



## **Best Practices for Programming to Prevent Trafficking in Human Beings in Europe and Eurasia**

**September 2004**

**This report was made possible through support provided by the Office of Women in Development, Bureau for Economic Growth, Agriculture, and Trade (EGAT/WID), USAID, and was written by Ruth Rosenberg for Development Alternatives, Inc. (DAI) under the terms of Contract No. GEW-I-00-02-00017-00. The opinions expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID.**

*Ruth Rosenberg*

Implemented by

**Development *Alternatives, Inc.***

7250 Woodmont Avenue, Suite 200, Bethesda, Maryland 20814  
Tel: (301) 718-8699 Fax: (301) 718-7968 Email: info@dai.com



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The researchers would like to thank the many people who made this report possible. We send our gratitude to everyone who met with us by phone and in person in Albania, Romania, Russia, Ukraine, and Washington, D.C., who freely shared with us their time, experiences, knowledge, and ideas. We are especially grateful to the organizations that helped us organize focus group discussions with participants of their programs—in Russia, the International Research and Exchanges Board (particularly Steven Mackey and Anastasia Danilina) in Moscow, Winrock International (especially Natalia Alekhina and Anastasia Shvaryova) in Khabarovsk, the Youth Center “Contact” in Khabarovsk, the Regional Foundation of Women’s Entrepreneurship Support in Ekaterinburg, the Resource Center/Support Fund “Partner” in Rezh, and the Local Union of Youth in Kamensk; in Romania, Pro Women in Iasi (especially Irina Barbalata and Roxana Nimirciag), the Lizuca Placement Center in Bucharest, and Hope World Wide Romania, Saftica Center in Saftica/Ilfov; in Ukraine, the West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives” in L’viv and Successful Woman in Kherson. A special thanks as well to the participants of the focus group discussions who eagerly participated and shared with us their understanding and ideas about migration and trafficking. We must also send special thanks to USAID in Romania, Russia, and Ukraine, particularly to Olga Moshkova, Gabriela Manta, and Tatiana Timoshenko, who not only gave generously of their time and ideas, but also helped to facilitate meetings with USAID’s many partners in country; and to Ruth Pojman with USAID in Washington, who also gave generously of her time and gave invaluable inputs into the success of this report. In Romania, we send special thanks as well to Monica Joita from IOM and Monica Alexandru, who provided research assistance. In Ukraine, we are grateful to Vadym Basysty for his patient and enthusiastic interpretation and translation services. We are also thankful to DAI, particularly to Belinda Bernard for her support and encouragement at every turn, to Elaine Blakely for her administrative and research assistance and financial wizardry, and to Amy Phariss for assistance in researching and writing the annotated bibliography for this report. We are grateful to you all and hope that the analysis and ideas presented in the report will prove useful in developing ever more effective programs to prevent trafficking of men, women, and children in the Europe and Eurasia region and beyond.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>VII</b>
<b>PURPOSE AND METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>BACKGROUND</b>	<b>3</b>
OVERVIEW OF TRAFFICKING IN THE REGION.....	3
WHAT IS PREVENTION AND WHY IT IS IMPORTANT.....	4
ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....	4
<b>ANALYSIS OF PREVENTION PROGRAMS BY TYPE</b>	<b>7</b>
AWARENESS-RAISING AND EDUCATION .....	7
EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS .....	15
EMPOWERMENT PROGRAMS/IMPROVED COMMUNITY LIFE .....	18
CRISIS PREVENTION/DOMESTIC VIOLENCE MITIGATION PROGRAMS.....	19
SAFE MIGRATION PROGRAMS—JOB-VETTING ACTIVITIES.....	20
DEMAND REDUCTION PROGRAMS.....	23
PREVENTION POLICIES AND LEGISLATION .....	25
Awareness-Raising/Education .....	26
Criminalization .....	26
Regulation of Travel and Employment Services Companies .....	27
Employment Programs.....	29
Guest Worker Agreements.....	30
Migration Monitoring and Controls.....	31
Regulation of Informal Sectors.....	33
Anti-Corruption.....	33
<b>MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF PROGRAMS</b>	<b>35</b>
<b>ANALYSIS OF PROGRAM SUSTAINABILITY</b>	<b>37</b>
GOVERNMENT—NGO COOPERATION .....	37
CAPACITY BUILDING .....	37
ALTERNATIVE FUNDING MECHANISMS.....	38
<b>TRAFFICKING PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND DESIGN</b>	<b>41</b>
<b>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SUCCESSFUL PREVENTION PROGRAMS</b>	<b>45</b>
TARGET PROGRAMS EFFECTIVELY TO THE AT-RISK GROUPS.....	45
FOCUS ON NEGLECTED TARGET GROUPS.....	47
UPDATING MESSAGES.....	49
CONTINUE PROGRAMS THAT TARGET JOURNALISTS, POLICY MAKERS, LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICE PROVIDERS.....	51
PROVIDE TRAINING TO ANTI-TRAFFICKING PRACTITIONERS.....	51
MECHANISMS FOR DISTRIBUTING MESSAGES .....	51

CONTINUE EMPLOYMENT PROMOTION PROGRAMS.....	53
INCREASE OPPORTUNITIES FOR SAFE AND LEGAL MIGRATION, AND IMPROVE IMPLEMENTATION MECHANISMS FOR GUEST WORKER AGREEMENTS .....	53
DEMAND SIDE INTERVENTIONS .....	53
DATA COLLECTION.....	54
<b>ANNEX A: ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>A-1</b>
<b>ANNEX B: LIST OF PERSONS INTERVIEWED</b>	<b>B-1</b>
<b>ANNEX C: TRAFFICKING PREVENTION FRAMEWORK AND INDICATORS</b>	<b>C-1</b>

## ACRONYMS

AED	Academy for Educational Development
ATTO	Anti-Trafficking Task Order
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
EU	European Union
FGD	Focus group discussion
IHF	International Helsinki Federation
ILO/IPEC	International Labour Organization/International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
IOM	International Organization for Migration
IREX	International Research and Exchanges Board
MSI	Management Systems International
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NGO	Nongovernmental Organization
OSCE	Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe
SEC	State Employment Center
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
SO	Strategic objective
TDH	Terre des Hommes
TIP	Trafficking in persons
UN	United Nations
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNMIK	United Nations Mission in Kosovo
USAID	U.S. Agency for International Development



## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

USAID commissioned an assessment of trafficking in persons prevention activities in the Europe and Eurasia region in order to develop a framework for trafficking prevention programs in the future. This report analyzes information gleaned from a review of existing documentation—project reports, evaluations, research, and the like—as well as information gathered during brief assessment missions to three countries of the region, Romania, Russia, and Ukraine. Accordingly, the results are limited by the information that was available and should be considered with this understanding in mind. One of the greatest limitations is a dearth of objective indicators measuring impact of trafficking prevention programs. Additionally, limitations in the time available to conduct this assessment restricted the researchers' ability to review materials and interview informants.

However, even with these limitations, there are some significant changes to report as a result of several years of countertrafficking prevention programming in parts of the Europe and Eurasia region. It is clear, for example, that prevention efforts have resulted, though not necessarily in reductions in trafficking overall (this was not possible to assess), in the prevention of individuals being trafficked. There are cases reported of women recognizing that they may be in the process of being trafficked who are able to escape before they are exploited or abused. It is also clear that the general population of many countries is far more aware of trafficking and of the exploitation of migrants than they would have been without trafficking prevention programs. As a result of this increased awareness of the problem, they are far more likely now to seek assistance of countertrafficking organizations to help them assess the legitimacy of job offers and better prepare themselves before going overseas. It also seems clear from the available information that, as a likely result of trafficking prevention programs, traffickers have been forced to change their methods of operating. In many countries, they can no longer rely on placing advertisements in newspapers, as the population has become savvier about the risks of this kind of employment. Similarly, in other countries, traffickers have been required to change their routes because of crackdowns at border areas, or have had to move their operations underground. Although these changes have clearly not yet put traffickers out of business, we can hope that these changes have cost them valuable resources; increased the cost of their operations, thereby reducing their profitability; and made them more vulnerable to detection and arrest, thereby increasing their risk of doing business.

Trafficking prevention programs can be divided into the following broad categories:

- Awareness-raising and education
- Employment
- Empowerment/improved community life
- Crisis prevention
- Safe migration/job-vetting activities
- Demand reduction
- Prevention policies and legislation

Each type of program addresses a different aspect of the trafficking problem. The information available is not sufficient to objectively compare these methods and determine if some methods are more effective than others. However, there is enough information available to determine that in most cases a mix of different interventions is required.

A basic mix of interventions, which can have fairly rapid impact, includes awareness-raising campaigns along with the provision of safe migration information and training. General awareness-raising campaigns appear to be effective in raising levels of knowledge and understanding about trafficking. However, they do not lower levels of interest in migration. Not even scare tactics appear to change people's minds about looking for work abroad because people either don't believe it will happen to them or are willing to undertake a certain amount of risk for the promise of a better life. However, awareness-raising campaigns do appear to encourage people to seek information about how to work abroad safely. Therefore, public information campaigns and interventions that provide information to those at risk about how to investigate the validity of job offers and how to determine if their travel documents are in order, as well as how to seek help if problems arise while overseas, are the most critical and basic interventions. Efforts should be made to incorporate this kind of training and information into existing broad-based institutional frameworks, such as schools and religious institutions, to ensure that such information is systematically provided to the general population.

However, these interventions only address immediate information needs; they do nothing to address the root causes of the problem. Factors such as poverty and perceived poverty, expectations that cannot be met by available opportunities, gender discrimination, sexualization and commodification of women, a desire for adventures and a better life, and pervasive corruption are all thought to cause trafficking to flourish. Prevention activities that address root causes include job skills training programs to promote local employment opportunities; empowerment programs to develop children's self-confidence, nurture realistic expectations for their futures, and assist them in developing successful career plans; community enrichment programs to enliven community life and discourage out-migration; and crisis intervention programs to provide durable, local solutions for women and children in abusive homes or facing other crises that might otherwise push them to migrate. Although many of the programs appear to be successful in meeting their immediate objectives—increasing employment opportunities, empowering young people, helping those in crisis—less information is available about the impact of these programs on preventing trafficking. Each appears to have a role in prevention of trafficking, but all could benefit from improved performance indicators to measure their impact.

There is a notable lack of programming addressing the demand side of trafficking. The document review revealed significant potential for demand-side interventions that could help prevent trafficking. However, it also revealed that little is currently being done in this area. Campaigns are needed in destination areas that make the use of trafficked persons for sexual exploitation unacceptable. Campaigns are also needed that target clients of prostituted women to raise their awareness of the issue and to educate them on how to identify a trafficked woman and how to assist her in finding help. Programs are needed that educate young men about sexuality, relationships, prostitution, gender roles, women's rights, human

rights, and other issues to discourage the use of prostitution as early as possible, before it becomes habitual.

And finally, policies need to be implemented that address the many facets of trafficking prevention, including

- **Criminalization:** It was beyond the scope of this assessment to determine the impact of criminalization of trafficking on prevention. However, certain acts have been criminalized, which appears to have had a positive impact on reducing trafficking, for example, criminalizing consumers for receiving services from trafficked women and criminalizing those who pay for sexual services.
- **Regulation of employment and travel firms:** Since implementing systems to register and regulate employment firms, some countries have exposed exploitative practices and companies have been closed. In some countries, the researchers found that countertrafficking practitioners had confidence in employment firms regulated by the state. Theoretically, these kinds of policies could prevent trafficking that takes place through these businesses. However, there is not yet enough information to objectively assess the impact of regulation on prevention, and it would be irresponsible to imply that any licensed firm, even in the best of regulatory environments, does not or could not engage in trafficking.
- **Guest worker agreements:** Until the local economy can fully employ the population, migration will remain a strong pull for many people. As a result, the more legitimate and safe work opportunities abroad, the better. Countries could actively seek more employment opportunities for their citizens abroad and sign agreements with recipient countries to ensure the protection of their migrant workers. However, these agreements can only be effective if they are fully implemented and take women's opportunities into consideration. The researchers found that even though job quotas available through these agreements were limited, even these were not being met. Therefore, not only do more jobs need to be created through these agreements, but mechanisms to fully implement the agreements also need to be developed.
- **Monitoring borders:** There are mixed reviews about the benefits of tighter border controls on the prevention of trafficking. In fact, there are indications that the greatest effect of closed borders is to push those at risk into the hands of traffickers. On the other hand, open borders appear to make it easier for traffickers to take victims across borders. Therefore, it is not clear whether tighter or looser border controls have any impact on trafficking. However, there are other ways to monitor borders that may have a positive impact on prevention, such as training border guards to identify potential trafficking victims, warn them of the dangers they may face, offer them referrals for services, and have information available about trafficking, migrants rights, and how to seek assistance in the destination country.

- **Corruption:** Trafficking in persons is a profitable criminal business facilitated by corruption. In combating trafficking in persons, it is critical to also fight corruption because the existence of corruption is an impediment to any effort to combat trafficking.

## 1. PURPOSE AND METHODOLOGY

The purpose of this assessment is to identify prevention activities best suited to USAID's comparative advantage by extracting lessons learned, best practices, cost-effectiveness, and consequences—both intended and unintended—from existing programs, and to assess the impact of anti-trafficking in persons (TIP) programs through the use of direct indicators as well as proxy measures. The researcher has also developed a framework of performance indicators to be used in USAID performance plans and for monitoring and evaluation of future program designs.

The assessment was designed to be implemented in three parts. The first phase was a review of existing documentation of countertrafficking prevention programs in the Europe and Eurasia region, with a focus on USAID-funded activities. For this document review, the Anti-Trafficking Task Order (ATTO) reviewed a wide range of documentation, including project documents from USAID-funded programs such as project overviews, quarterly or semi-annual reports, final reports, mid-term or final evaluations, and internal evaluations; country overviews; trafficking strategies and plans of action; evaluations of countertrafficking efforts in the region and in other regions; country-specific and regional research on trafficking and related issues; and other documents. Interviews were also held with a select number of USAID's implementing partners. Because of the limited time available in which to conduct this assessment, the researchers were unable to review all documents, interview all USAID Missions, or contact all implementing organizations. This report is not meant to be an inventory of all prevention activities in the region. Examples of programs are included in the report to illustrate points. Numerous other excellent programs not mentioned here have been and are being implemented, including many that may be doing similar activities to those mentioned and some whose programming is unique. No activities or programs were intentionally excluded, but time did not allow for in-depth analysis of every program.

Several limitations were noted in the information available through the documentation review. First, there have been a limited number of evaluations of USAID-funded countertrafficking programs in the region or of prevention activities generally, whether USAID-funded or not. Second, if implementing organizations tracked performance indicators, few were made available to the ATTO. Of those performance monitoring plans that the ATTO was able to review, most contained output indicators (e.g., number of people trained, number of posters produced), and included few results indicators (e.g., change in percentage of at-risk group who know how to confirm legitimacy of a job offer, percentage of participants who found employment, percent change in number of participants who are no longer interested in working abroad). Without results-based indicators to measure baseline as well as post-intervention performance, one cannot directly measure the impact of programs.

Additionally, although many references are made in the documentation to trafficking for purposes other than prostitution—especially of children for begging or selling narcotics, or of men for forced labor—and some research has been conducted on these types of trafficking, little information was available about activities being undertaken to prevent trafficking

specifically for these other purposes.<sup>1</sup> Similarly, little information was available specifically on interventions to prevent trafficking of children, except for the purposes of prostitution. Though there may be much overlap in appropriate prevention strategies for these disparate groups, there are also potential differences—different at-risk populations, different methods of recruitment, and the like—which require different prevention strategies. It is important, therefore, to keep in mind that much of the information included here is based on information from programs that focus primarily on prevention of trafficking for prostitution. Finally, there is a scarcity of information about foreign victims of trafficking in the Middle East and Asia. There are indications that many women who are trafficked from the Russian Far East, Central Asia, and the Caucasus are sent to the Middle East, China, South Korea, and Japan. However, there are few nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) working on the issue in these countries and little reporting on the issue from governments. Therefore, we do not have enough information to determine the scope of the problem, the methods of the traffickers, or the profiles of the victims.

Following this Phase one document review, research was conducted in Romania (Bucharest, Iasi, and Saftica/Ilfov), Russia (Kamensk, Khabarovsk, Moscow, and Rezh), and Ukraine (Kiev, L’viv, Odessa, and Kherson) to fill in gaps in the information available from the document review. Researchers met with USAID implementing partners and other key countertrafficking organizations and state agencies. They also conducted focus group discussions with recipients of trafficking prevention programs. Although the same questions and methodologies were used in each country, because different researchers were employed in each country, results may not be consistent. Similarly, researchers had a limited amount of time in which to conduct the research—from 10 days to only a few weeks. This too limited the information that could be obtained. The other limitation is the same as that found in the document review: only a very few of the organizations contacted collect objective data about the impact of their programs. Therefore, much of the information was based on subjective impressions rather than objective data.

Phase three consisted of analyzing and consolidating the information into this final report.

---

<sup>1</sup> During the process of conducting this assessment, a new report was released about trafficking of persons for organ transplants. This report indicates that men from the Europe and Eurasia region, especially from Moldova, Romania, and Russia, may be becoming victims of this form of trafficking. For more information see GTZ, 2004: Coercion in the Kidney Trade.

