and interpret the evidence. Chapter 4 will also discuss the research evidence and how it relates to the research questions. Chapter 4 will also prepare the read for chapter 5 the conclusions and recommendations part of this thesis.

¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 78-80, 110-113, 120, 170, 178, 216, 237.

² *Ibid.*, 148.

CHAPTER 4

ANALYSIS

Introduction

This thesis analyzes how globalization affects our national sovereignty and how this may degrade our ability to secure the homeland. National Sovereignty is defined as the idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, have a right to exist without other nations interfering. The thesis uses the Declaration of Independence and the United States Constitution as the uniting documents that unite us as Americans together to insure our future and prosperity.

Table 1. Key Words Found in the Declaration of Independence and The Constitution of the United States that Guide this Research

Allegiance	Immigration	Border	Citizenship
Nationalism	Homeland	Security	Sovereignty
Patriotism	Globalization	Crime	Terrorism

Source: Created by author.

This thesis also investigates current national strategy and how it accounts for the effects of globalization, as well as where does allegiance belong as national sovereignty is dissolved. According to the 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review and the research documents investigated during this study globalization has expanded dramatically since the end of The Cold War to 2016. The primary research question of

this thesis is: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? Secondary research questions are:

1. How should the United States react to globalization to secure the homeland?
2. As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

Focus Areas

Focus Area 1: The Challenges presented by Globalization to Securing the Homeland

Globalization challenges the paradigm of the nation state, which the treaty of Westphalia has characterized as the highest degree of aspirations to self-determinations of the world's peoples.¹ As the world becomes more interconnected and people move from country to country for business, survival or other reasons, loyalty to any one nation is dissolved. As loyalties are challenged or more increasingly belong to the person's country of origin, how can we really assess allegiance? If patriotism is a set of attributes and beliefs that create an attachment and loyalty to a nation then this attachment becomes severed which in time will affect security and the paradigm of the nation state.

In this new area of globalization technology and the ease to communicate, transport products, and travel throughout the world has created conditions that create greater inequality between low scale low wage work and high scale high wage work.² Globalization has increased the average income but is increasing inequality within countries. Those who benefit from the high pay of high scale jobs show trends that may causes people to act more as individuals as opposed to what is good for the security and survival of the nation. This increase in wealth decreases the value of nationalism until a threat is perceived or an attack has occurred³. This can be seen in the United States

currently, after September 11th attack the country united, today we see daily clashes in political parties and individual opinions or beliefs, even to the level of disrespect to the highest office of government. This historic age of globalization marked by acceleration of flows across our border, economic wealth and social connections will continue to pull or test the common bonds nationalism creates until danger is perceived.⁴

The current global system merges foreign and domestic affairs; this creates economic opportunities but also creates dependencies between nations. This global system also reduces the separation between economic growth and security. This wealth within a smaller population creates separation and does not stop evil.⁵ Researchers argue that this spread or increase in high paying jobs has avoided great wars like World War I and World War II. In a time when scholars also agree that globalization has attained to a point never before seen in history, small scale wars still exists, famine still strikes, arms races as still pursued, and genocide still is inflicted. Does this challenge the thought that a more interconnected world creates peace and stability? If globalization creates prosperity, who does the most prosperity go to, does it make the wealthy wealthier and create a greater gap as some argue? Globalization helps and hurts small businesses or causes companies to relocate to save costs. What benefit or cost are associated with these business choices and what affect do they have on stability and what are the costs to nationalism?

Those benefitting from globalization understand the threats associated with it⁶. The spread of knowledge, technologies and mass migrations has brought threats along with economic prosperity to the global level. The global community understands these challenges, the United States acknowledges the challenges in strategic documents. The

issue is that it takes a united people to confront these challenges and dangers. Education of the opportunities and dangers of globalization will help people understand the risks.

Extremists take advantage of mass global migration to do harm to nation states.⁷ Just as globalization is at an unprecedented level so is migration due to the ease of movement and number of war torn areas of the world. This has opened up opportunities for extremists to take advantage of globalization. This has also caused home grown terrorists to emerge as well as terrorists migrating with the flow of other migrants.

Globalization erodes culture by separating the distinction between domestic and foreign events.⁸ This could cause policy changes in strategy on how the United States decides to fight its wars, possibly even pushing more in the limited war direction. Historically limited wars have been long and drawn out for the United States, this expends large amounts of resources and weakens the populations support. These negative effects of globalization will continue to erode at our culture breaking down nationalism over time.

Globalization means different things to different people.⁹ Challenges, risks, and opportunities are present in every industry in every nation; each industry considers these variables and determines what is best for that particular industry. They may or may not consider security implications outside their industry or what larger scale implications are being generated. Cross border mergers and acquisitions have grown to include the defense industry, this creates the ability to move people and money to anywhere in the world at high speeds and for extended periods of time.

Since the end of the Cold War both globalization and radicalized terrorism have increased, this has produced a discussion of what really is national security.¹⁰ The

definitions vary between strategic documents and joint doctrine, this causes much discussion and confusion. Even issues that are clearly defined in law such as secure national borders cause much debate, and these debates occur as public, political ones, and private ones. The rise of radicalized terrorism since the end of the Cold War has increased the priority of solving these issues.

Individuals are more likely to commit acts of terror after gaining United States citizenship than prior for the legal protection granted to citizens.¹¹ Terrorism is categorized by citizenship status. The statuses of citizenship are citizen, naturalized citizen, legal immigrant, illegal immigrant, and non-immigrating foreigner. The United States Government has reported individuals who have radicalized and has ranked non-immigrating foreigners as the third largest category of incidents analyzed. A link exists between citizenship and terrorism incidents, this is being studied by the United States Government and other private organizations.

Focus Area 2: Organizations, Policies, and Processes, in place to React to Incidents in the United States

It takes the involvement of all citizens to provide security for a nation. Activating the power of the people strengthens nationalism and increases trust, resiliency and involvement, and these qualities build strength and lessen potential vulnerabilities¹². Local and federal agencies cannot be everywhere and see everything, and if security becomes merely reactive by these agencies the costs for security can be greater. If globalization tears apart these bonds of involvement and trust, from where does an adequate counter balance come from? Would security that is only reactive be an adequate substitute for totally involved citizenry to provide inherent security?

Education is critical in understanding globalization, the spread of globalization, and the trends.¹³ Globalization is spreading an economic free-market to virtually every country in the world. The effects caused by this if not understood or countered could have negative security implications. If globalization has hit its peak as some suggest and is starting to decline this also must be understood so as to anticipate the effects that decline may have on the economy, whether they be positive or negative ones. Education remains key to countering any deleterious effects of globalization so the country can create an environment that does not erode our ability to secure the homeland.

We must understand all aspects of the environment, political, military, economic, social, information, infrastructure, physical environment, and time to determine threats and solutions to issues.¹⁴ All aspects of the current environment play an important part to understanding and solving security threats. Anticipating change proactively and solving security challenges or threats before they happen can also be achieved by education and discussion. Thinking about what we want the future environment to look like will help in addressing the challenges of globalization.

Currently it is unclear to what extent globalization effects homeland security.¹⁵ The expansion of globalization, economic growth, and population growth present many complexities to understanding the threat. This in conjunction with no universal definition of homeland security between academics, local, state, and federal organizations creates a condition where there is no unified approach to solving the security threats.

Not understanding the consequences of globalization causes confusing and misleading concepts of the potential holistic effects.¹⁶ Research indicates that the forces of globalization, regionalization, and nationalism should not be looked at separately or in

isolation. For example, some aspects of globalization could actually strengthen nationalism such as technical globalization. Other aspects, especially the erosion of cultural norms could erode nationalism. All of these affect national security and the ability to respond or to determine threats.

Common concepts and definitions are required for unity of effort as challenges to security are debated.¹⁷ Disunity stems from the confusion that organizations are not even able to define concepts the same for purposes of their own mission or end state. This investigation's focus is on homeland security but there is value in holistic view, if we are struggling with definitions and common approach between organizations within the United States Government then what are the challenges between allies to share information and common operations that aid in homeland security? This is important because of the increasing threat of terrorism and supports that are taking advantage of the global immigration and economies.

Economic, homeland, and national security are related, and globalization causes uncertainties in need and understanding of each.¹⁸ If areas of high crime rates also have high unemployment rates then homeland security may be impacted, and this is one facet in which we can relate economic security to homeland and national security. One of the unintended consequences of globalization is the strain put on local economies or as the cause of a loss of jobs due to global competition. Job loss may occur in both national and local businesses. The loss of jobs causes a local security concern if the impact is large enough on a particular area. Sections of the United States can be analyzed to show these trends such as Detroit or the city of Chicago. Even if the impact is not large enough to

close businesses or cause layoff the uncertainties caused by the world market cause changes in the stock market and material prices.

Homeland security strategy must be an all-inclusive vision that includes core values, institutional values, national interests, and also reflect a realistic understanding of globalization.¹⁹ “The idea of establishing a global defense-in-depth represents a small, but extremely significant, shift in our thinking about homeland security; it's a perspective that is broad enough to appreciate the requirements as well as the opportunities presented by globalization” Echevarria and Tussing, 2003. “From Defending Forward,” Echevarria and Tussing emphasize that security is individual citizens’ responsibility, every agency, and every organization, this is truly necessary to understand the challenges and the solutions to globalization. If we allow globalization to work against what holds us as Americans together without addressing the issues, what will drive unity of effort to keep the homeland secure?

Focus Area 3: The Declaration of Independence and Constitution as a Uniting Document for Individuals

The birth of the United States began with the need to provide security and freedom that was more just and inclusive than provided by the colonial power.²⁰ The founding fathers resolved to provide safety and happiness for all, and to continue in the successful fulfillment of this resolve we must be united in our effort. To achieve and secure prosperity for all citizens, the federal government has a responsibility to provide and educate the citizens as well as shape national security strategy.

The Constitution establishes a unified goal to protect and to secure the blessings and liberty of the citizens, this started with The Declaration of Independence and is

nested throughout The Constitution with the establishment of governments and terms, military and restrictions, and militias.²¹ This unified goal to protect is to secure the blessings and liberty of the citizens. Also required by the constitution is the obligation to regulate commerce and trade with foreign nations. Part of this regulation is education to the citizens of the nation to keep a balance of what is good for the individual as well as local economies. To ensure a unified effort and commitment by all the government is also required to establish and enforce a uniform rule of naturalization. If we as a nation lose focus on the naturalization process, is it possible that this nation can still preserve, defend and protect the constitution, which establishes the basis for stability and security of its citizens?

Government and law enforcement agencies are not everywhere and do not see or interact with every citizen or those other than citizens within the homeland with either good or bad intentions. The most preventative form and effective form of security is developed from the bottom up. If patriotism is caused to fade and sovereignty degraded what will be the glue to cause individuals to be unified for protecting the order and justice within the society?²² Terrorism is one possible consequence of globalization, if we do not remain united, but only unite when tragic events happen, then we will always just be dealing with an aftermath of attacks instead of preventing them.

What steps should be taken to preserve the collective identity of the United States? Foundations for our youth's identity must be constructed and we must instill within them that collective identity to insure a unified survival.²³ Public schools throughout the United States vary on the level of focus given to patriotism or educating

the principles of our nation and our democracy. Educating our youth on the importance unity has on national security would help provide for future survival and success.

The United States must take action to unify as a nation to continue to thrive.²⁴ The political separation we are currently experiencing is not new, there have been other periods of time of great separation. The difference in today's time is the speed of all aspects of our current life, social media, travel, news stories both verified and unverified, and personal opinions. It is argued by researches that the dysfunction is at a greater level than seen in the past, that more personal agendas predominate and what is good for the country as a unified group of people is not being exposed or promoted. It would seem more productive to be preventative instead of relying on our resilience to be the best counterterrorism method.

The American public is willing to accept costs and support use of the military as they believe the actions are required because of what is at stake.²⁵ The American public is more accepting of the use of military forces under the Global War on Terrorism than other operations that may not seem to provide security to their interests. Will American people be as supporting and accept the costs of security grow if they grow in both money and life?

If neither the stakes or risks are understood, nor the prospects for success by the majority of the population, then this support may fade.

American citizens must value American heritage and play an active role in homeland security.²⁶ An active and engaged citizenry is part of the national homeland security strategy. Individuals are affected by the amount of international travel conducted, international connections, residencies they may have and their legal status, it

is difficult to predict or know the level of commitment to the United States. The United States Government recognizes dual citizenship but does not endorse it due to the same reasons, where does the individual's loyalty belong?

Personal and national security issues will merge in the current environment.²⁷ Before the Cold War the enemy the United States sought to contain was communism. The United States engaged in armed conflict in Vietnam and on The Korean Peninsula to stop the spread of communism. The United States believed communism a threat to free market economies and that containment was necessary for sustaining economic growth. Since the end of the Cold War and in recent times the United States looks for those who oppose globalization with the intent to quit these forces, only recently does this appear to be changing. Since many nations possess nuclear weapons the nation state verses nation state conflicts have not occurred. This possession of nuclear weapons by developed nation states creates a deterrence, the devastation to both sides may be beyond what any developed nation state may be willing to accept. The current threat is more individuals with concern of rogue nations such as North Korea. Internal threats deriving from external sources are difficult for a nation equipped and postured to responding to hostile nation states'; the internal threats and subversion requires a more holistic national effort to be successful.

Conclusion

The evidence presented in this chapter is categorized in three focus areas. The focus areas are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

Using these three focus areas allows a deliberate focus on the data and how it aids to answering the research questions of this thesis. The primary research question of this thesis is: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? Secondary research questions are:

1. How should the United States react to globalization to secure the homeland?
2. As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

The focus area allowed an analysis of multiple sources of similar data and how this data relates to the research questions and is bound by principles in the Declaration of Independence and the Constitution.

Focus areas number one is the challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland presents findings from multiple studies on the challenges of globalization related to security and national sovereignty. All citizens who wear a uniform in the United States Armed Services as well as elected civilian government officials take an oath to protect and defend the constitution, although not under oath all citizens pledge allegiance to the United States of America which obligates them to do the same. The Declaration of Independence also establishes a commitment “we mutually pledge to each other our lives, our fortunes and our sacred honor.” George Washington summarizes all of this by saying “it’s only keepers, the people.” As the world is more interconnected and people are not naturalized and current citizens are obligated to be stewards of the

constitution this is not instilled in every citizen or soon to be citizen. It is the responsibility to educate and continue this commitment by the government, the educational institutions and care givers of all to instill these obligations and to educate the good and bad of our involvement around the world. Focus area number two is organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.