## 2. BACKGROUND

### 2.1 OVERVIEW OF TRAFFICKING IN THE REGION

The Europe and Eurasia region is vast and diverse. Each country has its own unique culture, different development challenges, and vastly different economies. Trafficking in each country manifests itself in unique ways. Responses to it, therefore, must be adapted to the local context. There are many reports available that describe in detail the trafficking context and patterns in the region. This report will not repeat that information (see Annex A for an annotated bibliography). However, there are some issues related to trafficking that are common across the region and worth highlighting here because of their importance for prevention. One is the constantly changing dynamics of trafficking. Traffickers change their methodologies to adapt to changing conditions. As some borders or routes are closed, new ones are opened. As the public is warned about false advertisements, traffickers tap into personal networks for recruitment. As urban, educated women become more informed about the deceptions of traffickers, traffickers target younger, rural, less-informed women. As police crack down with brothel raids, prostitution is moved underground. Responses too, therefore, must also be constantly adapting to these changes.

Additionally, in receiving and sending countries alike, there is more and more evidence of trafficking within countries (Limanowksa, 2003). In Kosovo, a study by Save the Children points to the need to focus trafficking prevention programming on Kosovar youth, as they are at risk of becoming increasingly vulnerable to trafficking because of declining economic conditions, shrinking economic inputs as humanitarian and development assistance declines, and increasing familiarity with migration (Roopnaraine, 2002). Similar issues were noted in many other countries. In Bulgaria, which was once primarily a sending country, more and more cases of internally trafficked women are being identified (Limanowska, 2003). This speaks to the need to be vigilant in fighting trafficking and addressing this changing phenomenon before problems grow out of control. Receiving countries must alert the local population to the dangers of trafficking and migration even as they are providing services to primarily foreign victims of trafficking. Similarly, places known primarily as sending areas must set up systems to ensure that a market for the services of trafficked persons is not able to develop.

A study of trafficked women in Israel between 2000 and 2002 reveals large numbers of victims from Russia, Moldova, and Ukraine. Of particular interest, however, is that there is a notable decline in the number of women from Ukraine and Russia and an increase in the number from Uzbekistan (Levenkron and Dahan, 2003). This may point to achievements in fighting trafficking in Europe but, more importantly, it serves as a warning that as awareness of the issue increases in Europe, and responses become more effective, traffickers may target regions where countertrafficking efforts are still nascent, such as the Caucasus and parts of Central Asia. Additionally, while much is known about trafficking to European destinations, less is known about trafficking elsewhere. Trafficking of persons from the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) to Asia and the Middle East could be far more extensive than is realized.

## 2.2 WHAT IS PREVENTION AND WHY IT IS IMPORTANT

According to Merriam-Webster’s dictionary, “Prevent ... mean[s] to deal with beforehand. Prevent implies taking advance measures against something possible or probable” (Merriam-Webster, 2004). In the context of trafficking in persons, prevention programs are those activities and policies whose purpose is to stop persons from becoming victims of trafficking; they do not refer to the wider range of countertrafficking programming, such as prosecution or victim services. Prevention is critically important for combating TIP in the long term. Prevention programs work to stop the abuse before it starts, saving the at-risk population from the psychosocial trauma and human rights abuses that result from trafficking. An assessment of best practices to combat trafficking in Asia found that prevention was the also the most cost-effective strategy in the long run (Gupta et al., 2004). This is not to say that programs that provide services to victims are not critically important as well, only that it is preferable to prevent someone from becoming a victim in the first place.

## 2.3 ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK

To assist in analyzing the wide variety of prevention activities that are available, activities will be discussed based on their primary objective: raising awareness, increasing economic opportunities, addressing women in crisis, and so forth. As we will see below, each approach makes an assumption about how it serves to prevent trafficking. By using this approach, we will be better able to analyze not only the effectiveness of programs in meeting their objectives but also their effectiveness in preventing trafficking.

There was neither enough information nor time available to properly analyze implementation mechanisms, although clearly how a program is implemented can have an enormous impact on its effectiveness. Additionally, every country of the region is different, not only with different cultures but also with different government structures and different implementation environments. What is clear from the assessment, however, is the importance of government and NGO cooperation in implementing countertrafficking programs. A brief discussion of the important role of cooperation is included in the section on sustainability of programs.

**Awareness-Raising and Education:** In early programming in the Europe and Eurasia region and beyond, trafficking prevention programs focused on broad-based awareness-raising campaigns, attempting to inform the general population about the crime of trafficking as well as to garner public and government support for action to combat trafficking. As more information was gained about the victims of trafficking, awareness-raising programs became more targeted to those at risk, often packaging the messages and distributing them in a way tailored specifically for those considered most at risk or for those in a position to assist them (teachers, doctors, police, border guards, etc.). Recognizing that a limited amount of information can be provided in most media campaigns, some implementers began providing more in-depth information, through other means, to the target groups. The assumption behind this programming is that those at risk, if they understand the dangers, would avoid those dangers—that informing people will lead to changes in their behavior.

**Economic Alternatives:** Another approach that has recently surfaced is to attack what is seen to be the primary root cause of the problem—a lack of viable job opportunities or economic alternatives at home. A new wave of programming has begun that attempts to train at-risk women to find jobs locally or to develop their own businesses, so that they will not need to risk migration abroad or within their countries of origin. This type of programming assumes 1) that there are enough jobs at home for all of those at risk who want one, 2) that those jobs are of enough interest and earn a sufficient salary to prevent the at-risk group from continuing to seek opportunities away from home, or 3) that those at risk are capable of and interested in starting their own businesses.

**Safe Migration:** There are also programs that are based on the premise that there is currently an insufficient number of high-paying jobs at home and/or that the lure of lucrative or exciting jobs or lives overseas will continue to draw new migrants. These programs try to provide at-risk groups with the information necessary to make informed decisions about the jobs they accept and to empower them to migrate safely and to seek assistance in case of difficulties. The assumption behind these programs is that there is sufficient information available to judge the safety of job offers, and that women unfortunate enough to end up trafficked, even after appropriately vetting job offers, will be in a position to seek assistance to escape or return.

**Empowerment Programs/Improved Community Life:** Other programs attempt to prevent trafficking by empowering those at risk to make better, more-informed choices, and to improve their home or community life. The premise behind these programs is that young people in the region do not know how to plan for their futures and do not have realistic expectations of the job market. Providing them with the ability to make better choices and to have realistic expectations may prevent them from seeking unrealistic riches abroad. These programs also attempt to provide for a richer community life at home to encourage young people to stay.

**Crisis Intervention:** Some programs try to address other factors that are seen to contribute to people becoming at risk of being trafficked. Domestic violence and other crisis intervention programs are examples of this type of programming. These programs are based on the premise that some women seek opportunities to work abroad or in another area in order to escape from an untenable domestic environment. The assumption is that if they are provided either with ways to resolve their domestic problems (e.g., through legal assistance programs) or with alternative living arrangements (e.g., shelters), they will not resort to migration and risk becoming a victim of trafficking.

**Victim Reintegration Services:** Additionally, there are programs whose aim is to prevent re-trafficking of returned victims. These programs are usually conducted within the context of a broad range of victim services. The assumption is that if victims are provided with enough support services, housing, and economic alternatives they will not be required to go abroad again in search of gainful employment. This report will not review these programs, as the

ATTO considers this primarily an issue of victim services and not of prevention.<sup>2</sup> However, it is worth noting that some prevention programs do combine victim services with other prevention activities, and there is and can be some overlap of services. In some programs where trafficking survivors received services alongside of those at risk, they sometimes voluntarily shared their stories with their colleagues. Such testimonials can be important for prevention—putting a face to trafficking can motivate policy makers to action and can make trafficking more understandable and real for those most at risk. However, such testimonial must respect the rights of the survivor and must be completely voluntary. The survivor herself must wish to reveal her status; it should not be done for her by program implementers, nor should pressure be put on her to share her story.

**Demand Reduction:** Demand reduction programs are directed to consumers of the services of trafficked women—people who employ domestic workers or migrant workers, or those who pay for sex with prostituted women. These programs assume that by informing consumers about trafficking and its victims, imposing criminal sanctions against them, making the use of these services socially unacceptable, or educating young men about sexuality, prostitution, gender violence, human rights, and other issues, demand will be reduced. As demand for trafficked women’s services declines, be they sexual or otherwise, the business will become less lucrative for traffickers and fewer women will be trafficked.

**Countertrafficking Policies and Legislation:** This refers to a wide variety of areas in which governments can take actions to prevent trafficking, including tightening border controls, opening borders, increasing opportunities to legally migrate for work, targeting employment programs to those at risk, regulating employment and travel agencies, incorporating countertrafficking programs into school curricula, fighting corruption, and more. USAID has also supported programs regarding drafting and implementation of criminalization of trafficking in persons, defining the legal status of victims, provision of legal services to victims, and confiscation of traffickers’ assets. Each type of activity brings with it its own set of assumptions as to why it will combat trafficking. They will be discussed in more detail below.

---

<sup>2</sup> For more information about return and reintegration services for victims of trafficking see Limanowska, 2003; SIDA, 2003; and Wyss, 2003.

### 3. ANALYSIS OF PREVENTION PROGRAMS BY TYPE

#### 3.1 AWARENESS-RAISING AND EDUCATION

Nearly every country in the Europe and Eurasia region has conducted awareness-raising activities of some kind to combat trafficking. Some have conducted broad-based campaigns in the mass media, aimed at raising the knowledge of the general population about trafficking. In some countries, awareness-raising activities have taken on new approaches, targeting campaigns to very specific groups and for different purposes, such as

- Government officials to increase political will to take actions against trafficking;
- Journalists to report sensitively and safely on the issue—to protect the identities of victims and witnesses and not take unnecessary risks themselves;
- Service providers to help them identify victims and cater to their special needs;
- Law enforcers to increase actions against traffickers and improve treatment of victims;
- Those at risk of being trafficked and their families to increase their understanding of the risks of migration and provide them with information to make informed decisions;
- Those in contact with at-risk groups and their families, such as educators, religious leaders, and community leaders, so that they, in turn, can inform them of the risks and realities of migration and help them make informed decisions; and
- The public to raise awareness of the legal status of victims and encourage acceptance of victims.

In addition to developing a wide array of campaign materials—brochures, posters, stickers, calendars, and the like—many organizations have come up with innovative ways to disseminate information to these disparate groups:

- Discos to target older youth,
- Summer camps for youth,
- Documentary films and theater productions,
- Curricula for use in schools and training of teachers in the curriculum,
- Essay and drawing contests and debates for students,
- Art exhibits,
- Parades, and
- Materials on public transportation.

It is important to assess whether some of these methods are generally more effective than others or whether some methodologies are more effective than others in reaching specific target groups. Most practitioners interviewed believe that the methods they employed had been effective. Unfortunately, there was not enough information available in the documents reviewed to analyze which methods might be most effective in reaching the target audience. As noted in the Purpose and Methodology section, few programs reported results indicators to enable the awareness-raising programs to be properly assessed. Even the final reports from many public awareness campaigns provided little information that could be used to assess the

impact of the campaigns in a way that would be useful in determining best practices for similar programs in the future.

**Testimonials:** Numerous people interviewed for this assessment commented on the importance of victim testimonials in raising awareness and understanding of trafficking. The most effective ways of providing such testimonials are through documentary film or taped testimony. In this way, the identity of the victims can be protected and victims can be spared public humiliation, while at the same time, they can tell their story in their own voice. Using victims with a range of experiences ensures that the target audience does not mistakenly identify trafficking with only one of the ways in which it is manifested. These taped testimonials can be used as advocacy tools with government, as awareness-raising tools with those at risk, and as training tools for those who work with at-risk populations or with victims—including border guards, law enforcement officials, teachers, social workers, and medical professionals.

**Increasing Knowledge and Understanding:** It is clear that many of these awareness-raising activities are successful in increasing the target group's knowledge and understanding of trafficking. In areas where there have been public awareness campaigns, there appears to be a corresponding understanding of trafficking. For example, 38 percent of people in a study of the general population of Ukraine knew about the dangers of trafficking (Rudd, 2002). A survey in Russia showed that 80–98 percent of respondents had heard of the main elements of exploitation and trafficking that can happen to migrant workers (Tyuryukanova, 2002). In Croatia, following a series of seminars for law enforcers, judges, lawyers, and prosecutors who participated showed a 20 percent increase in their understanding of trafficking (ICMC Croatia, 2003). A study in Georgia demonstrated a fivefold increase in the general population's understanding of trafficking following a concerted information campaign (Women for Future, 2003). In 2001, prior to the campaign start, only 20 percent of respondents associated trafficking with sexual exploitation, while a second study, conducted two years later, found that 100 percent of the respondents now knew that sexual exploitation is a form of trafficking. The study also cited other examples of the increased knowledge of the population in the past two years. The authors attribute this increase to the awareness-raising campaigns conducted in the interim.

**Media Blitz vs. Intensive Training:** As noted above, the documentation indicates that public information campaigns using short public service announcements, flyers, posters, and the like can have an important impact in raising the public's awareness of the issue. They also serve to increase public dialog on the issue (E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004). Media campaigns may also serve to rally public support for countertrafficking efforts, and thereby spur public action (Engel, 2001). Another study recommended timing media campaigns to migration cycles, where they exist, for example, prior to summer vacations, a time when many young women look for summer jobs abroad (MSI, 1999). On the other hand, intense, in-depth programming, while reaching a smaller audience, can have a more profound effect on increasing the audience's knowledge and understanding of the issue. In Croatia, a 15 percent increase in the public's awareness of trafficking was measured immediately following an intensive four-month media blitz (IOM Croatia, 2003). During the same campaign in Croatia, the International Organization for Migration (IOM) found that journalists demonstrated a 41.4 percent increase in their knowledge of trafficking following a

two-day training seminar. Implementing organizations have similar observations—that intensive, interactive programming is more effective in increasing knowledge and understanding and in changing behavior (E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004).

**Training for School-Age Children:** A number of NGOs throughout Ukraine are providing training to students in schools and orphanages. Unfortunately, few of these organizations were able to provide objective measures of the impact of these programs. In order to find a way to determine if these programs are effective, during the second phase of this assessment focus group discussions (FGDs) were held with groups of young people in Romania, Russia, and Ukraine, some of whom had received anti-trafficking training and some of whom had not. All of the groups demonstrated an understanding of trafficking and of the risks associated with migration. In Ukraine, all three groups also demonstrated a healthy distrust of people offering jobs, whether through friends, advertisements, or companies. This finding is consistent with a recent survey by LaStrada in Ukraine, which showed that only 5.6 percent of respondents thought that the sources that can be used to find jobs overseas can be trusted (LaStrada Ukraine, n.d.). In both Ukraine and Russia, those groups that had received trafficking training were more knowledgeable than the others about the ways in which they could check the legitimacy of a job offer. Participants in anti-trafficking programs were more familiar with the work of nongovernmental organizations at home and abroad and were more likely to seek out legal consultations to assist them in evaluating job offers. In Romania, this did not appear to be the case. In Ukraine, the one group that had mostly not received anti-trafficking training was notably less knowledgeable in this area than the groups that had received training. This group demonstrated a tendency to rely on informal mechanisms such as the help of family to check out job offers, whereas the other groups were more likely to make sure a company was licensed, to review the contract with a lawyer, or to investigate the company on the Internet. Groups in both Russia and Ukraine that received training also knew a variety of ways to protect themselves before going overseas and demonstrated a heightened awareness about institutions available overseas to which they could turn for assistance, relying less on family and friends and more on local institutions—the police, the embassy, NGOs, shelters, hotlines, and so forth. No significant correlations were noted in a group’s interest in going overseas and their knowledge of trafficking or their exposure to trafficking training, which may help to mitigate the concern that informing young people about how to migrate safely may give them a false sense of security and encourage them to accept positions overseas. It should be noted, however, that the FGDs were limited in their ability to measure this accurately. Care should be taken in planning the content of safe migration programs so that they do not inadvertently encourage migration by giving potential migrants a false sense that they can prepare for any eventuality.

The FGDs in Romania had significantly different results. Groups of young women in Romania who had received anti-trafficking training as part of a six-month program for at-risk women and another for teenage mothers did not appear particularly knowledgeable about how to protect themselves before or after going overseas. Twelve of 14 women were interested in work abroad, yet knew only informal methods for finding such work, and they mentioned few steps they could take before leaving to protect themselves—none of them mentioned checking their visas, getting contact information for NGOs or embassies overseas,

keeping a hidden copy of their passport, leaving a copy with family, or the like. The researcher noted differences between education levels of participants: those who were less educated demonstrated reduced knowledge and understanding of trafficking and more acceptance of gender stereotypes and gender violence. FGDs in Romania with institutionalized young women with mental disabilities showed similar results. They were aware of trafficking and had some training on the subject. However, their main concerns were about having a passport and documents; they appeared to know very little about how to check the legitimacy of job offers or to seek assistance abroad.

These FGDs cannot be said to evaluate the effectiveness of school training programs, as they were not conducted before and after such interventions and each group was in no way homogenous. Also, in Romania, the participants in the focus group discussions were young women who were already at risk because of their family situations and life circumstances; in Russia and Ukraine, the participants were drawn from the general populations at their schools and universities. However, the FGDs do indicate that while school training programs may be helpful in providing students with information, they are not all equally effective in doing so. The assessment was not able to evaluate the content of the materials provided in the training programs. Implementers should evaluate the needs and capabilities of their target audience to adapt the program accordingly. Groups who are already vulnerable due to lower education levels and specific life experiences may require longer or more-tailored programming.

Because of their limited geographic coverage, as well as limited funding, NGOs have only been able to reach out to a very small percentage of young people. In an attempt to integrate trafficking awareness programming into the national school system, and thereby increase coverage to all students in the country, LaStrada Ukraine produced a manual for school teachers on trafficking, as well as an accompanying video with six 10-minute films, and a collection of lesson plans for their use (K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004). LaStrada felt that cooperation with the government helped to improve the materials because the government is conservative and carefully checked the information in the materials to ensure that it would not have a negative effect on the children. LaStrada distributed 27,000 copies to the Ministry of Education for further distribution to every secondary school in the country. Unfortunately, LaStrada discovered that distribution was difficult and that many teachers never received the materials. It was not clear how well these programs have been integrated into the school curricula.