The Constitution of the United States in Article I, section 8 establishes duties for congress, one of these duties is “to regulate commerce with foreign nations, and among the several states, and with the Indian Tribes; to establish a uniform Rule of Naturalization, and uniform laws on the subject of bankruptcies throughout the United States.” We currently have many organizations and strategic documents in place to secure the homeland, these documents and organizations are not fully capable to implement or fulfill their obligation without the citizens. The 2014 Quadrennial Homeland Security Review highlights areas of concern, among these are that the current threat is decentralized and hard to detect, as well as domestic based. To strengthen our preparedness and resilience engaged and active citizens are required. The most common theme in all research examined for this focus area highlights the need for education in understanding globalization and the spread of globalization.

Focus area number three is the constitution as a uniting document for individuals. The constitution established laws and rules for governance, it protects the citizens from the government, and it insures that the states will be granted state sovereignty as well as national sovereignty. These rules, regulations, and ideals are outlined in the Declaration of Independence and Constitution of the United States as well as echoed by George

Washington and other founding fathers. Using these principles, laws, and regulations to educate, regulate and unite us as Americans will insure future prosperity and safety.

Chapter 5, Conclusions and recommendations, the common themes identified in chapter 4 will be consolidated to answer the primary and secondary research questions. Chapter 5 will also identify recommendations for further research. This chapter will also identify recommendations for potential consideration in strategic documents or education curriculum.

¹ Herbig, “Allegiance,” 38.

² Worldbank, “Theorist Eric Maskin: Globalization is Increasing Inequality,” accessed 3 April 2017, <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2014/06/23/therist-eric-maskin-globalization>.

³ Tsatsanis, “Global Insecurities,” 8.

⁴ *Ibid.*, 1.

⁵ Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler, *Challenges*, 5, 9, 21.

⁶ Davis, “Globalizations Security Implications,” 1, 4, 7.

⁷ Ann D. Simmons, “Globalization and its Effect on National Security” (Anne Arundel Community College, Criminal Justice and Homeland Security, Institute for Criminal Justice, Legal Studies and Public Service, 2006), 1, 2, 11, 12.

⁸ Captain Thomas W. Luscher, “The Post-Military West: Globalization’s Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture” (Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, CA, 2009), 1, 2, 6.

⁹ Terrence R. Guay, “Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base” (Report, Strategic Studies Institute, Carlisle, PA, 2007), iii, 1, 21, 24.

¹⁰ Shawn Reese, *Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations* (Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, 2013), 1, 5, 11.

¹¹ Kyle E. Recker, “Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2014), v, 7, 33, 46.

¹² Angela Yvonne English, “People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for Community Collaboration and Engagement Within A Homeland Security Ecosystem” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2014), v, xiii, 89.

¹³ LTC John M. Lazar, “Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States’ Defense Industrial Base” (Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2007), 1, 2, 4, 10.

¹⁴ Joint Chiefs of Staff, *JOE 2035*, ii, iii, 1.

¹⁵ Thomas Kirwin Dobson, “Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2015), v, xv, 95.

¹⁶ Arie M. Kacowicz, “Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?” (Working Paper, The Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies, 1988), 4, 9, 41.

¹⁷ MAJ Neal S. Croft, “Thoughts, Words, and Actions-Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism” (Monograph, School of Advanced Military Studies, Ft Leavenworth, KS, 2012), iii, 1, 6, 44.

¹⁸ Bijan P. Karimi, “Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeland and National Security” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2015), v, xvii, xxi, 93.

¹⁹ Antulio J. Echevarria II and Bert B. Tussing, “From ‘Defending Forward’” to A ‘Global Defense-in Depth’: Globalization and Homeland Security” (Monograph, U.S. Army War College, Strategic Studies Institute, Carlisle Barracks, PA, 2003), 12, 13, 14.

²⁰ Thomas Jefferson, 1776, *Declaration of Independence*.

²¹ Thomas Jefferson, 1787, *Constitution of the United States*.

²² Brummond, “*Restructuring for Homeland Security-What is Really Necessary?*” iii, 2, 5, 22.

²³ Ravert, “*Protecting America Through Better Civic Education,*” i, 1, 46, 64.

²⁴ Commander Chad M. Brooks, “Rebuilding the City on the Hill” (Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2012), 1, 2, 8, 17.

²⁵ Eric V. Larson and Bogdon Savych, *American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad* (Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2005), 16-17.

²⁶ Cherie A. Lombardi, “Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?” (Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2011), v, 2, 4, 7.

²⁷ Bradd C. Hayes and Thomas P. M. Barnett, “System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization” (Monography Naval War College, Newport, RI, 2002), 4, 9-10.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction

The primary research question of this thesis is: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? The hypothesis is yes, that over time if the rate of increase that occurred from the end of the Cold War to January 2016 continues, then sovereignty will be decreased. In order to answer the research question the literature review is divided into three focus areas. These focus areas are:

1. The challenges presented by globalization to securing the homeland.
2. Organizations, policies and processes in place to secure and react to incidents in the United States.
3. The constitution as a uniting document for individuals.

These areas are chosen to understand the challenges, understand how these challenges relate to security, current organizations, policies and reaction to incidents, and then how they relate to the constitution and what the guiding principles of the constitution to overcome these challenges are. A few key words found in the constitution and are words that bind us together as Americans to overcome challenges, hardships, and provide guiding principles to allow continued prosperity.

Understanding definitions has been key to analyzing the data presented in this thesis. Some of the key definitions to this thesis are reiterated again to express the importance of the selected definitions. The selection of these key words and the definition of them is listed below as well as in chapter 1.

Allegiance: The fidelity owed by a subject or citizen to a sovereign or government. (Merriam-Webster)

Border: The physical line around the perimeter of the homeland that includes the continental United State, Alaska, Hawaii, United States territories, and surrounding territorial waters and airspace.

Citizenship: Security and belonging within a bounded political territory.

Crime: An act or the commission of an act that is forbidden or the omission of a duty that is commanded by a public law and that makes the offender liable to punishment by that law. (Merriam-Webster)

Globalization: The process of growing international activity in many areas that is creating ever-closer ties, enhanced interdependence, and greater opportunity and vulnerabilities for all.

Homeland: The United States homeland is the physical region that includes the continental United States, Alaska, Hawaii, United States territories, and surrounding territorial waters and airspace.

Immigration: To enter and usually become established; especially to come into a country of which one is not native for permanent residence. (Merriam-Webster)

National Sovereignty: The idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, have a right to exist without other nations interfering. It is the unspoken rule of a nation's right to exist.

National Will: As used for the purposes in this study is defined and linked to The Declaration of Independence. "We hold these truths to be self-evident, that all men are created equal, that they are endowed by their creator with certain unalienable rights that

among these are Life, Liberty and the pursuit of happiness. That to secure these rights, Governments are instituted among Men, deriving their just powers from the consent of the governed, that whenever any form of government becomes destructive of those ends, it is the Right of the People to alter or to abolish it, and to institute a new Government, laying its foundation on such principles and organizing powers in such form, as to them shall seem most likely to affect their Safety and Happiness. For these reasons we exist as a nation, and these ideas should not be forgotten nor taken lightly. We do much if not most of the activities or events in our lives for security and happiness. People naturally have a selfish nature, but also want to help others and be part of something larger than themselves. For these reasons we volunteer, we serve, we get in our car and drive from Washington State to the east coast on September 11th to help without being asked.

Nationalism: Love of country plus a negative evaluation of other countries, national identity.

Patriotism: Set of attitudes and beliefs that refers to individuals' attachment and loyalty to their nation and country-to the 'homeland,' the conjunction between country and nation-the loyalty to one's people and its land.

Security: Freedom from fear or anxiety. (Merriam-Webster)

Terrorism: The systematic use of terror especially as a means of coercion.
(Merriam-Webster)

Conclusions

Prior to beginning this research project, it was more of a curiosity than a serious intellectual inquiry that drove my hypothesis that globalization could have such an effect on national sovereignty. I am surprised to find a plethora of literature to read about the

negative effects of the process. After conducting this study, I believe that globalization does affect national sovereignty and this will over time challenge securing the homeland and eventually cause a situation where United States Government will not be able to achieve the desired results of securing the homeland. These desired results as also stated in strategic documents also includes continuing economic and technological growth, so a balance is needed to manage the security requirements of the nation.

National Sovereignty is the idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, have a right to exist without other nations interfering. It is the unspoken rule of a nation's right to exist. Merriam-Webster's dictionary defines sovereignty as freedom from external control. The definition of national sovereignty used for this study is bound to the constitution and backed up with the dictionary definition and other literature. Research indicates that as the United States and its population become more dependent on other nations both for economic survival and security we will lose our sovereignty. This breakdown will also occur in allegiance and patriotism. Research and strategic documents also indicate that security is a holistic responsibility of the nation that involves citizens and government. Just as life results in both positive and negative outcomes, globalization is no different. We must understand both the positive and negative affects to achieve a balance and understand the risks associated with each process and how to mitigate these risks. Most of these risks can be mitigated through education.

Findings—Recommendations

Since the end of the Cold War the rate of increase in globalization is unlike any other point in our history. Prior to the Cold War the United States focused on containing

communism and establishing democracies around the world. Since the end of the Cold War the focus is creating both increased economic and military ties and quieting those opposed to globalization. The realism of the threats that exist and the will to carry out terroristic threats since the attacks on the United States on September 11th 2001 has caused some to question if this is best for the security of the United States. Some researchers are suggesting that globalization reached its apex and the rate will start to decline. Some recent events in the world give some validity to this argument. The Brexit in the United Kingdom and their plan to withdraw from the European Union is one. The current political environment in France stemming from the wave of attacks since 2012 is another and then the 2016 elections in the United States.

Signing of The Declaration of Independence occurred on July 4th 1776 and signing of The Constitution of the United States in 1787. Between 1776 and 1787 we operated under The Articles of Confederation. Much of the debate in those years regarded being individual states or one nation state. In the end the enduring consensus of “we are stronger united” won. The definition of nationalism is love of country plus a negative evaluation of other countries, national identity. Some will argue that nationalism causes war and this is a valid argument but nationalism seems to be promoted by the constitution, and is inconsistent with a nation not enduring against all threats. Today there are still threats from other nation states but the threat we fight daily is from non-state actors in which we must be united and operate as a sovereign nation state. These actions are pursued with the ideal of nationalism needed to defeat these threats.

Extremists use the mechanisms of globalization to plan and carry out attacks on the homeland. In a time where world travel is affordable and convenient, small and large

businesses operate around the world, dual citizenship is acceptable, and communications and interconnectivity are real time. The ease of planning and executing attacks with small numbers of people and resources is allowing difficult detection of those with ill intentions on the homeland. These current norms enabled by technological advancements continues to make it difficult to assess allegiance and allows ever closer ties to ones place of origin. The current rate of immigration and the controversy of enforcing immigration laws is adding to this challenge. Where does ones' allegiance belong?

The United States possesses a unique culture; it is a melting pot of immigrants from all over the world. This is unlike other countries of the world such as France, United Kingdom, or the Middle East where the majority of the population and their ancestors are from that area. The United Kingdom is composed of English, Scots, Welsh, Northern Irish, Cornish peoples, whom have their own histories but still are in large groups in similar areas. This makes it difficult to assess what does eroding culture look like in the United States. Literature does exist though that indicates the increase in immigration to the United States both legal and illegal. This magnitude of immigration has caused the naturalization process to be different then say those who immigrated through Ellis Island in the 1900s. Most still have similar reasoning, for a better life free from oppression and other hardships.

There is a connection between personal security and national security. Economic prosperity causes people to be individuals as opposed to what is good for overall security and the survival of the nation. This reduces nationalism until a threat is perceived or occurs and people start to question their security. To put this in succinct terms, people change their position as the issue or topic impacts their life. Each person, family, or

business evaluates the challenges, risks and opportunities of globalization differently as they perceive the benefits.

Citizenship alone does not guarantee allegiance to the United States, prevent someone from becoming radicalized, or conducting an attack on other Americans in the homeland. Citizenship is only part of the process that ties a person to the nation they reside in. The American heritage, core values, institutional values, interests, and understanding must be instilled in all of us. A source of pride, belonging to something greater than ourselves and the desire to contribute to the security and prosperity of the nation is a continuous process that does not just happen.

Homeland Security has varying definitions within different organizations of the United States Government. Common understandings and a shared view of the environment create a shared understanding. Disunity and confusion within and across organizations will not produce the unity of effort to defeat our current threats or to respond to incidents in the most efficient and organized ways. We have endured many incidents over the last 15 years bringing great improvement to all levels of government. The next step is further employing every citizen to be engaged and committed to reducing the threats capabilities.

Understanding globalization is critical in determining the opportunities and vulnerabilities that exist. This understanding will bring involvement, trust and resiliency to the American population. It will also help in understanding and determining a necessary balance between homeland security, economic prosperity, and achieving strategic objectives throughout the world. Free market trade, building coalitions and

supporting our allies will not be going away so it is necessary that we understand how globalization fits into the principles that unite us as Americans.

Key findings from this study reveal that education is key to understanding globalization's security implications as well as countering those implications. Education is also key so that we do not allow globalization to erode or sovereignty. Education reform is necessary with our youth, adults and during the naturalization process with immigrants as they go through the process of citizenship. We all must understand where we have come from, we must understand the guiding principles as intended in the constitution. This education and understanding does not happen without a deliberate effort. Each state, each family, every school district, and higher education institutions will play a part in this education process. I recommend that education requirements be part of our strategic documents at both the national and state level. "If we forget what we did, we won't know who we are"-President Ronald Reagan.

Areas for Future Study

Some areas that were not studied or not studied in depth during this research project are:

1. Is the immigration, naturalization, and assimilation process different today than in the early 1900? If so what are differences and similarities and how does this affect our national security?
2. The relationships between employment, job loss due to companies relocating to other countries, poverty, and globalization in cities or areas with high crime rates.
3. Education reform regarding civic education, United States History, what is being taught and what is not as well as differences between states.

4. Global meliorism and the changes in policy of the United States Government through the years; Exceptionalism (focus on liberty at home, avoiding entangling alliances), Unilateralism (as opposed to isolationism), The American System (Monroe Doctrine), Expansionism (Manifest Destiny). Old Testament vs. New Testament thoughts or correlation could also be tied into this.