In Russia, the Miramed Institute, along with its local partners, has also provided training for school children and orphans (J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). In one region of Russia, the curriculum it developed was incorporated into the middle school curriculum. As a result of this success, Miramed received a follow-up grant to develop an educational theater program. This has been taped and is now used for educational programs around the country. Miramed's program for orphans is a longer, more in-depth intervention. The curriculum is conducted over a two-year period and includes segments on social adaptation, life skills, trafficking prevention, human rights, self-esteem building, HIV/AIDS and prostitution, sex education, and more. The program has been conducted for more than 1,500 orphans. Miramed is currently assessing the impact of the program and believes that orphans involved in the program are more successful upon leaving the institutions than other

orphans; however, at the time of this assessment, data to objectively demonstrate this were not available (J. Engel, personal communication, September 16, 2004).

**Journalist Training:** As an indirect way of getting information to the public, or raising the issue for advocacy, many programs target journalists for trafficking training. After such training, many providers report increases in the numbers of articles and stories being published or broadcast on trafficking as well as more sensitivity to victims, better protection of their identity, and reductions in sensationalism (M. McDonough, personal communication, August 17, 2004; A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; R. Pojman, personal communication, August 2, 2004; C. Luca, personal communication, August 20, 2004; IOM Croatia, 2003; Arnold and Doni, 2002). Most of these training programs for journalists are implemented as part of larger trafficking projects or through media development programs.

In Tajikistan, however, the International Research & Exchanges Board (IREX) implements a media program that focuses solely on the issue of trafficking (M. McDonough, personal communication, August 17, 2004). Although this program uses similar techniques to other journalist training programs, it seems to be unique in the scope of programming being provided to journalists. Journalists and their editors receive a two-day training program that includes both topical information about trafficking and information about journalistic tools that can be used to report on trafficking. This is then followed several months later by a second training in which some of the materials produced by the trainees are critiqued for effectiveness and used as case studies for the training. The program held a contest to encourage good reporting on trafficking, and includes a grant component for developing resources for local journalists to report effectively on trafficking. IREX found that reporting on trafficking increased substantially during the first half of the program. Prior to the program start, estimates of coverage of the issue ranged from none in some areas of the country to, at most, one to two stories per month. During the first part of the program, some 33 articles, television programs, and radio shows on the topic were produced and published. IREX also noted significant improvement in the quality of the coverage, with journalists citing more sources, refraining from judging or stigmatizing the victims, using better interviewing techniques that protect the identity of victims, and choosing more appropriate and less provocative photos to accompany pieces (M. McDonough, personal communication, August 17, 2004).

Winrock International also found that after a two-day journalism training program in Ukraine, not only was there a marked increase in the number of articles about trafficking, but the reporting was also more accurate, less sensationalistic, and more sensitive to the victims (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). USAID staff has also found that longer, two- or three-day training was more effective than shorter, half- to full-day training (R. Pojman, personal communication, August 2, 2004). Internews and IREX in Ukraine have also encouraged coverage of trafficking through the use of special journalism grants and prizes (T. O'Conner, S. Folger, and K. Kvurt, personal communication, September 2, 2004). They caution, however, that this can corrode freedom of the press as it encourages media coverage of issues to follow the money. In addition, they note that in encouraging journalists to cover this issue, providers need to be cautious: investigating trafficking can endanger the lives of journalists and their sources, as well as victims if their identities are not effectively

masked. They noted too that media training can be provided to NGOs and government to teach them how to more effectively communicate with the media in order to encourage the media to cover the topic. Training covers such topics as how and when to write press releases and helps to develop the capacity of the NGOs while promoting coverage of trafficking without financial influence. Miramed Institute in Russia also noted the importance of training that encourages NGOs and the media to work together, encouraging media to seek NGOs as experts, and teaching NGOs what kinds of information are of interest to and needed by media (J. Engels, personal communication, September 15, 2004).

**Investigative Journalism:** Some Missions have supported investigative journalism under the independent media programs. For example, the USAID Mission in Albania supports a television program with a format similar to “60 Minutes” that investigates corruption, including its impact on trafficking in persons. Under its regional media program, IREX has supported several investigative journalism pieces investigating corruption and trafficking in persons. IREX has also supported the creation of a network of investigative journalists within South East Europe who continue to examine trafficking in persons.

**Training Government Officials:** Training government officials can raise their knowledge and understanding of the issue as well as their interest in taking actions to combat trafficking. When combined with training of NGOs, it can also result in increased cooperation between the NGOs and the government. In Russia, Miramed Institute and its partners spent a year planning a coordinated media campaign to take place simultaneously across the country (J. Engels, personal communication, September 15, 2004). The planning included a media and NGO workshop where media and NGOs learned how to work together, and workshops and planning meetings for all stakeholders, including representatives of a variety of government entities, from city officials to teachers to police. As a result of the planning efforts, not only did the awareness-raising campaign go as planned, but it also resulted in increased interest in trafficking in the community and continued efforts by local government and the community to fight trafficking. For example, St. Petersburg city government continued efforts in schools and helped manage the hotline. In Kazan, law enforcement efforts have developed in coordination with the Government of Turkey, a destination country for trafficking from Kazan. In some countries where significant training of government officials has taken place, one problem noted was that frequent staff turnover can erode the positive effects of the training (UNICEF, 2004).

**Reducing Trafficking:** Although awareness-raising programs clearly do succeed in increasing knowledge and understanding of the issue, it is less clear if increasing people’s knowledge has changed people’s behavior and reduced trafficking. There is both evidence that it does and evidence that it does not. For example, a study of trafficking victims in the region found that the level of education of Romanian victims declined, while the education levels of Moldovan victims rose during the 2002–2003 reporting period (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). However, the average ages of both remained constant, so age cannot account for this change in education levels of victims. The authors of the study state that local NGOs attribute this change to the success of intensive education campaigns that have taken place in Romanian high schools, thereby reducing the number of victims who have attended high school. In Moldova, they claim, the work in schools had not yet expanded beyond the urban

centers and, therefore, had not yet been able to reach the majority of high school children (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). This study also found that there has been a marked increase in the number of people recruited by someone known and trusted and a decrease in those recruited by advertisements. The authors believe that this may be attributable to the success of early awareness-raising campaigns warning people about bogus job offers being advertised (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003).

In Albania, it is believed that the awareness-raising campaigns, together with other countertrafficking actions, have led to a reduction in trafficking (Limanowska, 2003; Renton, 2001). There has been a noticeable decrease in trafficking in general but a perceived increase in trafficking among rural populations and ethnic “Egyptian” and Roma populations (Limanowska, 2003; Renton, 2001). It is believed that this results from the awareness-raising campaigns being targeted to the general public and not specifically to ethnic minorities, who may not yet have been exposed to the anti-trafficking messages seen by the general population (Limanowska, 2003). In rural areas, people have less access to television and are less educated (Renton, 2001).

**Changing Behavior:** It is important to keep in mind that the results reported above cannot be directly linked to awareness-raising activities. Linkages between the awareness-raising campaigns and reductions in numbers of persons trafficked are indirect and assumed. Studies in many countries seem to indicate that increased knowledge and understanding of the risks of trafficking do not necessarily decrease a person’s interest in going abroad, even under risky circumstances. Although those at risk may know the dangers of trafficking and understand the risks of going abroad, they do not believe that they are personally at risk (Women for Future, 2003; MSI, 2003; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). Studies in both Georgia and the Baltic States demonstrate that the public often blames the victims in some way for being trafficked, either from ignorance or gullibility (Women for Future, 2003; IOM Helsinki, 2002). In blaming the victim, people are able to continue to believe that it will not happen to them (for they are smarter, more careful, less trusting, etc.). Increased awareness of trafficking, therefore, does not necessarily lead to a decreased interest in working abroad.

However, although knowledge of the dangers of migration and trafficking does not necessarily decrease interest in going abroad, it does appear to lead to other changes in behavior. Surveys of young women in Ukraine show that they have become less trusting of all sources who provide jobs abroad, decreasing from 20 percent in 2001 who believed sources could generally be trusted to 5.6 percent in 2003 (LaStrada Ukraine, n.d.). Numerous practitioners in the region point to increased interest in information about how to go abroad safely following awareness-raising campaigns (H. Fedkovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004). LaStrada in Ukraine has found that in recent years, callers to the hotline have become far more sophisticated (K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004). They are more aware of the potential risks involved in migration and more knowledgeable about visa requirements. They are far more likely to call the hotline for information about laws in the destination country and about organizations to which they can turn for assistance in the destination country. LaStrada believes that this is a direct result of the awareness-raising campaigns that have taken place in recent years.

**Increasing Interest in Migration:** There is some indication that increasing people's knowledge of trafficking and of the risks of going abroad can have the unintended effect of increasing their interest in going abroad. IOM Ukraine found that some participants in a focus group discussion on trafficking increased their interest in going abroad after the discussions (IOM Ukraine, 1998). Similarly, Winrock International found that knowledge of trafficking did not necessarily change behavior and noted an increase in interest in migration among teens in orphanages and in secondary schools following the first of a series of trainings designed to increase awareness and understanding of the dangers of trafficking (Rudd, 2001; Rudd, 2002). A large number (approximately 20 percent) of the teens studied indicated that one reason they attended the training was to obtain information about how to work abroad legally. In the IOM study, they noted that one factor preventing people from looking for work abroad is fear (fear of living overseas, fear of being deceived). By attending trainings and discussions about trafficking, those who are considering work abroad as a viable solution to their problems might feel better informed and therefore better able to avoid or handle problems that may arise, and, therefore, less afraid to go, resulting in the unintended outcome of increasing their likelihood of migrating.

In FGDs conducted for this study, however, no differences in interest in migrating were noted between those who were informed about trafficking and safe migration and those who were not. However, these discussions were limited in scope, and the results are by no means conclusive. (See Section 3.5 for more information on the results of the FGDs). During the course of the research, the researchers also, by chance, met four women who had been trafficked from Ukraine. None of these women had participated in any trafficking prevention activities prior to her departure. Of course, this is too limited a group to be informative, but one cannot help but wonder when meeting them if they might have been spared their fate if they had been exposed to safe migration information before leaving.

Increased interest in migration should not be confused with increased risk of being trafficked. By being more informed, these potential migrants may be able to reduce their chances of being trafficked within the migration process. As noted above, implementers of countertrafficking programs have noted an increased number of requests for information about migrating safely and find that those who have been trained are savvier about the various kinds of visas available and whether they allow the holder to legally work or not; and they are more likely to try to check out the validity of job offers. See Section 3.5 for a more in-depth discussion of safe migration programs.

**Restricting Freedoms:** Another possible unintended consequence of awareness-raising campaigns is an increase in restrictions on women's and girls' freedoms as a result of fear of trafficking, abduction, and rape. In Albania, researchers found that parents in rural areas where children have to walk long distances to attend high school are afraid to let their daughters go to school. As a result, school attendance by girls in rural areas significantly declined, and many young women reported that they no longer went out in the evenings (Renton, 2001). It is not unreasonable to assume that there may have been similar consequences elsewhere, but these were not documented in the reports reviewed or interviews conducted.

**Scare Tactics:** Information about the content of public information campaigns was usually not provided in the documentation that was reviewed. In some cases, cover documents included a picture of what campaign materials looked like, and in some cases these materials showed disturbing images. It is not clear from the documentation if these “scary” types of materials are more or less effective than materials that promote a more positive or neutral image. Scary images tell only part of the story and it is not enough for those at risk to know only about the dangers and possible negative consequences (N. Coan, personal communication, August 17, 2004). Information must be provided that can minimize risks. Some implementers have noted, though, that those at risk will not associate themselves with the images in the “scary” materials and therefore may not read them or pay attention to them (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004). They believe that more positive or neutral images will be more attractive to those at risk and therefore more effective. The risk of using more positive imagery is, of course, the unintended consequence of potentially increasing interest in migrating abroad.

However, there are also potentially negative unintended consequences of using frightening imagery. LaStrada Ukraine believes that scary or provocative images actually mislead people about trafficking, resulting in the belief that trafficking can only be for the purpose of sexual exploitation. This may result in other migrants not recognizing or trying to mitigate their own risks when migrating. In Romania, participants in the focus group discussions conducted for this assessment demonstrated an unusual pattern of planning to comply with traffickers until they could plan an escape. They were convinced that any opposition would result in death or mutilation. The researcher in Romania believes that this may be due to fear of violence stemming from scare tactics used in many public awareness campaigns.

**Counter-Ads:** IOM throughout the region, LaStrada in Ukraine, and Miramed Institute in Russia have begun to use “counter-ads” in newspapers that advertise job offers abroad (F. Larsson and W. Maxwell, personal communication, September 1, 2004; K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004; J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004; R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). These ads are designed to get the attention of readers of advertisements for jobs abroad, and to encourage them to call hotlines for more information about how to check the legitimacy of job offers. These calls have attracted a lot of attention and have resulted in many calls for assistance and information about overseas migration. However, they need to be coordinated carefully with implementers of hotline services to ensure that the hotlines are prepared for the influx of calls and to be sure that the advertisements are not misleading about the information that is available through the hotline. Otherwise, hotlines can be overwhelmed by unrelated phone calls.

### 3.2 EMPLOYMENT PROGRAMS

Employment programs aim to address what is perceived as the primary root cause of trafficking—poverty and lack of local employment opportunities. (It should be noted that some studies show that it is not abject poverty that leads to trafficking, but a perceived sense of poverty held by those at risk and their families. In reality, they are not necessarily any

poorer than families without young women who are at risk [Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003; LaStrada Ukraine, 2004a]. Similarly, some implementers and studies also note that it is not always a lack of job opportunities that push people abroad but a perceived lack of opportunities even where opportunities may exist [A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003].) Many studies demonstrate this lack, or perceived lack, of economic opportunities pushes people to look for work beyond their home communities. In fact, an IOM study in the Ukraine found that 42 percent of the women interviewed who had intentions to migrate would reconsider if they found a good job at home (1998). At the Winrock Center in Zhytomyr, one-quarter of participants indicated that they had intended to go abroad but changed their minds since participating in the program, and another quarter remain undecided (Winrock Ukraine, 2003b). Winrock International staff believe that most of the women who participate in their programs would rather stay in Ukraine than go abroad. An IREX follow-up survey showed that nearly half of the program participants surveyed were not likely to go abroad (IREX, 2004b). Because a pre-program survey was not taken, it is not clear how these same women would have responded prior to receiving the training—would they have been more or less likely to go abroad? IREX also found, however, that women who received job skills training were more confident about their economic future than those who received other kinds of training. It should be mentioned, however, that many employed people also seek opportunities abroad. Often people's expectations for their life and career are not met by the available opportunities at home. In a survey of trafficked women in Ukraine, 51 percent had been employed prior to being trafficked (LaStrada Ukraine, 2004a).

**Job Skills:** Many of the programs designed to increase employment opportunities seem to be quite successful in doing just that. The training offered at the centers is often highly sought after, and, if in fields in demand by the private sector, can lead to high rates of employment in program participants (Blumberg and Shved, 2002; MSI, 2003). Based on information provided from follow-up with a selected sample of program participants, ATTO estimates that 43 percent of participants in Winrock International's job skills and technical skills training program in Ukraine have found employment.<sup>3</sup> Data from follow-up surveys of IREX's partner programs indicated that 33.3 percent of those interviewed had found temporary or permanent employment since the interventions (which included a range of different interventions). Of those who had received job skills training, approximately 40 percent had found temporary or permanent employment, and most of these women report that the program played a significant role in helping them find the job (IREX, 2004b). In successful programs, job skill offerings are tailored to the needs of the private sector to better ensure availability of jobs after the training, and they are tailored to the interests of the target group to ensure their interest in those jobs after training is complete (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; Blumberg and Shved, 2002). IREX found that some of its programs in Romania and Moldova, in which there were employment guarantees with local employers, had particularly high post-program employment rates. In Moldova, 84 percent

<sup>3</sup> A 2002 evaluation of the Winrock program cited 13 percent of participants finding employment (Blumberg and Shved, 2002). However, Winrock International staff indicate that the calculations used by the evaluators were incorrect: because of the large number of program participants, Winrock International only follows up with one-third of the participants. The numbers of participants they report having found jobs are from this third of the total who received training. As a result, the evaluators underestimated the percentage (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004).

had found temporary or permanent employment; in Romania, the numbers trained were far smaller, but 100 percent had found temporary employment (N. Coan, personal communication, August 17, 2004; IREX, 2004b).

From the information available, it appears that programs designed to increase economic opportunities for those at risk for trafficking are an effective prevention strategy if they are targeted to the at-risk community, are located in areas where jobs are available, target employment in sectors of interest to those at risk, and are designed to meet the human resource needs of employers in that region, and preferably even linked directly with those employers.

It should be noted, however, that there are still those who are unable to find work even after attending employment programs. For others, there simply may not be any jobs available in their area, so that job skills training programs will not have the desired impact. And still others will prefer to go abroad even with employment options at home. In a study of young Romanian women, 45 percent of respondents stated that they would prefer a job abroad even if they were offered a job in Romania; 73 percent of those deemed to be at higher risk of trafficking preferred to go abroad (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). As a result, many of the IREX partner programs, as well as Winrock Ukraine's training courses, include information about how to migrate safely (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; IREX, 2004b). According to one of Winrock's Ukrainian NGO partners, Successful Woman, jobs skills programs also act as a carrot, drawing people into the center where they can then also provide them with information about trafficking, human rights, crisis counseling and the like (E. Mykytas, personal communication, September 4, 2004). Other implementers have commented that the centers provide a safe way for women to seek counseling—through the cover of skills training programs (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004).