5. Current globalization trends from the attacks on the United States from September 11th 2001 until present.

The following paragraphs are an expanded explanation of the five areas for future research. These expanded explanations of the additional research recommendation will provide a greater understanding to the requirements necessary. These paragraphs also provide an overview of scope.

1. Is the immigration, naturalization, and assimilation process different today than in the early 1900s? If so what are differences and similarities and how does this affect our national security? What is the long-term effect of not enforcing one national language? Statistics show that more people immigrate to the United States now than in the 1900s. There would be value understanding the environment at different times in our nation's history, compare different time periods to today to analyze perceived level of patriotism and what the naturalization process is and how much importance is placed on this process. This could also help us understand how this relates to security and sovereignty.

2. The relationships between employment, job loss due to companies relocating to other countries, poverty and globalization in cities or areas with high crime rates. Developing patterns of crime and job loss would help understand how globalization has caused these situations and also could help determine some possible solutions. Economic

globalization may have caused some of the issues and understanding how and why could determine a path out of the crime and poverty. If understood and managed a combination of free trade and also a mixture of business exchange and employment within those cities and the United States as a whole could help reimage cut crime and raise employment rates.

3. Education reform regarding civic education, United States History, what is being taught and what is not as well as differences between states. I find it interesting and wonder what causes the different opinions on the array of issues we face as a nation in states and areas of the country. I do not believe our political or differences are any greater today than in the past, it is just that we know more today about opinions of the nation as a whole and are able to communicate and keep updated on events in real time because of technology. Does technology cause us to be better informed but less educated? If we take the news as truth or people's opinions as truth without doing some research on our own is that healthy for the nation? There is value in understanding how our youth is educated throughout our nation and determining the differences in the process. Why some schools still start every morning class with the Pledge of Allegiance and some do not. How the constitution is being taught, what caused the revolutionary war, and our history as a nation throughout the years. Why we went from the Articles of Confederation to the Constitution. Why we are stronger together than as separate states or people. What educational reform is necessary to teach the facts and allow people to develop their own opinions and not just teach opinions of the instructor? There is great value in education in securing our nation.

4. Global Meliorism and the changes in policy of the United States Government through the years; Exceptionalism (focus on liberty at home, avoiding entangling alliances), Unilateralism (as opposed to isolationism), The American System (Monroe Doctrine), Expansionism (Manifest Destiny). Old Testament verses New Testament laws, not to force religion but to understand the differences between Christians, Jews, and Muslims, and also understand the similarities. This would help us to understand views and beliefs and make us stronger as a nation.

5. Current globalization trends from the attacks on the United States from September 11th 2001 until present. Some researches state that globalization has hit its apex and will start to slow down. If this is true what is causing this? Is it fear, is it to stop the erosion of culture, or is it to ensure that nation states are able to keep their sovereignty? This will be helpful in understanding security strategies and changing these strategies as well as how this will affect recruiting and retention needs of the nation for military and law enforcement. This will help determine how we partner with other nations especially here in North America.

Summery

This study analyzed literature focused on globalization and how the process of globalization is eroding national sovereignty. This study used the Declaration of Independence and the Constitution as the uniting documents. The sources of themes and unifying words used throughout this thesis are from these two documents. Literature suggests that if globalization continues at the current rate that it will affect our national sovereignty and the ability to secure the homeland. The primary research question of this

thesis is: Does the continuing increase in globalization decrease national sovereignty and our ability to secure the homeland? Secondary research questions are:

1. How should the United States react to globalization to secure the homeland?
2. As national sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go?

National Sovereignty is the idea that independent nations, which have declared their independence, have an organized government and are self-contained, have a right to exist without other nations interfering. It is the unspoken rule of a nation's right to exist.

By this definition being dependent on other nations for economic or security reduces our sovereignty. Our constitution provides guidelines and principles to prevent this from becoming a reality. If we are not careful and not continuously evaluating our environment and the affects our business choices and polices produce we may be on a slippery slope. Education is key for all Americans to understand how our involvement in the world affects our ability to secure the homeland. Education will provide the necessary balance to keep us secure and sovereign to provide prosperity for future generations. Education is how the United States can react to globalization to provide this balance.

As sovereignty is dissolved where does individual allegiance go? Some research suggests that allegiance will be to one's country of origin. There are many factors that will have an effect on allegiance. Our immigration laws and processes are in place to naturalize immigrants and it is up to the current citizens to assimilate them into our nation and way of life. The more we are tolerant to illegal immigration and dual citizenships this process will fade. Again education plays a big part in understanding why we have the laws and processes in place. Securing our nation is a challenging and continuous job, and we must all take a part in attaining this goal. Promoting the pride and patriotism of all

Americans is critical in this task. Federal, state, and local military and law enforcement organizations struggle to recruit the quality and numbers of individuals required. We must insure that an adequate and capable pool of Americans exist for these commitments. After September 11th 2001, we saw Americans flooding to recruiting stations to serve, who decided that there exists an obligation to protect our sovereignty and way of life. If this spirit fades what will happen after the next significant attack or to our ability to stop such an attack from active citizenry? We as Americans must be united and bound to the principles of the constitution.

APPENDIX A

SIGNIFICANT WORDS

Table 2. Significant Words for Focus Area 1

	Allegiance in a Time of Globalization (63 Pages)	Citizenship and Terrorism (81 Pages)	The Post Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture (30 Pages)	Globalization's Security Implications (8 Pages)	Globalization and its Effect on National Security (24 Pages)
Allegiance	261	0	0	0	0
Immigration	53	193	5	0	62
Citizenship	123	122	0	0	8
Border	14	70	12	4	11
Terrorism	1	167	9	5	8
Crime	1	10	1	2	1
Homeland	17	51	3	1	3
Globalization	82	1	47	21	13
Security	89	121	24	21	68
Sovereignty	12	0	5	0	3
Nationalism	47	0	5	0	0
Patriotism	15	0	0	0	0
	Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrial Societies(34 Pages)	Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations(18 Pages)	Challenges of the Global Century (34 Pages)	Globalization and its Implication for the Defense Industrial Base(85 Pages)	
Allegiance	11	0	0	0	
Immigration	7	9	3	2	
Citizenship	2	0	4	0	
Border	2	11	10	14	
Terrorism	12	30	5	3	
Crime	0	0	11	0	
Homeland	0	255	1	8	
Globalization	32	0	125	74	
Security	12	131	96	47	
Sovereignty	3	1	0	2	
Nationalism	159	0	2	0	
Patriotism	1	0	0	0	

Source: Created by author.

Table 3. Significant Words for Focus Area 2

	Security and Prosperity (157 Pages)	From Defending Forward to a Global Defense (32 Pages)	Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States Defense Industrial Base (23 Pages)	Thoughts, Words, Actions- Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism (59 Pages)
Allegiance	0	0	1	0
Immigration	7	1	1	0
Citizenship	18	1	1	0
Border	13	28	1	0
Terrorism	58	38	1	498
Crime	8	1	0	2
Homeland	339	74	1	4
Globalization	127	29	79	1
Security	1192	106	14	37
Sovereignty	1	0	0	2
Nationalism	2	0	0	0
Patriotism	0	0	0	0
	People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for Community Collaboration and Engagement (135 Pages)	Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism (47pages)	Entropy and Self-Organization (129 Pages)	
Allegiance	0	3	0	
Immigration	7	0	10	
Citizenship	48	1	1	
Border	4	8	3	
Terrorism	26	1	52	
Crime	1	0	30	
Homeland	290	1	412	
Globalization	3	170	121	
Security	331	79	403	
Sovereignty	0	20	3	
Nationalism	0	50	8	
Patriotism	1	0	0	

Source: Created by author.

Table 4. Significant Words for Focus Area 3

	Declaration of Independence	Constitution of the United States of America	American Public Support for U.S. Military (280 Pages)	Restructuring for Homeland Security What is Really Necessary (40 Pages)
Allegiance	1	0	0	0
Immigration	1	0	0	4
Citizenship	0	16	0	1
Border	1	5	0	7
Terrorism	1	0	133	96
Crime	0	11	0	0
Homeland	1	0	0	197
Globalization	1	1	0	2
Security	3	8	64	267
Sovereignty	1	2	0	0
Nationalism	1	3	0	2
Patriotism	1	0	0	0
	Protecting America Through Better Civic Education (91 pages)	Rebuilding the City on the Hill (34 Pages)	Denationalized Citizenship Theory (123 Pages)	System Perturbation (11 Pages)
Allegiance	3	0	17	0
Immigration	11	4	114	2
Citizenship	35	7	696	0
Border	2	2	16	3
Terrorism	31	15	23	9
Crime	0	1	0	2
Homeland	23	17	181	1
Globalization	2	50	46	53
Security	39	32	239	31
Sovereignty	1	0	18	0
Nationalism	8	5	9	1
Patriotism	14	0	21	0

Source: Created by author.

APPENDIX B

SIGNIFICANT THEMES

Table 5. Significant Themes for Focus Area 1

Author	Document name	Significant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Katherine Herbig	Allegiance in a time of Globalization	Allegiance remains difficult to evaluate, investigate, and adjudicate.	vii	Devided loyalties creates a difficulty in determining allegiance.
Katherine Herbig	Allegiance in a time of Globalization	Since 1985, the sheer change in scale of international trade and finance suggests that globalization has become an unprecedented phase in world history.	vii	
Katherine Herbig	Allegiance in a time of Globalization	Citizenship: One or Many?	18	
Katherine Herbig	Allegiance in a time of Globalization	Recent research on espionage by American citizens that show a trend since 1990 toward more espionage motivated by devided loyalties.	2	
Author	Document name	Significant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Emmanouil Tsatsanis	Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Japan and the United States	Most theorists of globalization maintain that we have entered a new historic stage, marked by the proliferation and acceleration of economic , political, social, cultural and human flows across national borders.	1	Economic prosperity decreases value of nationalism until a threat is perceived.
Emmanouil Tsatsanis	Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Japan and the United States	Conceptualizations of nationalism are usually accompanied by parallel understandings of pride, attachment and loyalty to the nation-state as a natural and positive psychological state which is typically labeled patriotism.	3	
Emmanouil Tsatsanis	Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Japan and the United States	The higher the perceived threat, the more pronounced the nationalism.	12	
Emmanouil Tsatsanis	Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Japan and the United States	Individuals are more likely to identify strongly with their nation and support nationalist ideals when they perceive a greatest sence of danger towards their national identity and sence of personal security posed by external actors.	24	
Author	Document name	Significant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler	Challenges of the global Century	Globalization has many positive attributes.	5	Globalization generates wealth within small amout of population and creates separation and does not stop evil.
Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler	Challenges of the global Century	Globalization does not stop wars, prevent agression, end arms races, erase centries of hatred, or eradicate power politics.	5	
Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler	Challenges of the global Century	Economic growth and disparities.	9	
Flanagan, Frost, and Kugler	Challenges of the global Century	Implecations for U.S. Security and Defense Polky.	21	
Author	Document name	Significant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Lynn Davis	Globalization's Security Implecations, RAND Issue Paper	Globalization is a multidimensional phenomenon.	1	Those benefiting from globalization understand the threats associated with it.
Lynn Davis	Globalization's Security Implecations, RAND Issue Paper	Most dangerously, a variety of threats have become global in scope and more serious in their effects as a result of the spread of knowledge, the dispersion of advanced technologies, and the movements of people.	1	
Lynn Davis	Globalization's Security Implecations, RAND Issue Paper	Significant economic gains accrue from the worldwide expansion of trade, the widespread availability of foreign direct investment, and the easy movement of private capital across borders.	4	
Lynn Davis	Globalization's Security Implecations, RAND Issue Paper	The international community understands fairly well the dimensions of globalization and the characteristics of the associated threats and opportunities.	7	
Author	Document name	Significant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Anna Simmons	Globalization and its Effect on national Security	Mass global migration has reached an unprecedented magnitude, facilitated by the ease of movement between Asia, Africa, the Middle East, Latin America, and the Western nations.	1	Extremists take advantage of mass global migration to do harm to nation states.
Anna Simmons	Globalization and its Effect on national Security	Extremists take advantage of large scale demographic movements and use (abuse) the immigration policies and laws established by the United Nations and individual nation states.	2	
Anna Simmons	Globalization and its Effect on national Security	"threats coming from within a nation "	11	
Anna Simmons	Globalization and its Effect on national Security	"Home Grown Terrorist "	12	

Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Captain Thomas Luscher	The Post-Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture	Strategic culture shapes policy-making and influences how a country fights its wars.	1	Globalization erodes culture.
Captain Thomas Luscher	The Post-Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture	Globalization has created varying effects all over the globe, both positive and negative.	1	
Captain Thomas Luscher	The Post-Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture	The essence of globalization is that it erodes the distinction between domestic and foreign events.	2	
Captain Thomas Luscher	The Post-Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture	Strategic culture can be understood as a subset of national culture.	6	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Terrence Guay	Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base	The forces of globalization present challenges, risks, and opportunities to virtually every industry in every country.	iii	Globalization means different things to different people.
Terrence Guay	Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base	Frequently that it has come to mean different things to different people.	1	
Terrence Guay	Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base	Ability to move money to almost anywhere in the world at high speed.	21	
Terrence Guay	Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base	The globalization of capital has contributed to the growth in cross-border mergers and acquisitions (M&A) in nearly every sector, including defense	24	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Shawn Reese	Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations	Polymakers continue to grapple with the definition of homeland security.	1	Since the end of the Cold War both globalization and rdicalized terrorism has increased, this has caused a discussion on what really is national security.
Shawn Reese	Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations	End of the Cold War and the rise of radicalized terrorism.	1	
Shawn Reese	Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations	National Security Strategy.	5	
Shawn Reese	Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations	Secure and manage borders.	11	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Kyle Recker	Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security	Terrorism within the United States is categorized in terms of citizenship status: citizen, naturalized citizen, legal immigrant, illegal immigrant, and non-immigrating foreigner.	v	Individuals are more likely to commit acts of terror after gaing U.S. citizenship then prior for the legal protection granted to citizens.
Kyle Recker	Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security	Government reported 125 individuals who have been radicalized to jihadist terrorism before discussing the possible avenues for their radicalization.	7	
Kyle Recker	Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security	Non-immigrating foreigners, making it the third largest category of incidents analyzed.	33	
Kyle Recker	Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security	Link between citizenship and terrorism.	46	

Source: Created by author.