**Entrepreneurship:** A mid-program evaluation of IREX's programs in five European countries indicated that job training programs were more successful in meeting the needs of the target group than entrepreneurship programs. The evaluation found that the entrepreneurship programs appealed to older women who were already in stable life circumstances and were therefore at less risk of trafficking (MSI, 2003). Those at most risk for trafficking were least suited to starting and managing their own businesses. Implementers of Winrock International's employment programs had similar opinions—that the group most at risk for trafficking was least suited to an entrepreneurship program aimed at adult women (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). However, a number of organizations continue to implement entrepreneurship programs for those at risk of being trafficked. They believe that with careful screening and assistance, some of those at risk can open and manage successful businesses (H. Yasnytsky, personal communication, September 10, 2004).

Not all people in similar economic circumstances will migrate for work. One study in Ukraine found that financial status and employment were not defining factors in motivating women to work abroad (Ukrainian Institute, 2001). There are clearly other factors at play that can push people into the hands of traffickers or keep them at home, including quality of community life (MSI, 2003; IOM Romania, 2001); quality and stability of domestic life/domestic violence (Minnesota Advocates, 2000a; Rudd, 2001; Ukrainian Institute, 2001;

ILO/IPEC Ukraine, 2003; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003; Renton, 2001); strength of family ties/quality of communication between parents and children (IOM Ukraine, 1998; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003); lack of education or economic opportunities as a result of discrimination (Renton, 2001); cultural acceptance of child labor (Renton, 2001); fear of migration or deception (IOM Ukraine, 1998); knowledge of successful migration stories (Minnesota Advocates, 2000a; Lazaroiu & Alexandru, 2003); and a desire for independence or adventure (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). Program interventions targeted to addressing these issues could be effective in preventing trafficking. Although the issues came up repeatedly in research and reports, the available documentation includes few examples of interventions directed at these issues. Those that were found are discussed below.

### **3.3 EMPOWERMENT PROGRAMS/IMPROVED COMMUNITY LIFE**

Many of those at risk of being trafficked are too young for employment programs. They would be better served by remaining in school, continuing their education, and participating more in community life. There are a number of programs trying to address these factors in an effort to keep young people at home and prevent trafficking. Programs offer training sessions in schools and summer camps and through other innovative ways of reaching young people. A Winrock International program in the Russian Far East teaches career counseling and how to manage money, among other topics. The program emphasizes building “strong character, self-confidence, leadership, respect for human rights, responsibilities and dignity” among participants (Winrock Russia, 2004: 2). Winrock also brings in professionals from a variety of fields to explain what they do in order to give the children a realistic understanding of what to expect in a job, and has made an effort to get parents involved through parent-teacher associations. Implementers of these programs believe that more children have continued their education rather than look for work abroad as a result of their participation (K. Quinn, personal communication, July 29, 2004). This program is part of USAID’s new Incorporating Values grants, which also includes a theater program in Romania and a puppet theater in Russia (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). Because these grants are relatively new, their impact cannot yet be assessed.

Terre des Hommes (TDH) in Albania runs summer camps for at-risk children that combine recreational programming with an opportunity for intervention teams to work with at-risk children and to prepare them for integration into school. Community members have commented to TDH that, as a result of these camps, there are fewer kids on the street; there are also reports that some children are refusing to work the streets because they would rather attend camp (J. Brogan, personal communication, August 1, 2004). This approach is also seen to be a good way to access ethnic minorities whose children are less likely to attend schools, where other prevention programs take place. In Albania, many children who do not attend school have been coming to the summer camp programs (A. Giantris, personal communication, September 15, 2004). More information is needed to objectively assess the impact of these programs on trafficking prevention, but they appear promising, especially for a younger target audience.

The Academy for Educational Development in Ukraine also supported countertrafficking summer camps for at-risk youth (T. Trischuk, L. Kaolos, and I. Konchenkova, personal

communication, September 9, 2004). Summer camps included a variety of recreational and educational programming, including leadership and trafficking awareness. Although it was not clear from the materials available what direct impact these camps had on prevention of trafficking among those who attended, it did have another, possibly greater effect. The camps themselves were only able to accommodate approximately 350 youth. However, during one of the summer camps, the organizers and children developed a theater performance on trafficking. They have since performed this play throughout the country to more than 10,000 people. As noted above, dramatic presentations of trafficking can have an important awareness-raising impact.

### **3.4 CRISIS PREVENTION/DOMESTIC VIOLENCE MITIGATION PROGRAMS**

Many studies point to a link between domestic violence and trafficking—or, more precisely, the desire to migrate (Limanowska, 2003; Hughes, 2002; Rudd, 2002; IOM Romania, 2001; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003; ILO/IPEC Ukraine, 2003; Minnesota Advocates, 2000a). An IOM study of returned victims in Moldova found that 80 percent had been victims of domestic violence before being trafficked (Limanowska, 2003). Interestingly, in a separate survey of the general population, 22 percent of female respondents reported having experienced domestic violence at some point in their lives (Minnesota Advocates, 2000b). Although these statistics are not comparable, the studies likely having used completely different methodologies, it does point to a potentially higher prevalence of domestic violence among victims of trafficking. A survey of trafficked women in Ukraine found that 33 percent had experienced violence or abuse in the home, and 3 percent stated that the reason they went overseas was in an attempt to flee from domestic violence (LaStrada Ukraine, 2004a). Victims of domestic violence may be more vulnerable to trafficking for many reasons: they may be more willing to accept risky job offers in order to escape the violence and abuse they face at home (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003); they may have left home at an earlier age, disrupting school attendance and lowering their job prospects at home (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003); the regular abuse and violence suffered may have eroded their self-confidence, making them more malleable victims; or, having faced repeated violence at home, they may be more accepting of it and less likely to try to resist or escape.

Limited information was available through the document review or from the field research to allow ATTO to properly assess the impact of programs addressing this issue. Winrock International's program in Ukraine attempted to address the issue through the provision of legal advice as well as assistance in mediating or litigating cases. According to Winrock's partner NGO, West Ukrainian Center "Women's Perspectives," in a survey of 500 women, 8 percent wanted to go abroad in order to escape from domestic violence, alcoholism, or narcotics use (L. Maksymovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004). Unfortunately, the center does not track information such as clients' desire to go abroad before and after the interventions, and believes that it would be very difficult to do so because clients do not always keep in touch with the center after their consultations. Winrock also found that many women's problems could be solved by increasing awareness of their rights. Women may come to the centers seeking information about working abroad because they need money to support their child. They learn that the father of the child can be forced

to pay child support. If the woman is able to succeed in getting support from the father, she may be less likely to consider working abroad. Winrock also helps women with labor issues to retain their jobs at home rather than migrate overseas. Unfortunately, concrete data have not been collected that would indicate the number of women who have changed their minds about migration as a result of the legal consultations they received (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). Similar programs are being implemented in other countries, for example, through Chemonic's Legal Literacy Project in Albania and Winrock International's program in Uzbekistan (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004).

**Shelters:** There is an assumption that the provision of alternative housing for victims of domestic violence would negate their need to go abroad to escape violence at home. However, more information is needed to assess whether shelters have helped to prevent trafficking or migration of women at risk. Some caution should be taken in assuming that shelters for victims of domestic violence can be integrated with shelters for victims of trafficking. Though many of their service needs may be similar, mixing the two populations can be problematic. Implementing organizations in Ukraine and Bulgaria found that victims of domestic violence often come to shelters with children and may not want themselves or their children exposed to victims of trafficking—towards whom there is still much stigma attached as a result of their involvement in prostitution. However, maintaining a separate shelter for trafficked women is not practical in smaller cities or places where there is not a constant stream of victims seeking shelter (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004).

### 3.5 SAFE MIGRATION PROGRAMS/JOB-VETTING ACTIVITIES

In a study in Ukraine, IOM found that fully 59 percent of respondents from the general population had an interest in going abroad for temporary employment, while 26.6 percent had an interest in emigrating permanently (IOM Ukraine, 1998). A more recent poll, conducted in 2004, found that although one in three Ukrainians were interested in moving abroad, only 37 percent of 18-year-olds wanted to stay in Ukraine (UNICEF, 2004). Similarly, in Romania, one study of young, single women found that more than 75 percent would be willing to work abroad (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). In Russia, one study found that fully 60 percent of respondents had either found or were looking for work abroad; another study showed that in the year 2000, 40 percent of female respondents would consider working abroad, though only 4 percent were actively seeking such work, up from 30 percent in 1996, when only 2 percent of female respondents were actively looking for such work (Tyuryukanova, 2002). With such interest in working or moving overseas, it is no wonder that there is great demand in the region for information about working or traveling abroad (Hughes, 2002). In the Baltic States, nearly 30 percent of respondents from the general public thought that the provision of information about legal employment opportunities abroad would go a long way to combating trafficking (IOM Helsinki, 2002).

It is important to note that many migrants are successful, and people in sending countries are frequently exposed to successful migration stories. In many of the focus group discussions conducted for this assessment, young people mentioned stories of successful migrants whom

they knew personally. Migrants may also exaggerate their success and even send more money home than they can afford which perpetuates the myth of riches to be earned abroad (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). A recent study in Ukraine tried to identify differences between successful migrants and trafficking victims (UNICEF, 2004). It was found that successful migrants were more likely to organize and pay for their own travel and had personal social networks in the destination country, which helped them to find their own employment. Trafficking victims were more likely to rely on intermediaries to pay for and organize their travel and to assist them in finding employment. It is important to address this issue in discussions about trafficking in order to be credible to the target audience.

**Job-Vetting Services:** Hotlines are available in many countries of the region. In most places, hotlines provide a range of information: about the dangers of trafficking and *modus operandi* of traffickers, about how to work abroad legally, about marriage to foreigners, about services for victims of trafficking, and about assistance in finding missing family or friends (Arnold and Doni, 2002; IOM Kazakhstan, 2003; Blumberg and Shved, 2002; Wyss, 2003). Hotlines appear to be popular ways of getting information. Between late 1997 and 2003, LaStrada in Ukraine received 17,500 calls (UNICEF, 2004). Also in Ukraine, but in different regions, Winrock International's partners' hotlines received more than 68,000 calls over the life of the project (UNICEF, 2004). Many hotlines report that the large majority of callers request information about legal migration for employment: 58 percent of calls to hotlines in Kazakhstan and Uzbekistan were on related topics (IOM Kazakhstan, 2003); in one year, 75 percent of the 4,851 calls to LaStrada's hotline in Ukraine were about working abroad (UNICEF, 2004); and in Moldova, 75 percent of calls to IOM-funded hotlines are inquiries about how to find work abroad (Wyss, 2003). Similarly, in Russia, Miramed Institute partners report that the vast majority of calls to their centers are inquiries about working abroad (Engel, 2004). Clearly, there is a great interest in the hotlines, as demonstrated by the large volume of callers. Because calls to hotlines are usually anonymous, follow-up with callers is not possible. Therefore, it is difficult, if not impossible, to directly measure the impact of the hotlines on prevention of trafficking. However, providers cite the increases in the number of calls to the hotlines about how to safely work abroad as a sign of the effectiveness of both hotlines and awareness-raising campaigns in preventing trafficking. Awareness-raising campaigns have alerted the population to the risks of working abroad and, as a result, though still interested in working abroad, people are now calling hotlines in an attempt to avoid those risks. It is important that hotline staff be trained to handle these calls, as they could do more harm than good if not properly prepared. To this end, LaStrada Ukraine developed a manual for use by hotline operators and has trained operators throughout the country in its use.

Trafficking prevention centers receive similar requests for information about working abroad. More than 20 percent of teenage respondents indicated that they were attending a Winrock International job skills and anti-trafficking training seminar in order to learn more about legal migration (Rudd, 2001). Because economic empowerment programs do not lead to the employment of 100% of program participants, and because many at-risk women will still go abroad either because of lack of options or for the adventure and glamour of living abroad, many of these programs try to incorporate safe migration information in their job

skills and empowerment training programs (E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004; A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; K. Quinn, personal communication, July 29, 2004). As a result, women who are offered jobs will often bring the job offers and contracts to the center to have them reviewed by a lawyer and to check out the validity of the companies making the offers (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). They have uncovered many false offers as a result, and prevented many women from going abroad under false pretense. Unfortunately, implementers have not been keeping statistics that would enable them to quantify how many women have been helped in this way.

Additionally, some centers provide information to women interested in going abroad about legitimate companies and au pair services offering such opportunities. They have produced flyers and booklets with information on safe migration and where to go for help, and in the training sessions women put together their own personal safety plans (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). A study conducted by UNICEF in Moldova showed that most children interviewed knew about the dangers of trafficking associated with working abroad, but few knew how to protect themselves. However, those children who had participated in an anti-trafficking training knew several steps they could take to investigate the validity of job offers (cited in Limanowska, 2003). Ninety percent of IREX participants received some sort of safe migration information or training, and those who did receive this training felt far more confident in their ability to avoid being trafficked than those who did not (IREX, 2004b).

**Resistance and Escape:** A report by the International Helsinki Federation (IHF) noted that most victims do not seek assistance or report to the police because of negative impressions of the police in their country of origin, distrust, fear of immigration violations, shame, or fear of reprisals from traffickers (IHF, 2000b). Similarly an International Labour Organization/International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (ILO/IPEC) study found that child victims were also reluctant to contact the police because they did not believe that the police would assist them and/or because of fear (ILO/IPEC Ukraine, 2003). However, in conversations with a local NGO in Russia, one researcher was told of two incidents in which the trafficked women were released when they threatened to contact the police or indicated that their friends would contact the police if they did not hear from them (Hughes, 2002). An NGO providing safe migration information to at-risk groups described a situation in which a young woman who had been through their training and was going abroad for what she thought was a vacation sensed by the conversation among her purported travel companions that they were going to be forced into prostitution. She pretended to be sick and managed to run away while they were still in transit (Minnesota Advocates, 2000a). In another example, clients of the NGO West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives” in Ukraine had provided advice to two girls who had been offered jobs as dancers in Japan through a Polish company. As a result of this advice, the girls requested and received roundtrip tickets and refused to relinquish their passports on arrival. Soon after arriving, they met other girls from Ukraine and Russia whom they believed had been forced into prostitution. The girls ran away and used their tickets to return to Ukraine. The company contacted them and asked them to return the money for the travel, but the lawyer from the center wrote a letter outlining the numerous contract violations that had taken place and refusing to give back the money. The company

has not contacted the girls again (UNICEF, 2004; H. Fedkovych, personal communication, September 7, 2004).

Although these tactics may not work in all cases, these stories demonstrate that trafficked women may at times be able to help extricate themselves from their situations. A study of victims of trafficking in Ukraine found that 40 percent escaped by themselves (Winrock Ukraine, 2004b). This highlights the importance of empowering women with this idea prior to their departure and helping them to overcome their fears and mistrust. A study of the general public in the Baltic States revealed that 40 percent of respondents thought there should be more information available about what to do if one falls victim to traffickers (IOM Helsinki, 2002). Learning how to protect oneself, building self-esteem, and building confidence in authorities who can assist them are important steps in ensuring that those who do go abroad and find that they have been deceived or trafficked will stand a better chance of extricating themselves. This needs to be handled with caution, as women, children, and men could be brutally assaulted by traffickers if they resist. Similarly, at-risk groups need to be cautioned that resistance may not always be possible. There are indications that traffickers may keep victims drugged in order to ensure their compliance, and in some cases, a victim, through repeated abuse, may lose her will to fight and may even come to identify with those exploiting her (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004).

Little information was available in the document review to assess the impact of the job-vetting services or safe migration programs on the prevention of trafficking. It is not clear, for example, what impact the information provided by hotlines has on callers' subsequent behavior. Nor is it clear if women and children who have been previously provided with safe migration information and confidence-building training are more likely to extricate themselves from traffickers than others. This is an important area for further investigation. However, what the documentation does indicate is that awareness-raising programs, although they do not decrease people's interest in migration, may have a more subtle impact on behavior. With raised awareness of trafficking and a way to check out the legitimacy of job offers, potential migrants appear to be willing to take the additional steps necessary to attempt to migrate safely. Hotline usage goes up dramatically when tied to an information campaign that advertises its services (IOM Croatia, 2003; Engel, 2001). Therefore, advertising these services and linking them with awareness-raising campaigns can be an effective outreach tool to the at-risk community.

Given the current economic reality in most of the sending countries in the region, it will be some time before we can realistically expect that most of those at risk will be able to find gainful employment at home. Therefore, even with awareness-raising campaigns increasing people's knowledge of the risks and realities of migrating, and even with programs to increase the target group's job skills, many will probably still seek opportunities abroad. Therefore, programs that help provide information on migrating safely are a necessary ingredient in the trafficking prevention mix.

### **3.6 DEMAND REDUCTION PROGRAMS**

Most trafficking prevention programs focus on the supply side of trafficking—finding ways to reduce migration or making the migrating population better informed about risks and protection. Little has been done to reduce the demand for the services of trafficked people. Besides victims and traffickers, there is another category of persons involved in trafficking—the end-users, clients, and employers of trafficked persons. Though few, some programs have targeted users of women trafficked for prostitution—who may or may not know that the women have been trafficked. No examples could be found of programs targeted toward the employers of people trafficked for other purposes.

**Awareness-Raising:** IOM conducted an awareness-raising campaign aimed at men buying sex in Kosovo. The objective of the campaign was to intensify condemnation of trafficking in the international community, to make the use of trafficked women unacceptable, and to alert the international community that frequenting bars or brothels was, in essence, supporting trafficking. As a result of the campaign and international pressure, the United Nations Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) developed a code of conduct for its staff (Araujo-Forlot, 2002). Other reports indicated that there had been a decline in the percentage of brothel clients who are foreign men (SIDA, 2003). It was not clear, however, if this decline was due to the impact of the campaign or to other factors, such as reductions in UN forces. There was not enough information available in the document review to determine the cause. Similarly, the North Atlantic Treaty Organization (NATO) in 2004 created a zero-tolerance policy as a result of the involvement of international peacekeeping forces and contractors with trafficking in Bosnia (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004).

**Criminalization:** In Sweden, a law came into force in 1999 that criminalized the purchase of sex. Implementation of the law was swift and, as a result, there has been a reduction in demand for prostituted women, a decline in the numbers of prostituted women, and indications that traffickers are no longer interested in Sweden as a market. It should be noted that this law had broad support in Sweden and that police took firm actions (Ekberg, 2003). Careful analysis would need to be done before attempting to duplicate this law in other countries. In many countries, implementation could be hampered by a lack of public support or by police corruption; as a result, the law could have unintended negative consequences. Even in Sweden, it is possible that prostitution has not declined but has simply moved underground (Viall, 2001; Kilvington, et al., 2001), resulting in worse conditions and less access to assistance for the prostituted women. Similarly, Swedish users of prostitutes may now be going overseas where laws or law enforcement are less stringent; some NGOs in Russia (especially in Karelia and St. Petersburg) claim there has been a dramatic increase in sex tourism from Sweden since adoption of the law (L. Boitchenko, personal communication). However, this is an innovative approach, worthy of careful study for its applicability elsewhere.

**Client Assistance:** Many studies indicate that clients of trafficked women have assisted them in running away (Limanowska, 2003; Renton, 2001), or show concern that the women in brothels might be forced (Hughes, 2002). LaStrada in Poland found that 50 percent of calls to its hotline were from clients who wanted to help women escape (Minnesota Advocates, 2000a). A study in Ukraine found that nearly 12 percent of returned victims of trafficking escaped with assistance from a client (Winrock Ukraine, 2004b). No information was located

in the document review regarding programs that are designed to encourage users of prostituted women to identify and assist trafficked women. This would be an interesting area for further research.

One study of demand found that most men who used prostitutes wanted to believe that the women willingly engaged in sex, and they had less desire for women whom they thought had been forced (Anderson and Davidson, 2003). In fact, one-quarter of the men felt that a client should help a prostituted woman whom he found had been forced, and half believed that he should report the situation to the police. Only a few admitted they would knowingly use the services of those forced into prostitution. This same study found that the younger the man was at his first experience with a prostitute, the more likely he was to repeat it. In Georgia, some say that it is a right of passage for young men to visit a prostitute, while young girls are expected to remain virgins until marriage (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). The demand study also found that people need to feel that their behavior is socially acceptable; social norms play as important a role in determining consumption patterns in sex as in other areas (Anderson and Davidson, 2003). This may also be true for other types of trafficking. In Romania, media reports have shown that people who employ child laborers are not monsters, but are so-called “average citizens” who believe it is okay to employ these children so long as the child’s parents have agreed (G. Manta, personal communication, August 25, 2004). Were there less social acceptance of such practices, many people would likely not engage in them.

Although there are currently few programs that address demand, the results of this study, as well as the impact of the few programs that have been attempted, lead the ATTO to believe that there may be targeted prevention campaigns aimed at the demand side of trafficking that could be effective. See Recommendations, Section 7.

### **3.7 PREVENTION POLICIES AND LEGISLATION**

Policies to fight trafficking are being designed and implemented in countries around the world. As policies are implemented, more will be learned about their impact—both intended and unintended. In many countries of the region, USAID has supported the drafting of anti-trafficking legislation and the development of national action plans and working groups. Because policies can play an important role in prevention of trafficking and because USAID and the U.S. government often support governments’ efforts to develop and implement new policies or civil societies’ efforts to lobby for new policies, it is appropriate to review them here.

In the evaluation of legislation and policies, it is important to keep in mind the victim’s interest, which can often get lost in the concerns of states over control of their borders or reduction of crime. As eloquently stated by researchers Wijers and Doorninck (2002):

...precisely because trafficking in women is related to so many other areas and [state] interests, any proposed measure must be carefully questioned as to

what problem it aims to solve, whose interests it serves, and what the impact on the women concerned will be.

### **3.7.1 Awareness-Raising/Education**

As noted above, many NGOs have implemented activities to educate and inform children in school about trafficking and safe migration issues (see Section 3.1). Educating young people about trafficking and safe migration does appear to have an impact. However, this impact is limited by the NGOs' geographic coverage, funding, and access to state institutions. A number of studies recommend development of school curricula on trafficking in persons (MSI, 1999; ILO/IPEC Ukraine, 2003; Edwards, 2003). Policies that incorporate anti-trafficking messages in school curricula would be a low-cost way to ensure that most young people receive such training. States could work in collaboration with experienced NGOs to develop the materials (though in many countries such materials have already been developed). This would also ensure consistency in the content and quality of the information provided. See Recommendations, Section 7, for suggestions as to the content to be included in such programs.

States could also provide funding for national public service announcements alerting the public to trafficking and migration issues and directing them to hotlines and service centers for more information. This is another important area for collaboration with NGOs, many of which run hotlines and service centers.

### **3.7.2 Criminalization**

Many states have criminalized or are criminalizing trafficking and its related offenses. However, even where laws exist and maximum penalties are high, successful prosecutions are rare and the sanctions applied are usually not severe enough to serve as deterrents to future traffickers (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003; Aronowitz, 2003). No research or other documentation was found that studied whether reductions in trafficking followed the implementation of countertrafficking legislation. Some providers suggest that for criminalization of traffickers to be effective, the results of prosecutions need to be publicized as a warning to traffickers and their accomplices (F. Larsson and W. Maxwell, personal communication, September 1, 2004; B. Gavrilov, personal communication, August 30, 2004). There have been reports that cracking down on trafficking and prostitution simply causes prostitution to move into less public, more hidden locations, sometimes resulting in far worse conditions for its victims (SIDA, 2003). However, the ATTO is not suggesting that countertrafficking legislation is not valuable, only that its impact on prevention is not easily assessed by the information currently available.

Most countertrafficking legislation criminalizes the traffickers themselves or those who aid and abet them. In an effort to address demand, Kosovo passed an anti-trafficking law that penalizes those who knowingly use the services of women trafficked for sexual exploitation. It may be very difficult to prove that a person knew the prostituted woman was a victim of trafficking. Additionally, it might make users less likely to report cases of trafficking when

found for fear of being prosecuted (Limanowska, 2003). That said, this legislation is an innovative step away from criminalizing the victims and putting some responsibility on users. As noted above, prostituted women in Kosovo have reported a reduction in the number of foreign clients (SIDA, 2003). No other documentation was found about the impact of this law. It should be carefully studied to see if 1) it is possible to successfully prosecute cases and 2) it has an impact on the number of cases of trafficking being reported by users of prostituted women.

In 1999, Sweden passed a law to fight trafficking and exploitation of women by criminalizing the clients who purchase sexual services. Implementation of the law was accompanied by an awareness-raising campaign to reduce demand for prostituted women. As a result, there has been a 50 percent decrease in the number of women involved in street prostitution, especially foreign women, and an estimated decrease of 75–80 percent in the number of men buying sexual services (Ekberg, 2003). Those involved in law enforcement, and testimonies of victims, indicate that because of the new law, traffickers find Sweden to be a less lucrative market: time must be taken to escort the women to the buyers or brothel locations must be moved frequently, as police are cracking down on visible signs of prostitution and buyers are afraid of being arrested. This results in increased costs, making Sweden a poor market for traffickers. The law in Sweden appears to be effective because it is supported by the vast majority of the population as well as by the political leadership, and because law enforcers are making efforts to properly enforce the laws (Ekberg, 2003). The Angel Coalition has held discussions about the applicability of this law in Russia, and there has been some public dialog on this issue; however, it has not yet resulted in changes in the Russian legislation (E. Tyuryukanova, personal communication, September 22, 2004).

### **3.7.3 Regulation of Travel, Employment, and Marriage Services Companies**

A number of studies point to the involvement of tourism, employment, and marriage companies in the trafficking process (IOM Kyrgyzstan, 2001; IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). In Kyrgyzstan, IOM made a concerted effort to involve these companies in discussions about combating trafficking in the republic and in the development of the national plan of action, but found the companies to be resistant to involvement in these efforts (IOM Kyrgyzstan, 2001). More recently, however, Kyrgyzstan, Kazakhstan, and Tajikistan all began licensing and regulating employment companies in an effort to better protect the rights of migrants (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). Other countries, recognizing their potential involvement in the exploitation of citizens in the migration process, have also taken a more pro-active role towards these companies by licensing and regulating the industry. Ukraine, for example, has begun licensing and regulating companies that provide services to facilitate employment, travel, or marriage overseas. According to an IOM report, the state has since investigated hundreds of companies, found numerous violations, and imposed sanctions against many of them (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). However, a recent trafficking assessment in Ukraine asserts that none of these violations or sanctions was related to trafficking in persons activities or charges (UNICEF, 2004). Belarus, Russia, and Moldova also have similar licensing requirements and citizens can check that a company offering them employment is registered (IOM Legal

Frameworks, 2003; Kartusch, 2001). A survey in Russia, however, noted that only 10 percent of women surveyed trust such employment firms (Tyuryukanova, 2002). The Head of the Federal Migration Service estimated that about 50,000 people are employed through these companies, but fewer than 20 percent of them are women (M. Tyurkin, personal communication, September 2, 2004). Travel and marriage agencies in Russia operate without licenses, so control over their activities is weak and potentially puts migrants at risk (E. Shvedov, personal communication, August 19, 2004). Interestingly, Armenia stopped licensing such companies, making monitoring of them more difficult (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). In an effort to combat trafficking, Armenia is considering reinstating this requirement.

No documentation could be found about the impact of such legislation on preventing trafficking. In theory, licensing such companies allows governments to regulate their activities and prevent them from engaging, knowingly or otherwise, in trafficking in persons. However, implementation is not always effective, especially in countries prone to corruption. In countries in Southeast Asia—Indonesia, for example—where labor migration has been regulated by the state for decades, trafficking in persons still takes place through the legal labor migration channels and with licensed recruitment companies. Corruption has been identified as a significant obstacle to effective enforcement (Rosenberg, 2003). Similarly, in Russia, research indicates that legal employment firms often provide migrants with tourist visas rather than work visas, may burden migrants with debts to pay for their visas and travel costs, and provide them with little protection or assistance once they reach their destination (Tyuryukanova, 2002).

However, numerous organizations interviewed for this study believed that employment agencies were reliable sources for legitimate work, even if migrants were sometimes not provided with work visas (UNICEF, 2004; L. Maksymovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004; K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004). In Ukraine, most believed that these agencies were not willing to risk their licenses and reputations by engaging in trafficking. They also believed that the state employment centers that regulate these companies were concerned about the protection of Ukrainian migrants seeking work through these companies. The NGO West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives” sent student volunteers to employment companies in search of work abroad. Many were told that they were too young; others were offered what appeared to be legitimate jobs in construction or as assistants in hospitals (H. Fedkovych, personal communication, February 7, 2004). In Romania, after travel companies were strongly linked with involvement in irregular migration, authorities began investigating companies and limiting licenses; this is thought to have reduced their involvement in irregular migration schemes, and, perhaps as a result, reduced their involvement in trafficking as well, although their involvement in trafficking has not been proven (C. Fugaciu, personal communication conducted during the course of IOM research, September 2, 2003). Also in Romania, the government carefully monitors companies offering jobs overseas to ensure that they are offering only safe and legitimate employment. In addition, the police sometimes investigate job announcements in the media, especially those that look suspicious—for example, if the announcement states that the jobs are only for young women (S.V., personal communication conducted during the course of IOM research, September 10, 2003). Much of the evidence therefore points to the potential benefits in the Europe and Eurasia region of regulating employment and travel companies.

However, given the potential for abuses, careful monitoring of these systems needs to take place to ensure that the regulatory system does not serve to cover up trafficking channels.

### **3.7.4 Employment Programs**

There is a feeling that the current educational systems throughout much of the region do not prepare young people for employment in today's labor market (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). As noted above, efforts to increase job prospects for those vulnerable to being trafficked have been found to be effective given the right conditions (see Section 3.2). Many governments in the region have their own employment programs that could be directed to target vulnerable groups. In 2002, the Government of Ukraine made special efforts to focus job training programs on young women. As a result, thousands of women received training and many found jobs. One region reported that 85 percent of the 4,100 women trained found jobs (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). A more recent report indicates that more than 1.6 million women participated in such training and that half are now employed. The training also included anti-trafficking information (LaStrada Ukraine, 2004a).

The Government of Ukraine also has a unique program that promotes entrepreneurship among the unemployed by offering unemployment benefits in a lump sum payment to be used for starting a business. Training in business skills is also provided. The ILO is working with the government on a pilot project that builds on this program but is specifically designed to prevent trafficking by supporting trafficking survivors and unemployed women who have been unsuccessfully, but actively, looking for employment (H. Yasnytsky, personal communication, September 9, 2004). Because many people do not trust services provided by the government, the program is designed to overcome this obstacle by encouraging women to use the services available through the State Employment Centers (SECs). The pilot program allows eligible women to choose between a job-skills training course and job placement package or an entrepreneurship package. If they choose job skills, they are provided with those skills through the State Employment Service and are assisted in finding employment upon completion. If they choose entrepreneurship, they undergo screening to ensure that they understand the risks and responsibilities of entrepreneurship, after which they are provided with training in business skills. Before they are given a microcredit loan for start-up costs, their business plans are reviewed. In addition, those who qualify can also get the lump sum unemployment benefit to supplement the start-up loan.

It is too early to know the impact of this program on the prevention of trafficking. In addition, this program should be carefully monitored as it could have unintended negative consequences. For example, it could increase recipients' vulnerability. Once a person receives the lump sum payment, she is no longer eligible for unemployment benefits. If her business fails, she will have nothing to fall back on and, in the case of the ILO program, will also be required to pay back the loan. Nonetheless, this program is a good example of how governments can develop creative new programs without using additional resources, as well as find ways to target these programs to the prevention of trafficking.

The Ukrainian State Employment Centers were highly respected by most people interviewed for this assessment. The ILO believed that the SEC was unique in that it had a highly respected and dynamic leader as well as significant funding that was managed through a tripartite system, consisting of government, unions, and employers, that provides checks and balances to ensure appropriate use of the funds (H. Yasnytsky, personal communication, September 9, 2004). In addition to the programs described above, the SECs also provide subsidized job vacancies for the unemployed, which can also benefit small business owners by providing low-cost personnel; they provide staff to consult with callers to the national trafficking hotline one day a week; and they make available brochures and information on trafficking and migration (H. Yasnytsky, personal communication, September 9, 2004; H. Fedkovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004; LaStrada, personal communication).

### **3.7.5 Guest Worker Agreements**

Many sending and receiving countries of migrant labor around the world have agreements that regulate the flow of migrant labor. Agreements may regulate the numbers of workers, the fields in which they can work, the process that should be followed, minimum wages, and even minimum standards for living and working conditions. Similar agreements are being developed in the Europe and Eurasia region. In 2002, Moldova opened a new Department of Migration within the Ministry of Labor to develop bilateral agreements with other countries governing the employment of Moldovan citizens in those countries. The objective of the program is increased safe and legal employment opportunities for Moldovans abroad (Arnold and Doni, 2002). Italy and Albania also worked out an agreement to facilitate the safe and legal migration of Albanians to Italy on legitimate work contracts. Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan have a similar agreement to protect migrant farm workers (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). Russia has had such agreements with Germany, Finland, Switzerland, China, Poland, Vietnam, and others (Tyuryukanova, 2002).

It became apparent during the interviews conducted for this assessment that although many such agreements exist, they are currently limited in their effectiveness. In Ukraine, many people indicated that although Ukraine had around 11 such agreements, the agreements did not appear to be implemented effectively. In fact, no one interviewed knew how the implementation of such agreements was supposed to work; some interviewees indicated that one of the flaws of these agreements was that implementation mechanisms were not incorporated into the agreements. Others speculated that employers in countries of destination preferred to hire immigrants illegally rather than go through the complicated process of applying through these guest worker agreements.

Similarly, in Russia, there are many labor agreements with destination countries, and although they provide for only a few jobs, they are not even used to the maximum extent possible. The agreement with Germany, for example, provides employment for up to 2,000 guest workers; however, at most only 100–200 Russians annually go to Germany under the auspices of this agreement (M. Tyurkin, personal communication, September 2, 2004). In Romania, there has been an increase in the number of these agreements since the lifting of visa restrictions for the European Union (EU). However, there are still only tens of thousands

of jobs offered through these agreements and estimates of more than a million Romanians working abroad, so the impact is not yet significant (D. Andreescu, personal communication conducted during the course of IOM research, September 7, 2003). Although no documentation was found that demonstrated the effectiveness of these programs in preventing trafficking, it is logical that an increase in legitimate work opportunities, if managed effectively, would decrease people's dependency on irregular migration opportunities to find work abroad and thereby reduce their risk of being trafficked.

However, as with regulating tourism and labor companies (see Section 3.7.3), care must be taken to ensure that trafficking is not hidden within the legitimate migrant worker process. IOM in Albania has a program that helps to screen and train potential migrants. As a result of this program, thousands of Albanians have been accepted into the program and found jobs in Italy (Kartusch, 2001). Although participants in this program were primarily men and may not have been the most at risk for trafficking, the documentation demonstrates the success of programs that increase opportunities for legal migration while providing a measure of safety and protection for the workers. IOM's Web site indicates that this activity is taking place in other countries as well. However, ATTO has been unable to obtain more information from IOM about this program to determine its applicability to the prevention of trafficking.

### 3.7.6 Migration Monitoring and Controls

Controlling migration and national borders is not an uncommon approach for fighting trafficking. As the following information will show, the impacts of such interventions appear to contradict one another. While some programs show promise in the prevention of trafficking, others appear to result only in changes in trafficking patterns, while still others seem to be more effective at pushing people into the arms of traffickers than at preventing trafficking.