Table 6. Significant Themes for Focus Area 2

Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Joint Chiefs Of Staff	Joint Operating Environment (JOE 2035) 14 July 2016	Thinking through the most important issues in a changing world can mean the difference between victory and defeat.	ii	Understand the environment (PMESII-PT) to determine threats and solutions to issues.
Joint Chiefs Of Staff	Joint Operating Environment (JOE 2035) 14 July 2016	Proactively solving security threats.	iii	
Joint Chiefs Of Staff	Joint Operating Environment (JOE 2035) 14 July 2016	The security environment is always in flux, change is relentless and occurs in all aspects of human endeavor.	1	
Joint Chiefs Of Staff	Joint Operating Environment (JOE 2035) 14 July 2016	Thinking about the future through lens of various trends, conditions, contexts, and impecation.	1	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Angela Yvonne English	People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for community coloboration and engagement	More involvement, more trust, more resiliency, more participation, more inclusiveness, and more empowerment.	v	Involvement, trust, and resiliency builds strength and lessens vulnerabilities.
Angela Yvonne English	People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for community coloboration and engagement	When security becomes a reactive enterprise, pursued only after threats become manifest, the effort ends up being costly, ugly, and largely ineffective.	xiii	
Angela Yvonne English	People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for community coloboration and engagement	Build strength and lessen vulnerabilities.	xiii	
Angela Yvonne English	People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for community coloboration and engagement	Activating the power of people in community.	89	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
LTC John Lazar	Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States' Defense Industrial Base	Globalization means the spread of free-market capitalism to virtually every country in the world	1	Education is critical in understanding globalization, the spread of globalization, and current trends.
LTC John Lazar	Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States' Defense Industrial Base	Globalization has reach its zenith and fallen.	2	
LTC John Lazar	Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States' Defense Industrial Base	There is evidence that economic globalization effects are clearly noticeable in post-Cold War US defense industry.	4	
LTC John Lazar	Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States' Defense Industrial Base	Education is the critical vulnerability.	10	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Thomas Dobson	Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats	Echnological advance, population growth, economic growth, and globalization, and can be causally linked to real-world homeland security threats.	v	Currently it is unclear to what extent globalizaion effects homeland security.
Thomas Dobson	Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats	There is currently not a single definition of homeland security agreed upon by academics and practitioners at the federal, state, and local levels.	xv	
Thomas Dobson	Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats	Currently, there is not a similar unified approach to the understanding of homeland security threats.	xv	
Thomas Dobson	Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats	Understanding the complexities of the homeland security environment.	95	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Arie Kacowicz	Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?	Globalization, regionalization, and nationalism.	4	Not understanding the consequences of globalization causes confusing and misleading concepts of the wholeistic effects.
Arie Kacowicz	Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?	Confusing and misleading concepts of globalization, regionalization, and nationalism.	4	
Arie Kacowicz	Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?	Regionalization can be conceived as the growth of societal integration within a given region.	9	
Arie Kacowicz	Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?	Sovereignty has been eroded by the action of nonstate actors.	41	

Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Major Neal Croft	Thoughts, Words and Actions - Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism	Disunity stems from the lack of a common concept and definition.	iii	Common concepts and definitions are required for unity of effort.
Major Neal Croft	Thoughts, Words and Actions - Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism	Global terrorism.	1	
Major Neal Croft	Thoughts, Words and Actions - Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism	Unity of effort.	6	
Major Neal Croft	Thoughts, Words and Actions - Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism	Increasing threat from terrorism and its supporters.	44	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Bijan Karimi	Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeleand and National Security	Relationship between economic, homeland, and national security.	v	Economic, homeland, and national security are related, and globalization causes uncertainties in each.
Bijan Karimi	Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeleand and National Security	Homeland security supports economic security.	xvii	
Bijan Karimi	Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeleand and National Security	Increasing globalization of business operations has made local economies more susceptible to shocks and uncertainties triggered in other parts of the world.	xxi	
Bijan Karimi	Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeleand and National Security	Significant effect on the economic, homeland, and national security relationships—an effect that is leading to unintended consequences.	93	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Echevarria II and Tussing	From "Defending Forward" to a "Global Defense-in Depth": Globalization and Homeland Security	Core values, institutions, and interests.	12	Homeland security strategy must be all inclusive of core values, institutional values, interests, and reflect an understanding of globalization.
Echevarria II and Tussing	From "Defending Forward" to a "Global Defense-in Depth": Globalization and Homeland Security	Agencies and organizations must think of homeland security—in all of its dimensions.	14	
Echevarria II and Tussing	From "Defending Forward" to a "Global Defense-in Depth": Globalization and Homeland Security	The nation's homeland security strategy must reflect an understanding of globalization not only for the challenges it poses, but also for the solutions it offers.	14	
Echevarria II and Tussing	From "Defending Forward" to a "Global Defense-in Depth": Globalization and Homeland Security	America's vulnerability to terrorism.	13	

Source: Created by author.

Table 7. Significant Themes for Focus Area 3

Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Thomas Jefferson	The Declaration of Independence	Organizing its powers in such form, as to them shall seem most likely to effect their safety and hapiness.	N/A	Organizing powers to provide security and freedom.
Thomas Jefferson	The Declaration of Independence	Provide new guard for their future security.	N/A	
Thomas Jefferson	The Declaration of Independence	That to secure these rights, Governments are instituted anong Men, deriving their just powers from the consent of the governed.	N/A	
Thomas Jefferson	The Declaration of Independence	That these United Colonies are, and of Right ought to be Free and Independent States.	N/A	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Thomas Jefferson	The Constitution of the United States	Secure the blessings of liberty.	N/A	Unified goal to protect
Thomas Jefferson	The Constitution of the United States	To regulate Commerce with foreign Nations.	AI, S7	
Thomas Jefferson	The Constitution of the United States	Establish a uniform Rule of Naturalization.	AI, S7	
Thomas Jefferson	The Constitution of the United States	Preserve, protect and defend the constitution of the United States.	AII, S1	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
COL Stephen Brummond	Restructering for Homeland Security What is Really Necessary?	The defense of this nation and the war on terrorism ultimately involves every agency and level of government.	iii	Individuals unifying to protect
COL Stephen Brummond	Restructering for Homeland Security What is Really Necessary?	Critical relationship between an organization and the environment in which it operates.	2	
COL Stephen Brummond	Restructering for Homeland Security What is Really Necessary?	Terrorist organizations have become the "dark side" of globalization.	5	
COL Stephen Brummond	Restructering for Homeland Security What is Really Necessary?	Most powerful form of protection comes from the bottom up.	22	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Brian Ravert	Protecting America Through Better Civic Education.	Preservation of our democracy and enhance homeland security.	i	Instill a collective identity for a unified survival
Brian Ravert	Protecting America Through Better Civic Education.	The foundations of our youths individual and collective identity.	1	
Brian Ravert	Protecting America Through Better Civic Education.	Programs to make a measurable difference in socieity.	46	
Brian Ravert	Protecting America Through Better Civic Education.	Teaching them the strength of our nation and we would be providing them with a strategy of survival and success.	64	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Commander Chad Brooks	Rebuilding the City on the Hill	United States must take action to (1) restore individual resilience, (2) repair a dysfunctional political culture, and (3) leverage a unifying national identity to thrive in an increasingly competitive global environment.	1	Unify as a nation to continue to thrive.
Commander Chad Brooks	Rebuilding the City on the Hill	Global transportation, financing, and communication technology strengthened transnational criminal and terror organizations that opposed American ideological and cultural influence.	2	
Commander Chad Brooks	Rebuilding the City on the Hill	Undoubtedly, the global environment is extraordinarily dynamic, presenting significant risks and abundant opportunities for the United States	8	
Commander Chad Brooks	Rebuilding the City on the Hill	"in some unspoken way, people have recognized that the best counterterrorism policy is resilience."	17	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Larson and Savych	American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad	Importance of Stakes.	16	American public is willing to accept costs and support use of the military as they believe the actions are required due to what is at stake.
Larson and Savych	American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad	Prospects for Success.	16	
Larson and Savych	American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad	Expected and Actual Costs / Casualties.	16	
Larson and Savych	American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad	Except casualties in operations conducted under the GWOT than in any of the peace operations in the preceding decade.	219	