**Closing Routes:** In Albania, it is believed that the crackdown on the sea routes to Italy has contributed to the reduction in the numbers of trafficking victims transiting through Albania (Limanowska, 2003). At the same time, some believe that the tighter border controls have resulted in increases in internal trafficking (A. Giantris, personal communication, September 15, 2004). In Israel, tighter border controls resulted in changes in trafficking routes, with fewer women entering at airports and more crossing the desert from Egypt, but did not appear to result in reductions in trafficking (Levenkron and Dahan, 2003). In fact, tightened border controls are thought to also have the unintended effect of pushing those who want to migrate into the hands of traffickers, as they must rely on third parties to help them overcome the hurdles imposed by the tightened restrictions (Wijers and Doorninck, 2002; Levenkron and Dahan, 2003). IOM in Ukraine felt that traffickers tended to use legitimate visas and migration routes since these are not difficult to obtain. Smuggling people across borders would needlessly increase their risks (F. Larson, personal communication, September 1, 2004). The difference between smuggling and trafficking is very important in this context. States often tighten border controls to prevent the smuggling of migrants into the country. However, because tighter border controls can have opposite and unintended effects on

trafficking, care must be taken when implementing such policies for the prevention of trafficking.

**Restricting Migration:** States must also be careful not to implement policies in the name of fighting trafficking that in effect limit women's rights to migrate (Levenkron and Dahan, 2003). In Indonesia, in an effort to protect women from traffickers, a local policy was developed that, though well-intended, increased the restrictions on women's ability to migrate (North Sulawesi Provincial Law on the Prevention of Trafficking of Women). In Bosnia and Herzegovina, border guards stamp the passports of departing victims of trafficking, denying them entry in the future in order to prevent them from being re-trafficked (SIDA, 2003). These are examples of repressive migration schemes that attempt to restrict the movements of women in an effort to prevent trafficking.

**Opening Borders:** Open borders and increased options for legal migration are thought by some to decrease trafficking and by others to increase it. According to some sources, in Romania, since the opening of borders to the EU, there has been a notable decrease in the numbers of Romanians trafficked to the EU (Limanowska, 2003). The ease of obtaining a visa for the EU means that Romanian citizens no longer need to rely on intermediaries, forged documents, or illegal border crossings, which significantly decreases their vulnerability to trafficking. Conversely, some people in Romania believe that irregular migration significantly increased after visas for the EU were no longer required for Romanian citizens. They believe that there may have been an influx of people trafficked for begging, crossing as tourists (C. Fugaciu, personal communication, August 2, 2003). Better monitoring at borders and sanctioning of officials is thought to have reduced this irregular migration. In non-EU countries, too, people believe that the Schengen visa scheme in Europe has made it easier for traffickers to move victims across borders and made it more difficult for law enforcement to locate victims after they've entered the EU (J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). A recent study of the impact of EU expansion on trafficking in persons may help explain these apparent contradictions, indicating that immediately following the easing of visa regimes, there was an initial spike in trafficking, followed by a decline (El-Cherkeh et al., 2004). However, the study goes on to point out that because accession to the EU does not initially result in open access to labor markets, it is unclear how this initial access to the EU, but not to labor markets, will impact on trafficking in the medium term.

**Victim Identification:** Training of border guards to identify potential victims of trafficking and offer them assistance is another prevention technique being applied. Currently, in Southeastern Europe, most victims are identified during police raids, not at border crossings (Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). However, the Council of Europe recommends that states train immigration officials to identify trafficking victims and to provide them with assistance (Kartusch, 2001). The Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE) has developed a manual for border guards and, with IOM, has trained border guards throughout the region (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004). Ukrainian NGOs have also made efforts to train border guards to identify potential and actual victims of trafficking (L. Maksymovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004; T. Semikop, personal communication, September 3, 2004; K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9,

2004). They also provide border guards with informational flyers for both departing and returning migrants. For departing migrants, the flyers include information about the crime of trafficking and about how to seek assistance abroad. Similar flyers are also distributed at passport offices. Most organizations interviewed stated that it was very difficult to persuade departing migrants at the border crossing not to go and, in fact, some felt that such practices could infringe upon the rights of migrants. Additionally, one NGO stated that it took a long time to convince the border guard units of the need not only for training of their staff but also to allow them to stock the borders with posters and flyers; frequent turnover of border guard staff requires that they must continually persuade and convince the new leadership to participate and support these outreach efforts (L. Maksymovych, personal communication, September 6, 2004). Corruption at border crossings can also be an impediment to such programs. However, providing information about the crime of trafficking, victims' rights, and how to seek assistance abroad may prove helpful in assisting migrants who end up trafficked or in exploitative situations. More such attention to identifying potential victims prior to their departure and to providing them with information to make an informed decision as well as information about how to seek assistance, could therefore go a long way in preventing trafficking and in identifying and assisting victims.

**Alternative Travel Documents:** In Armenia, the implementation of national identification codes may assist trafficked persons. A person will be able to prove his or her identity and citizenship by producing his or her unique identification code (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003). This may allow Armenian victims to feel less controlled by the withholding of their passports—however, depending on the country of destination, their stay may be made illegal by the loss of visas. Much may depend on how informed citizens are about the uses of the identification code prior to their departure and how willing they are to turn to their embassy for assistance, where the identification code could be used to obtain new travel documents (IOM Legal Frameworks, 2003).

### 3.7.7 Regulation of Informal Sectors

Many sectors in which migrants and trafficked persons work are in the informal sectors—agriculture, domestic work, etc. Little information could be found in the documents reviewed about efforts taken to date to better protect migrants working in the informal sector. In Russia, which is a destination country for migrant labor into informal sectors, officials felt that the activities of the federal labor inspectors should be extended to include informal sectors in order to better ensure protection of migrants and other workers in this sector against exploitation and abuse (N. Vlassova, personal communication, September 3, 2004).

### 3.7.8 Anti-Corruption

Corruption allows trafficking to take place unfettered (Rosenberg, 2003; Aronowitz, 2003; Shelley, 2003). Corruption allows traffickers to obtain falsified passports and closes police eyes to underage girls in brothels and to women held against their will. Corruption allows traffickers to avoid prosecution or to have minimum sanctions applied. LaStrada Ukraine

believes that corruption in the visa sections of foreign embassies pushes migrants into the hands of traffickers who facilitate the process to obtain otherwise unobtainable visas (K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004). Corruption allows people to be transported illegally across borders. And corruption erodes the confidence of people in law enforcement, with the result that many victims are afraid to seek help from authorities. In a survey in Southeast Europe, many respondents from organizations working on countertrafficking commented that unless more efforts are made to combat corruption in the region, progress against fighting trafficking will be limited (Coffey, et al., 2004). Fighting corruption would go a long way in helping to prevent trafficking. However, although some of the countries studied for this assessment had anti-corruption programs, the researcher was only able to learn about the Albania anti-corruption program related to anti-trafficking.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup> A new initiative is underway to develop a regional coalition for anti-trafficking and anti-corruption NGOs called ACTA (see Coffey, et al., 2004, for more information). PSD, a Croatian NGO that is part of this coalition, has begun working on corruption and trafficking issues and has had both victims and traffickers come forward. PSD is currently struggling with how best to protect these witnesses in an ongoing case (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 21, 2004).

## 4. MONITORING AND EVALUATION OF PROGRAMS<sup>5</sup>

Evaluation of countertrafficking programs in the region was found to be weak. There seem to be a great number of output indicators being collected, but few results indicators that would assist implementers, as well as donors, in determining the impact of the programs on the prevention of trafficking. Some people interviewed for this assessment felt that funding decisions in their country had been made based on impressions as comprehensive data were lacking, resulting in disagreement and skepticism about the impact of programs. It is important to consider that trafficking prevention programs are relatively new to the work of development organizations; indicators have had to be developed from scratch and, naturally, have had to be adapted as programs developed, lessons were learned, and interventions changed. Additionally, the collection of indicators needs to be balanced against other issues. Money used to collect indicators comes from money that could have been spent on more programming. Staff time spent collecting data comes out of staff time that could be spent assisting those at risk. However, without such indicators, we do not have an objective measure of program impact and, therefore, cannot make informed decisions about the future direction of programs. Thus, care should be taken not to overburden implementing agencies with an unwieldy number of indicators and focus instead on collecting fewer but more powerful indicators, which would best help ensure that programs are meeting their intended objectives.

As a resource for Missions, a Trafficking Prevention Framework is included as Annex C to this report. It highlights possible indicators for each type of program intervention recommended. The framework includes an illustrative overarching strategic objective as well as intermediate results that can be tied to different interventions. Missions can choose those indicators that best reflect the intended outcomes of the interventions they are funding. In some cases, the indicators collected can be aggregated across the region to get a better sense of overall impact of USAID programs.

---

<sup>5</sup> Comments by those interviewed that are cited in Sections 4, 5, and 6 will not be referenced individually in order to preserve anonymity of responses.



## 5. ANALYSIS OF PROGRAM SUSTAINABILITY

### 5.1 GOVERNMENT/NGO COOPERATION

It appears from the information available that NGOs have taken on the bulk of responsibility for trafficking prevention programming around the region. However, as noted earlier in the report, NGOs alone cannot have the breadth and depth of programming necessary to put an end to trafficking. NGOs are limited by their geographic scope, limited funding, and even access to target groups and state institutions. To truly make a lasting impact, governments must make trafficking prevention a priority for their countries and must work with NGOs to make a real impact. Interestingly, NGOs can be an important factor in increasing government interest in trafficking. In Ukraine, in locations where local NGOs have been active in trafficking prevention activities, local governments are well informed about trafficking and are active in paying attention to the issue; in those areas without active local NGOs, local governments are less informed or less interested (UNICEF, 2004). Governments can better collaborate with NGOs on prevention by

- Providing financial and in-kind support for NGOs providing services the government is unable to provide,
- Including NGO members on government committees to fight trafficking and to develop countertrafficking legislation and policy,
- Providing free access for public service announcements on the state-run media, on public transportation, and in public spaces,
- Working with NGOs to develop a curriculum for use in schools and ensuring that teachers are trained in the curriculum and that the curriculum is implemented effectively in every school,
- Jointly developing and contributing to a national center for the collection of data and statistics on trafficking that can be used for prevention, and
- Inviting NGO experts to work with and train government officials on trafficking and trafficking prevention.

NGOs can better cooperate with governments by

- Cultivating relationships with a variety of local and national government partners,
- Consulting National Plans of Action to coordinate programs as much as possible with needs and gaps identified in the Plans, and
- Supporting governmental capacity building by providing training and offering anti-trafficking services.

### 5.2 CAPACITY BUILDING

Most of the internationally funded programs reviewed for this study made use of local partners in program implementation. An evaluation of IREX's programs in five countries of Eurasia found that the following factors were critical to selecting effective local partners for

the program: experience working on issues of violence against women; a program that fits within its organizational mission; a program that makes use of the expertise available within the organization; organizational knowledge of and access to the relevant target group; and good relationships with local government (MSI, 2003).

Several programs made note of the lengthy time necessary—one to two years, in some cases—to train local partner organizations to be able to implement programs effectively (Engel, 2001; A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). Winrock International found that in addition to skills training, partners needed administrative and management skills training to improve their operations, and fundraising and proposal writing skills to ensure their future financial viability. Several steps were taken throughout the program that have helped maintain the network among the regional centers—they attended many joint training programs, staff from one center were often sent to another center for on-the-job training, and they were encouraged to contact one another for assistance. As a result, the centers are continuing their operations, albeit at a lower level, since the project ended earlier this year.

In the course of this assessment, researchers were told repeatedly by local organizations about the numerous ways in which they benefited by their collaboration with international organizations. In Ukraine, local organizations that have received support from international donors stated that they benefited in many ways from their collaboration with international organizations, citing assistance from international experts, training opportunities, and opportunities to attend international conferences, seminars, and study tours (E. Mykytas, personal communication, September 4, 2004; T. Semikop, personal communication, September 3, 2004). Some believed that their work on internationally funded programs raised the stature of the organization in its local community, opening doors to meetings with local government and to invitations to participate on local committees (E. Mykytas, personal communication, September 4, 2004). Many internationally funded programs have provided local partners with international networking opportunities from which they have benefited in many ways, including development of new program ideas and coordination for the return of trafficking victims.<sup>6</sup> One organization stated directly that its program would not have been as effective if it had received money four years ago without the additional training and assistance (E. Mykytas, personal communication, September 4, 2004). In Romania, too, USAID staff note that local organizations appreciate programs that provide more than just funding for program activities, but also include capacity-building activities and training (G. Manta, personal communication, August 25, 2004).

### 5.3 ALTERNATIVE FUNDING MECHANISMS

Currently, international organizations and governments are taking on the bulk of responsibility for funding countertrafficking efforts. As USAID begins exiting from the region and continued international funding cannot be relied on, it is important to encourage local organizations to begin looking for new sources of funding and for sending, transit and

---

<sup>6</sup> For more information on the importance of regional networks for combating trafficking, see Coffey, et al., 2004.

receiving countries to begin prioritizing countertrafficking efforts directly. Although some organizations interviewed felt that it was nearly impossible to get anything other than international donor support, others have been successful in trying other approaches. Below are some possible sources for alternative funding.

**Charging for Services:** In some countries, it may not be feasible or even legal for a nonprofit organization to charge for services. In other places, the at-risk group simply cannot afford to pay. However, there may be options for finding other ways of financially supporting programs without international donor funds. Employment programs can encourage employers who hire trainees from the centers to donate to the program. Participants can be encouraged to make a donation after they have found a job.

**In-Kind Contributions:** In-kind contributions can make a big difference in reducing the costs of implementing programs. In some countries, local TV and radio stations have contributed free air time. LaStrada Ukraine has received large contributions from a local advertising agency for free air time as well as from the telecommunications company for reduced tariffs for the hotline (K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004). As a result of such success, as well as requirements for media to provide public service announcements, LaStrada Ukraine has a policy that it will not pay for dissemination of materials. Elsewhere, local government has contributed use of public places for office space and for advertising campaign materials (in public places, on buses, etc.). Individuals have contributed apartments for use as shelters, as well as cash.

**Central and Local Government:** For efforts to be truly sustainable, governments of sending, receiving, and transit countries need to take responsibility for combating trafficking themselves. Many states currently rely on international organizations and donors to fund and implement a full range of countertrafficking programs (Coffey, et al., 2004). There has been some success in getting local governments to fund small countertrafficking prevention efforts in local communities. For example, in Ukraine, the city government of Ivano-Frankivsk provides financing for 10 local NGOs working with youth (UNICEF, 2004). In Russia, the city of St. Petersburg has funded a local organization to continue anti-trafficking activities (J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). In Nishny Novogrod, the regional government incorporated an NGO's anti-trafficking component into the middle school curriculum (J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). More efforts could be made to help NGOs lobby their local governments for such assistance.

**Confiscation of Assets:** In many countries, the assets of traffickers can be seized or penalties and fines imposed by the courts. In reality, this is rarely accomplished. More efforts need to be made by the courts to secure traffickers' assets. Although these assets should be used to provide compensation to victims, they could also be put to use by countries for both victim assistance programs and trafficking prevention.

**Fees and Taxes from Related Industries:** Fees from migrant worker recruitment companies and tour/travel companies, as well as taxes from the tourism and entertainment industries can all be directed toward countertrafficking efforts. NGOs and the media can be encouraged to lobby government to direct these funds to support their countertrafficking efforts.



## 6. TRAFFICKING PROGRAM MANAGEMENT AND DESIGN

**Program Management:** In the Europe/Eurasia region, trafficking programs are managed by Missions in different ways. Many Missions house trafficking in a technical office—usually democracy and governance, but sometimes social transition and health—and others house it in the program office. This reflects the fact that trafficking prevention programming cuts across a wide range of Mission strategic objectives. Employment programs for at-risk women contribute to the economic transition of the country; addressing human rights violations, awareness-raising programs, use of local media, and advocacy campaigns to increase local government support for programs are part of democracy and governance; crisis intervention, shelters, and health services fall within the social transition of the country.

The Romanian Mission manages trafficking from the Program Office. For a variety of reasons, several of the programs that have included anti-trafficking components have also fallen under program office management. The Program Office staff work closely with the strategic objective teams and feel that they are able to provide sufficient coordination across all of the strategic objectives.

In Ukraine, the Mission originally managed trafficking programs from the Program Office, but recently moved management to the Office of Health and Social Transition. Mission staff felt that this did not reduce cross-sector coordination, but did help to focus more attention and resources on the issue. Mission staff felt that the Program Office, due to its supporting role for all technical offices, was required to maintain neutrality in terms of the use of budgetary resources. Technical offices, however, could lobby for resources for their programs and, therefore, could try to make more resources available for trafficking.

In Albania, trafficking was originally housed in the health office, but it currently stands alone and is not “housed” under a technical office or the program office. Although Mission staff do not feel that this has led to the program’s being marginalized, and under the current Mission Director anti-trafficking has become a priority, trafficking is now being moved to the democracy and governance office.

In Russia, integration of all programs has taken on such importance that the Mission has created a new Office for Regional Development to “promote cross-office work and develop regional cluster groups.” Trafficking programs will be moving to this new office, specifically to the Division for Cross-Cutting Initiatives.

From discussions with Mission staff it is not clear to the researchers that trafficking is necessarily best housed in one office rather than another. Arguments can be made in favor of housing trafficking in any technical office or the program office. No matter where it is housed in the Mission, what is important is that trafficking prevention activities are not relegated to a corner and that Mission staff tasked with managing them have the ability and expertise to understand the many sides and complex nature of trafficking programming and to coordinate effectively with other Mission offices to ensure that trafficking issues are considered across sectors. Missions need to take into consideration the kinds of programming

they intend to implement and how that best integrates with their technical offices' other programs, the number and expertise of staff available to manage the programs, budget, and other resource allocations, as well as interest in the issue. No matter under which office it is managed, trafficking programming requires coordination among all of the technical offices in order to be most effective.

**Integration with Other Programs:** Not only can the activities contribute to the achievement of all of the Mission's strategic objectives, but there may be many ways in which countertrafficking activities can be integrated with other Mission activities. Mission programs to promote print and broadcast media can assist with anti-trafficking awareness-raising campaigns. Activities to promote small and microbusiness development or employment can target clients at risk for trafficking. Drafting and passage of anti-trafficking legislation can be incorporated into parliamentary strengthening programs. Numerous other examples exist of how Missions can and have integrated anti-trafficking activities into other programs.

Many Missions both have stand-alone trafficking projects and integrate trafficking objectives into other Mission activities; others combat trafficking primarily by integrating activities into other Mission programs. In Romania, the Mission works on anti-trafficking primarily by integrating anti-trafficking components into other Mission activities. For example, in a social services program whose objective is to find alternatives for children and minors living in state-run institutions, anti-trafficking messages, along with other life skills and job opportunities, are given to the young men and women who are preparing to leave these institutions; this is a group, as noted above, that has been identified in numerous studies as being quite vulnerable to trafficking. The Romanian Mission also integrated trafficking into a program that builds capacity of local NGOs, which resulted in two countertrafficking partnerships that the Mission felt were very successful. In another case, however, a trafficking component had been included as an option in the program design for a local government program, but this aspect of the program was never implemented. Mission staff felt that this may have resulted because it was not the project priority, and the NGOs implementing the program at the local level did not have experience or capacity in anti-trafficking.

In Ukraine, the Mission has a stand-alone anti-trafficking initiative and integrates trafficking into other Mission programs. For example, the participant training program has implemented summer camp programs for at-risk youth and has organized study tours and conferences for combating trafficking. Media programs have also assisted in training journalists about trafficking and in supporting the development of countertrafficking public service announcements and documentary films. Business development programs have targeted at-risk women for the client base. For these programs, countertrafficking expertise is usually drawn from the staff of the stand-alone anti-trafficking project. The staff work closely with partners of the Mission's other programs to ensure the accuracy and quality of the anti-trafficking content.

In Albania, the Mission works primarily through stand-alone programs. However, it has on occasion integrated trafficking into other Mission activities. For example, there is a women's

legal rights initiative that is providing support to law enforcement to improve handling of women's legal rights issues, such as domestic violence and trafficking. Recently, integration resulted in the development of a trafficking-related theater performance organized through an anti-corruption program. For a variety of reasons the play apparently did not have a strong anti-corruption message and was seen more as therapy for trafficking victims than as awareness-raising for the public. However, in the process of showing the play to the public, some of the performers, who were victims of trafficking, had their identities exposed in the media. Clearly this can and has happened in stand-alone trafficking projects as well, but it also illustrates that in the course of implementing anti-trafficking programs, we can accidentally do more harm than good. Care must always be taken not to cause harm.

In Russia, there are both stand-alone trafficking programs and programs in which the target populations are also those at risk for trafficking. For example, clients of the microcredit program are primarily young women who fall within the population considered at risk for trafficking. Similarly there is a program that is providing social assistance to orphans. The Mission staff responsible for trafficking do not believe that either of these programs tracks trafficking-related indicators. Although orphans are considered particularly at risk for trafficking, and this program is clearly attempting to provide a range of support for orphans, which may in fact reduce their vulnerability to trafficking, the Mission does not attribute this project's activities or impact to the Mission's anti-trafficking efforts.

These experiences demonstrate that Missions need to be careful when integrating anti-trafficking with other Mission programs. The examples above also highlight the need to make sure that Missions do not miss opportunities to integrate trafficking components into programs that could help to combat trafficking. Many issues must be taken into consideration to ensure that the trafficking component is not neglected and that organizations with appropriate skills and resources are selected for implementation of that component. This is not always easy to do, as the skills and resources required for the main priorities of the program may be different than those needed for trafficking prevention. Projects that had cross-cutting themes—such as participant training programs or activities designed to increase public discussion on reform issues—were easily able to incorporate anti-trafficking activities and themes into their programs because their programs, by design, supported a wide range of issues and topics. They tended to draw on the expertise available through Missions' stand-alone trafficking projects.

Other partners felt that working on special thematic issues could detract from their main program objectives. For example, programs designed to encourage and support a free and independent media felt that pushing the media to work on a specific issue could be seen to contradict their main message of independence. However, they also felt that it was possible to use special themes such as trafficking as training tools, for example, in investigative journalism techniques.

One notable drawback to integrating anti-trafficking components into other Mission programs is that it makes evaluation far more difficult. The indicators and results used to evaluate the main program may be far different from those used to track the impact of countertrafficking activities. Among programs that integrated trafficking into other programs,

only a very few collected or planned to collect impact indicators directly related to trafficking prevention. The results framework included in this assessment may help to alleviate this problem; results that are relevant can be integrated into the partners' program objectives.

As USAID resources are reduced and as many Missions of the region are facing phase-out periods, having a stand-alone trafficking project may not always be possible. Therefore integrating trafficking into other Mission programs may be the only way to address the issue. In other cases, trafficking activities of non-trafficking projects can complement the efforts of stand-alone trafficking programs. To best integrate trafficking into USAID's other activities, the following issues should be taken into consideration:

- Availability of countertrafficking expertise—ideally through another USAID partner so that cooperation can be ensured, or even by a USAID staff member with such expertise.
- Incorporation of countertrafficking objectives and required reporting indicators into contracts and grants.
- Assurance that countertrafficking work does not conflict with the program's main objectives.

**Program Design:** Missions have relied on both unsolicited proposals and competition for their trafficking program partners. In one Mission, staff felt that there was a need for significant financial resources in order to rationalize development of an RFP and an open competition. With limited resources, they felt that too much of the available funds went for administrative needs rather than program costs, whereas organizations already on the ground and with existing funding could implement programs with fewer resources. However, competing programs not only ensures greater transparency in funding decision, but also gives Missions greater ability to influence the direction of programming and greater choice when selecting programs.

Some Missions have also considered implementing programs directly through local organizations, but find that it can be difficult to find local organizations that can meet the requirements. Specifically, for trafficking prevention to have broad-based coverage throughout the country, the Mission needs to partner either with many local organizations throughout the country or with one organization that has the capacity to issue subgrants. Using individual grants to partner with numerous organizations throughout the country puts an unreasonable management burden on Missions. It also requires that all local organizations be registered and audited by the Mission, something that would take significant time before such grants could be issued. Partnering with one larger organization that can provide subgrants to other organizations is better suited to most Missions' needs. This could be done with either a local or an international organization, depending on local capacity. Missions could make efforts to build the capacity of local organizations in order to prepare them to meet Mission registration and auditing requirements. (See Section 5 for more discussion on sustainability and on the benefits of partnerships between international and local organizations.)

## 7. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR SUCCESSFUL PREVENTION PROGRAMS

The following are recommendations, drawn from the findings discussed above, for issues to consider in designing and implementing trafficking prevention programs.

### 7.1 TARGET PROGRAMS EFFECTIVELY TO THE AT-RISK GROUPS

**Conduct research to identify those at risk for trafficking.** In some countries in the region, more is known about those at risk for trafficking, or at least about those at risk for trafficking for prostitution to Western Europe or within the region. Much of this information has been gained by studying those who have returned. This information is extremely valuable for helping to target programs to those most at risk. Evaluations of anti-trafficking activities have shown that programs that are not targeted closely enough to those most at risk do not have the intended impact of preventing trafficking. In other countries in the region, less is known about the profile of trafficked women because fewer trafficked women have been identified or returned, at least through official channels that would allow gathering of data about them, or because anti-trafficking programs are new. In these areas, an alternative approach could be used. Several studies in Ukraine and Romania that examined those at risk defined being at risk for trafficking as being highly interested in going overseas for work or marriage, and being willing to break rules or take risks to do so (Rudd, 2002; IOM Ukraine, 1998; Ukrainian Institute, 2001; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). Obviously, this is not a perfect method, as those people willing to take risks or break rules may be more likely to migrate, but they are not necessarily more likely to be trafficked. A recent study in Ukraine comparing successful migrants to trafficked women found that willingness to migrate irregularly or without an employment contract turned out not to be a vulnerability factor for trafficking (UNICEF, 2004). Additionally, many people believe that they are going for very legitimate work with legal visas through properly licensed companies and still become victims of trafficking. Their risk tolerance may not have been higher than average. Nevertheless, lacking specific information about actual victims, this method might help to focus the messages and programming to those whose behavior or judgments might seem to make them more vulnerable than others, and might help to tailor messages or programming accordingly.

**Programs must consider the needs and interests of the target population.** Programs designed to increase economic opportunities for those at risk of being trafficked must take into consideration the needs and interests of the target community in order to be effective. As noted above, entrepreneurship training programs were found to be very successful in increasing entrepreneurship and the success of start-up businesses for those who participated in the program. However, the mid-program evaluation noted that those who participated in the program were not those most at risk for being trafficked and, in fact, the entire program concept was not suited to the target group, who were too young, inexperienced, and unstable to start their own businesses (MSI, 2003). Winrock International found the same to be true of its entrepreneurship training in Ukraine (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004).

Similarly, job skills programs that teach skills for jobs that the target community is not interested in having will not be effective in preventing trafficking. As noted earlier, a survey of trafficked women in Ukraine found that 51 percent had jobs at the time they were trafficked (LaStrada Ukraine, 2004a). Obviously, they were not jobs that met the women's needs. As one implementing organization mentioned, there may be many jobs available for bus drivers, and you could teach the at-risk community to drive a bus, but if those at risk are not interested in being bus drivers, the program will not be effective in keeping them from migrating in search of work (E. Callender, personal communication, July 30, 2004).

**Conduct outreach to ensure that target groups know about the availability of programs.**

Targeting should be done not only in terms of the types of activities implemented, but also in terms of outreach to the particular target group to involve them in programs. An activity could be perfectly tailored to the needs of the target group, but if they do not know about it they will not participate in it. Some implementers have found that it is very difficult to restrict participation in programs to only the target group and still maintain strong community support (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004; MSI, 2003). Therefore, it may be necessary to open programs to a larger audience, while giving priority to at-risk groups. However, it is not enough to give priority to those at risk; implementing organizations must reach out to those at risk in order to actively encourage their participation (MSI, 2003).

**Use geographic targeting as an interim measure.** Targeting can also be geographic, focusing on those areas of a country from which most of the trafficked women originate. Targeting programs in this way can save on scarce resources and ensure that those for whom the message is intended will actually see it. Care should be taken in focusing too narrowly, however. Although programs should be targeted to those most at risk, traffickers quickly adapt to changing environments. If traffickers find people in one area becoming so well informed that they are not longer easy targets, they will move on to other areas where victims are less savvy. Countertrafficking practitioners must, therefore, continuously monitor trafficking trends and adapt their programs accordingly. Implementation should be flexible and should aim to eventually inform and equip the entire country with information and skills needed to prevent them from falling prey to traffickers.

**Research how target audiences access information.** A concentration of programs in capital cities has resulted in people in the capitals being better informed than those in rural areas, though people in rural areas were by no means uninformed (Women for Future, 2003; Arnold and Doni, 2002). To reach rural populations, it is important to identify where they get information. In a study of at-risk women in Ukraine, more than 57 percent indicated that they received most of their information from the main public television station, making it an appropriate venue for reaching out to all communities (Ukrainian Institute, 2001). The producers of an anti-trafficking docudrama were very conscious of showing the program on this television station in order to reach the widest possible audience throughout the country (Todosov, 2001). In other places, it might be necessary to use other methods to reach young, rural, or ethnic communities. Radio and regional newspapers were mentioned as better ways of reaching rural communities in Moldova, for example (Arnold and Doni, 2002). Ethnic minorities, youth, and others may also access different sources of media and information than

the general population. Before spending scarce resources, it is worth investigating which methods would be most successful in reaching the intended target audience.

**Conduct job skills training where jobs are available.** Trafficking prevention programs should be located in a geographically appropriate area for the given program. Conducting job skills training in areas where jobs are not available is not going to prevent migration for employment (though it might equip migrants with skills to obtain better jobs and with knowledge to protect themselves, and should, therefore, be designed accordingly). One criterion for the location of Winrock International’s Women For Women centers is that they be small urban areas (where jobs are available for program participants after they have completed the training) that are known as sending locations, to ensure that program participants are from an at-risk community (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004).

## 7.2 FOCUS ON NEGLECTED TARGET GROUPS

**Prostituted women—Provide information and economic alternatives.** One particularly at-risk group that does not seem to be the focus of many prevention programs includes women who are already involved in prostitution in their countries of origin. Prostituted women in their country of origin are often trafficked from their local area into the international market (Limanowska, 2003; IOM Kazakhstan, 2003). In a study in Ukraine, 47 percent of prostitutes interviewed had received offers to work abroad; only 14 percent of all respondents had received such offers (Ukrainian Institute, 2001). Another study showed that prostituted women, while having higher than average awareness of the existence of job opportunities overseas, demonstrated lower levels of awareness of the dangers and conditions of working abroad (Ukrainian Institute, 2001). Although they may be aware that the jobs offered abroad are for work in prostitution, they may still be deceived about the conditions of work, have their documents withheld, find their movements and communications restricted, have their pay withheld, or face physical and psychological abuse. However, few prevention programs seem to be aimed at this target group to provide them with information or economic alternatives.

In addition, many such women may already be victims of internal trafficking. Yet, in many countries of the region, few programs are targeting the prevention of internal trafficking into the sex industry. Efforts need to be made to ensure that this important target group is not neglected, and that ways are found of getting them important information and assistance regarding alternatives to prostitution.

**Schoolchildren—Integrate trafficking prevention programming into school curricula across the region.** Because vulnerability to trafficking in some places is linked with lower levels of education (IOM Romania, 2001; Renton, 2001; Hunzinger Coffey, 2003), it is important to target children in schools before the typical drop-out age in the target community. This may be in secondary school in some areas, or could require trafficking prevention interventions in primary schools in areas where children drop out of school early. Content should include:

- Leadership and confidence building, (including physical—such as self defense—and psychological confidence)
- Human rights (including children’s rights, rights of migrants, labor rights, and women’s rights)
- Information on finding work locally
- Pros and cons/risks and benefits of working abroad
- Legal versus illegal migration
- Opportunities for legal migration
- Information about study abroad/scholarship programs
- Using caution in trusting friends and boyfriends making offers for jobs or travel abroad
- Communicating with parents

In support of such a curriculum, schools could also involve parent-teacher associations to encourage parental involvement and encourage the development of peer support networks.

**Orphans—Provide trafficking prevention programming and other support for orphans preparing to leave institutions.** Numerous studies note the need to target teenage orphans who will soon be leaving institutions and must survive on their own, noting that not only their lack of economic options or housing but also their lack of life skills and family support systems make them more vulnerable to being trafficked (Blumberg and Shved, 2002; Arnold and Doni, 2002; Limanowska, 2003; Hughes, 2002, Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003; IOM Romania, 2001; Shelley, 2003). In Ukraine, a number of efforts are underway to provide assistance to orphans leaving institutions. Some organizations offer summer camps that provide leadership training, empowerment programs, and training on rights (UNICEF, 2004). A new program with OSCE will provide orphans with life skills and jobs skills training, as well as internships with local businesses (C. Wohlmuther, personal communication, September 10, 2004). One NGO that provided some training to orphans on trafficking and migration found it very difficult to work with the teachers and administration of the orphanages (E. Mykytas, personal communication, September 4, 2004). Overcoming their resistance took a lot of time and energy and had to be approached one institution at a time. In Russia, Miramed Institute has had better cooperation with local orphanages, and has implemented two-year interventions with children in institutions (J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). As with schools, advocacy efforts could be made to integrate countertrafficking training into the curriculum at orphanages nationwide.

In addition to the content listed above for school children, orphans preparing to leave institutions also need the following kinds of support:

- Information on where to go if their rights are violated
- Access to emergency shelter
- Assistance with job placement and job skills
- Assistance with enrolling in, and financing, higher education

**Ethnic minorities and victims of trafficking for purposes other than sexual exploitation—Conduct further research and programming on trafficking.** There is a dearth of information about the victims of trafficking for other than sexual exploitation.

Some studies indicate that there is a perceived increase in the trafficking of children for forced labor or begging in Southeast Europe (Limanowska, 2003). The profile of these victims could be quite different from that of those trafficked for sexual exploitation. For example, a number of studies seem to point to an increase in the trafficking overseas of Roma children and young women for begging and for commercial sexual exploitation (Limanowska, 2003; Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). Prevention of the trafficking of Roma children for this purpose may require a very different approach from the approach used to prevent trafficking of young women from the main ethnic population. The profiles of victims and methods of recruitment used for trafficking for other kinds of exploitation and from other ethnic minorities need to be researched so that programs can be appropriately targeted.

**Male migrants and other potential migrant workers—Conduct research and awareness-raising campaigns.** Reports from several countries of the region point to an increase in the trafficking of men and the exploitation of male migrants (UNICEF, 2004; GTZ, 2004; Tyuryukanova, 2004). Although the ILO and others have conducted research, few activities have raised awareness of this issue in sending or receiving countries. In fact, possibly as a result of the style and content of trafficking awareness campaigns, there is widespread belief that trafficking in persons is synonymous with trafficking for prostitution. Male and female migrants may therefore be unaware of the risks of migration, of how to migrate safely, or of their rights as a migrant—whether legal or irregular.