+

Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Cherie Lombardi	Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?	National strategy for homeland security calls for an active and engaged citizenry to play a significant part in homeland security.	v	American citizens must value American heritage and play an active role in homeland security.
Cherie Lombardi	Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?	U.S. citizens, intemational connections, residences, travel, or legal status.	2	
Cherie Lombardi	Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?	The U.S. Government recognizes that dual citizenship exists, but does not endorse it as a matter of policy because of the problems that it may cause	4	
Cherie Lombardi	Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?	American civic values and the American heritage as his or her own.	7	
Author	Document name	Signifant Statements	Page	Formulated Meaning
Hayes and Barnett	System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization	Super-empowered individual.	4	Personal and national security issues will merge.
Hayes and Barnett	System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization	There will be a merging of national and personal security issues.	9	
Hayes and Barnett	System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization	Globalization is primarily an economic phenomenon.	10	
Hayes and Barnett	System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization	Possibilities of great power wars.	10	

Source: Created by author.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Brooks, Commander Chad M. "Rebuilding the City on the Hill." Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2012.
- Brummond, COL Stephen. "Restructuring for Homeland Security-What is Really Necessary?" Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2003.
- Commission Members. *The 911 Commission Report*. Accessed 2 May 2017.
<https://govinfo.library.unt.edu/911/report/911report.pdf>.
- Creswell, John W. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*, 3rd ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2007.
- Croft, MAJ Neal S. "Thoughts, Words, and Actions-Disunity in the British and American Struggle Against Global Terrorism." Monograph, School of Advanced Military Studies, Ft Leavenworth, KS, 2012.
- Davis, Lynn, E. "Globalization's Security Implications." Issue Paper, RAND Corporation, 2003.
- Department of Homeland Security. "Mission." Accessed 5 November 2016.
<https://www.dhs.gov>.
- . *National Strategy of Homeland Security*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2007.
- . *Quadrennial Homeland Security Review*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2010.
- Department of the Army. Training Circular (TC) 25-20, *A Leader's Guide to After-Action Reviews*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 1993.
- Dobson, Thomas, K. "Entropy and Self-Organization-An Open System Approach to the Origins of Homeland Security Threats." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2015.
- Echevarria II, Antulio, J., and Bert B. Tussing "From 'Defending Forward'" to A 'Global Defense-in Depth': Globalization and Homeland Security." Monograph, U.S. Army War College, Strategic Studies Institute, Carlisle Barracks, PA, 2003.
- English, Angela, Y. "People-First Homeland Security: Recalibrating for Community Collaboration and Engagement Within A Homeland Security Ecosystem." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2014.

- Federal Emergency Management Agency. "Mission." Accessed 5 November 2016.
<https://www.fema.gov>.
- Flanagan, Stephen, J., Ellen, L. Frost, and Richard, L. Kugler. *Challenges of the Global Century*. Washington, DC: Institute for National Strategic Studies, 2001.
- Guay, Terrence, R. "Globalization and its Implications for the Defense Industrial Base." Report, Strategic Studies Institute, Carlisle, PA, 2007.
- Harvey, Robert. *Global Disorder*. New York: Carroll and Graf Publishers, 2003.
- Hayes, Bradd, C., and Thomas, P. M. Barnett, "System Perturbation: Conflict in the Age of Globalization." Monography Naval War College, Newport, RI, 2002.
- Herbig, Katherine, L. "Allegiance in a Time of Globalization." Technical Report, Defense Personnel Security Research Center, Monterey, CA, 2008.
- Investopedia. "Freemarket." Accessed 5 November 2016.
<http://www.investopedia.com/terms/f/freemarket.asp>.
- Joint Chiefs of Staff. *Joint Operating Environment 2035 (Joe 2035): The Joint Force in a Contested and Disordered World*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2016.
- . Joint Publication (JP) 3-0, *Joint Operations*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2011
- . Joint Publication (JP) 3-27, *Homeland Defense*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2013.
- Kacowicz, Arie, M. "Regionalization, Globalization, and Nationalism: Convergent, Divergent, or Overlapping?" Working Paper, The Helen Kellogg Institute for International Studies, 1988.
- Kaplan, Robert, D. *The Coming Anarchy: Shattering the Dreams of the Post Cold War*. New York: Vintage Books, 2001.
- Karimi, Bijan, P. "Security and Prosperity: Reexamining the Connection Between Economic, Homeland and National Security." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2015.
- Larson, Eric, V., and Bogdon Savych. *American Public Support for U.S. Military Operations from Mogadishu to Baghdad*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND, 2005.
- Lazar, LTC John, M. "Effects of Economic Globalization on the United States' Defense Industrial Base." Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, PA, 2007.

- Lombardi, Cherie A. "Denationalized Citizenship Theory: What is the Role of Citizenship Theory in Homeland Security?" Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2011.
- Luscher, Captain Thomas W. "The Post-Military West: Globalization's Impact on U.S. Strategic Culture." Strategic Research Project, U.S. Army War College, Carlisle, CA, 2009.
- Ravert, Brian, P. "Protecting America Through Better Civic Education." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2013.
- Recker, Kyle, E. 2014. "Citizenship and Terrorism: The Significance of a Pathway to Citizenship on Homeland Security." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, Monterey, CA, 2014.
- Reese, Shawn. *Defining Homeland Security: Analysis and Congressional Considerations*. Washington, DC: Congressional Research Service, 2013.
- Simmons, Anna, D. "Globalization and its Effect on National Security." Anne Arundel Community College, Criminal Justice and Homeland Security, Institute for Criminal Justice, Legal Studies and Public Service, 2006.
- The Economist. "Poverty: Not Always with Us." June 2013. Accessed 5 November 2016. <http://economist.com/news/briefing/21578643-world-has-astonishing-chance-take-billion-people-out-extreme-poverty-2030-not>.
- The White House. *National Security Strategy*. Washington, DC: Government Printing Office, 2015.
- Tsatsanis, Emmanouil. "Global Insecurities and Nationalism in Advanced Industrialized Societies: Evidence from Japan and the United States." Working Paper, Sophia University Institute of Comparative Culture, Tokyo, Japan, 2009.
- United Nations Environment Program. "Global Commons." Accessed 5 November 2016. <https://UNEP.org>.
- Worldbank. "Theorist Eric Maskin: Globalization is Increasing Inequality." Accessed 3 April 2017. <http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2014/06/23/therist-eric-maskin-globalization>.