### 7.3 UPDATE MESSAGES

**Adapt messages to changing trafficking patterns.** Traffickers change their methods in order to adapt to changing conditions in countries of origin, transit, and destination. Those fighting trafficking must also be constantly adapting. For example, in many countries in the region, as a result of many awareness-raising campaigns, there seems to be awareness that jobs advertised in the papers or by companies may be false (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003; Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). As a result, fewer women are responding to these advertisements and women and their families are more likely to rely on friends, relatives, and acquaintances to find jobs overseas. However, traffickers, too, are changing their tactics and are now recruiting people using informal networks of acquaintances. In Ukraine, one study of 277 victims of trafficking showed that 68 percent were recruited by someone they knew, while only 10 percent responded to advertisements (Winrock Ukraine, 2004b). Parents were often aware that this can lead to deception and abuse, but believed that they could tell if someone was trustworthy (Lazaroiu and Alexandru, 2003). Parents and children in a study in Kosovo also indicated that they would be willing to trust their children to a job offered by someone they knew, even though data taken from assisted victims in Kosovo clearly show that a large percentage of victims knew their trafficker (Roopnaraine, 2002). In Israel, 66 percent of the victims of trafficking interviewed (primarily from Eurasia) were recruited by an acquaintance (Levenkron and Dahan, 2003). In the Baltic States, a large percentage of the public would rely on unreliable sources of information, such as friends or acquaintances (46 percent in Estonia); newspaper advertisements (13 percent in Estonia and Latvia); and even the Internet (21 percent in Estonia) (IOM Helsinki, 2002).

**Tailor messages to the at-risk community.** Trafficking messages also need to be tailored to the particular at-risk group or groups. In Albania, for example, many rural girls are trafficked under pretense of false marriages; children of ethnic minorities may be trafficked for begging (Renton, 2001; Hunzinger and Coffey, 2003). Prevention of these different forms of trafficking may require different public awareness messages. Not only are the methods of traffickers different, but the culture of those at risk also requires a different message to ensure its effectiveness. Targeting an ethnic minority community may require a different message than a campaign aimed at members of the mainstream culture.

Additionally, targeting women who knowingly enter into prostitution may require a different message than targeting those who are deceived with false work or marriage proposals. A study of Ukrainian victims found that 12 percent admitted to knowing they would be in the sex industry prior to departure (Winrock, 2004b). At the end of the Soviet period, prostitution was idealized as *avant garde* and one study found that many teenagers considered prostitution a good career choice (Shelley, 2003). More recently in Russia, one study of potential migrants showed that up to 25 percent of those under age 30 would consider providing sex-related services (Tyuryukanova, 2002). Other studies and interviews showed similar results—that a significant number of trafficking victims are knowingly migrating for prostitution (Levenkron and Dahan, 2003; K. Quinn, personal communication, July 29, 2004). However, many awareness-raising campaigns continue to associate trafficking with luring victims into prostitution and do not provide information regarding deceptions traffickers make about conditions of work and income to be earned.

**Research and raise awareness about differences in migration patterns of successful migrants and those trafficked.** Those interested in migration have probably been exposed to numerous stories of successful migrants. It is these very stories that pique their interest in migration. Studies, such as the one conducted in Ukraine, should be conducted to identify differences between successful migrants and those trafficked. The results of such studies can be used to increase awareness about trafficking and safe migration and can help potential migrants better evaluate their opportunities (UNICEF, 2004). Efforts should also be made to counteract exaggerated claims of success from migrants. Potential migrants should be well informed of the realities of the life of migrant workers abroad.

**Begin awareness-raising campaigns focused on labor migration.** Because trafficking has been so closely associated in this region with prostitution, many migrant workers do not think they are at risk. Additionally, many migrants, including men, women, and children, face terrible abuses and exploitation in the countries of destination. It is important that they be made aware of their rights, of what steps they can take to protect their rights, and of what they can do if their rights are violated.

## 7.4 CONTINUE PROGRAMS THAT TARGET JOURNALISTS, POLICY MAKERS, AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT SERVICE PROVIDERS

Targeting journalists, educators, policy makers, and local government service providers is important in order to

- Ensure that the information they provide to the public is correct,
- Ensure that their treatment of the subject is sensitive and appropriate,
- Demonstrate the importance and urgency of addressing trafficking and the consequences of not addressing it,
- Raise their interest in addressing the issue,
- Increase public support for interventions, and
- Increase and prioritize public resources dedicated to prevention.

As with programs targeting the at-risk community, intensive media campaigns can be important for bringing attention and interest to the issue, but longer in-depth training, workshops, and discussions will be more effective in developing greater knowledge and understanding of the issues. Advocacy efforts may also be effective in increasing public support and public resources for countertrafficking.

## 7.5 PROVIDE TRAINING TO ANTI-TRAFFICKING PRACTITIONERS

It is important that hotlines and information centers are staffed by trained and knowledgeable personnel (UNICEF, 2004). The public trusts this information and may rely on it to make important decisions about their lives. Providing incorrect information could lead to terrible consequences in callers' lives. Donors and implementing agencies alike need to monitor projects for content and need to be sure that the organizations they fund or partner with have the necessary skills to implement the programs responsibly.

## 7.6 REVIEW MECHANISMS FOR DISTRIBUTING MESSAGES

**Continue the work of hotlines/information centers.** Hotline services and information centers need to be continued and, in some cases, expanded. In Ukraine, although a national hotline exists, callers tend to use regional hotlines where they are available. Providers believe that because Ukrainians are not familiar with toll-free numbers, they are uncomfortable using the national number and thus tend to call local numbers when possible. Expanding hotlines and information centers to regions with high rates of migration and trafficking may prove valuable. However, this requires that regional staff are well trained to handle these calls professionally. Mishandled calls could result in people being given false information and becoming even more vulnerable to being trafficked. Both LaStrada in Ukraine and Miramed Institute in Russia work with state employment or migration offices to provide callers with information about the legitimacy of employment firms (K. Levchenko, personal communication, September 9, 2004; J. Engel, personal communication, September 15, 2004). Both organizations feel that the state agencies have more up-to-date information about firms

and that their hotline operators are not in a position to make judgments about a firm's legitimacy. Hotlines and information centers can prevent trafficking by providing the following kinds of services and information.

Job vetting services:

- Checking the license and registration of the employer
- Checking with the embassy of the country of destination on the legitimacy of the employer in the destination country
- Querying clients about the terms of their contracts for clauses that seem suspicious; information centers are able to provide attorneys who can review the terms of the contract with the client
- Querying clients about the type of visa they are obtaining and informing them of the type of visa they need in order to work legally in the destination country
- Providing clients with information on how to get help in the destination country, including numbers and addresses of their embassy and local NGOs
- Providing clients with information about the laws regarding and the rights of migrants and foreign spouses in the destination country
- Informing clients not to give their passport to anyone, and to make a copy of their passport before leaving (leaving one copy in Ukraine and hiding one to take with them)
- Advising clients to learn some of the local language before departing
- Providing clients with information about services available near them to assist them—employment services, social services, shelters, and the like.
- Providing clients with information about the kinds of legal work opportunities available in different countries, and average salaries for such work

Other information and services:

- Crisis counseling
- Referrals for locally available assistance—for health, employment, shelter, legal aid, etc.
- Assistance in locating missing relatives and friends
- Assistance to victims
- Information about marriage to foreigners and child custody issues

**Encourage religious institutions to become involved in trafficking prevention.** In many countries of the region, trust in religious institutions is quite high (UNICEF, 2004). Providing training and resources to religious institutions and encouraging these institutions to provide anti-trafficking and safe migration training to their parishioners may be an inexpensive and effective implementation strategy for reaching a large segment of the population. In Romania, the church has been very active in disseminating anti-trafficking information to its young parishioners (C. Grigorescu, personal communication, August 31, 2004; D. Kozak, personal communication, August 24, 2004).

## **7.7 CONTINUE EMPLOYMENT PROMOTION PROGRAMS**

Anti-trafficking programs should focus on jobs skills training in areas where jobs are available and young women have a demonstrable interest (Blumberg and Shved, 2002). Programs such as those in Ukraine found that the most effective combination of training included a short two-day general job search skills course, which includes resume writing and interview techniques along with trafficking awareness training and safe migration information, in combination with a longer job skills training course. Together, this package of programming provided the at-risk group with the best chance of finding a job locally and the best chance of migrating safely should a local job not be found (A. Heyden, personal communication, July 13, 2004). Similarly, IREX found that participants in programs that provided job skills training had higher rates of post-participation employment than those that provided only empowerment or professional development training (IREX 2004b). In some areas, IREX's partners had especially high rates of success when the training was linked with employment agreements with specific employers whereby the employer agreed to hire all of those who completed the training program (N. Coan, personal communication, August 17, 2004).

## **7.8 INCREASE OPPORTUNITIES FOR SAFE AND LEGAL MIGRATION, AND IMPROVE IMPLEMENTATION MECHANISMS FOR GUEST WORKER AGREEMENTS**

Increased opportunities for safe and legal migration through bilateral or multilateral agreements between destination and sending countries is an important stop-gap measure until local economies improve enough to fully employ the population. As noted in the assessment, however, these agreements are not currently functioning to their maximum capacity; implementation mechanisms need to be improved to increase their effectiveness. Both sending and receiving countries should ensure that the protection of migrant workers is paramount in any agreement—providing for fair wages, health care, and safe and humane living and working conditions. Care should be taken that these programs do not tie a worker to one specific employer in such a way that the employer has undue control over the worker. Workers should be able to legally change employers without leaving the country, to claim unpaid wages, to keep their own travel documents, to join labor unions, and to remain legally in country to participate in legal proceedings or civil suits against employers or traffickers. Taxes or fees paid by recruiting companies can be used to fund a monitoring process that ensures that abuses do not take place within the legal migration system.

## **7.9 IMPLEMENT DEMAND-SIDE INTERVENTIONS**

Indications that clients frequently assist trafficked women, as well as the results of research and the few existing programmatic interventions in this area, such as those in Kosovo and Sweden, point to the benefit of focusing on the demand side to prevent trafficking. Suggestions for possible programmatic interventions include the following:

- Education to discourage the use of prostitution as early as possible, before it becomes habitual.
- Campaigns in destination areas that target clients of prostituted women to raise their awareness of trafficking and to educate them on how to identify a trafficked woman and how to assist her.
- Campaigns in destination areas that make the use of trafficked persons for labor or sexual exploitation illegal and unacceptable (the focus should depend on the prevalent forms of trafficking in the local market). Campaigns should use a combination of criminalization and sanctions, as well as social stigmatization—diminishing the users in the eyes of society in order to discourage such use and playing on morality, status, or other factors that influence local behavior.

Special attention should be paid to addressing demand in post-conflict situations where international peacekeeping forces or military contractors have been implicated in trafficking cases (notably Bosnia and Herzegovina; see Vandenberg 2002) and are perceived by the local population to have had a prominent role in creating demand for or in closing their eyes to organized criminal groups that are also trafficking women for sexual exploitation (R. Pojman, personal communication, September 27, 2004).

Because these kinds of programs have not yet been tested, it would be necessary to pilot such programs using reliable impact or results-oriented indicators to determine if they are effective and complementary prevention strategies—especially for use in destination areas.

## 7.10 COLLECT DATA

Anti-trafficking practitioners, especially those who work with trafficked persons or those at risk for trafficking, should collect and share more information about their clients. Valuable information can be learned from collecting and analyzing these data, which could be applied to trafficking prevention programming (as well as for victim services, prosecution, and advocacy efforts).<sup>7</sup> More could be learned about risk factors, *modus operandi* of traffickers, ways in which victims can escape, and the like. Governments could provide a centralized mechanism for such information sharing.

---

<sup>7</sup> Some NGOs and IOs have started to collect and share data regarding profiles of trafficking victims. For detailed information regarding available data in South Eastern Europe, see Hunzinger and Coffey (2003).

**ANNEX A**  
**ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY**



## ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

**Aguire. Executive Summary (Draft), submitted to USAID/E&E.**

Draft of an Executive Summary of an assessment based upon the Review of Program Assumptions, a stocktaking exercise carried out by USAID's Bureau for Europe and Eurasia (E&E). The study is designed to highlight the many changes in the roles of men and women in the areas of the economy, civil society, and the social safety net that have taken place as the countries of Central and Eastern Europe and the Newly Independent States attempt to re-make themselves.

**Anderson, B., and Davidson, J. (2003). Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A Multi-Country Pilot Study. IOM: Geneva, Switzerland.**

The report explores the demand for trafficking in the following countries: Sweden, India, Japan, Thailand, and Italy. In terms of trafficking, the report focuses primarily on the demand for domestic labor and prostitution. The report explores the attitudes of customers of prostitutes and employers of domestic labor. Researchers identified attitudes toward trafficked and otherwise "unfree" labor.

**Araujo-Forlot, A. (2002). Prevention, Protection, and Assistance Schemes to Victims of Trafficking: Policy and Examples of IOM Prevention and Return and Reintegration Programs. IOM: Vienna. Retrieved June 30, 2004, from <http://www.belgium.iom.int/STOPConference/relevantdocs/011%20IOM%20Vienna%20A.%20Araujo-Forlot.pdf>**

The primary focus of this paper is IOM's experience in the anti-trafficking field in Central and Eastern Europe and the Balkans. It focuses specifically on prevention and direct assistance to victims—namely, IOM's information campaigns in Kosovo and examples of return and reintegration scheme in Romania.

**Arnold, J., and Doni, C. (2002). USAID/Moldova Anti-Trafficking Assessment—Critical Gaps in and Recommendations for Anti-Trafficking Activities. Development Alternatives Inc.**

This report provides a road map of existing trafficking-prevention activities undertaken by donor agencies and bilateral, international development and host-country government institutions and nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) in Moldova, and identifies critical gaps in existing approaches in Moldova that new interventions might address. It also provides a list of recommendations for the U.S. government in terms of programming in Moldova. The assessment analyzes existing trafficking programs, legislation, and enforcement.

**Aronowitz, A. (2003). Anti-Trafficking Programs in Albania: Final Report (Public). Management Systems International.**

Overview of trafficking in Albania including analysis of corruption and trafficking, programs in Albania, strengths and weaknesses, and recommendations. The section on programs in Albania is quite extensive and includes legislation and national strategy, law enforcement and investigation, prosecution and judiciary, prevention: public awareness and awareness-raising campaigns, victim protection, reintegration, long-term sustainable projects to combat root causes, and bilateral and international cooperation.

**Blumberg, R., and Shved, O. (2002). Curbing Sex Slavery Abroad By Helping Women Earn a Living in Ukraine: Assessment of the Economic-Empowerment Aspects of the Anti-Trafficking Project, USAID/Kiev. Development Alternatives Inc.: Washington.**

This assessment focuses primarily on the economic aspects of the USAID/Kiev-funded Anti-Trafficking Program (ATP). The assessment concludes that the primary factor for Ukrainian women seeking work abroad is lack of opportunity in-country; thus, mission strategy should focus on providing economic opportunities for women within Ukraine. The assessment also concludes that USAID/Kiev's ATP is in a particularly strong position to implement this economic-empowerment strategy. The assessment further addresses both strengths and weaknesses in the ATP and makes recommendations for future models/programming.

**Brodman, J. (2003). ICT to Support Anti-Trafficking Activities: Recommendations to USAID/Macedonia. Dot-ORG: Washington.**

This document is a report from an assessment of the potential role for information and communications technologies in combating trafficking in persons in Macedonia. The emphasis of the report is on the role ICT can play in fostering collaboration and cooperation among NGOs in Macedonia and eventually in the region, but it also includes examples of how ICT can foster collaboration among NGOs, the government, and donors.

**Coffey, P., Moens, B., Nurkic, E., and Lopez, C. (2004). Situation Paper on Human Trafficking in the Europe and Eurasia Region: Proposed Response and Recommendations for Building an Anti-Trafficking in Persons Network. Development Alternatives Inc.: Washington.**

This is a study commissioned by USAID/Washington to examine the potential impact of developing countertrafficking networks in Europe and Eurasia. The study provides a comprehensive overview of trafficking in the region, as well as responses to it. The study analyzes gaps in responses that could be addressed through establishment of a regional network and provides a framework for development of such a network.

**Creative Associates International (2004). The Albanian Alliance Against Human Trafficking. Quarterly Activity and Financial Reports. October–December 2003, January–March 2004.**

Summary of current activities, problem areas and areas of concern, and anticipated activities for this countertrafficking project in Albania. The program includes prevention, services for victims, and the collection of data to strengthen countertrafficking measures in Albania.

**DemNet (2003): DemNet Partners Progress—Quarterly Internal Review Form. Democracy Network Program: Macedonia**

Summary of countertrafficking activities funded through the DemNet partnership program in Macedonia. Partnership activities include awareness raising, prevention, and services for victims.

**Department of State (2001-2004). Trafficking in Persons Reports — 2001, 2002, 2003, and 2004. U.S. Department of State: Washington**

Annual reports written and distributed by the U.S. Department of State providing a brief overview of trafficking and responses to trafficking in countries around the world. The report provides a ranking of countries based on efforts made by countries to respond to the problem. The report also includes information on best practices and lessons learned from around the world.

**ECPAT (End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography, and Trafficking of Children for Sexual Purposes). Development of Local Capacity to Combat Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Eight Countries of Central and Eastern Europe: A Summary Report on Multi-disciplinary Seminars.  
[http://www.ecpat.net/eng/Ecpat\\_inter/Publication/Other/English/Pdf\\_page/ecpat\\_report\\_eastern\\_europe.pdf](http://www.ecpat.net/eng/Ecpat_inter/Publication/Other/English/Pdf_page/ecpat_report_eastern_europe.pdf)**

This report summarizes seminars held in Poland, the Baltic States, Bulgaria, Slovakia and the Czech Republic, and Hungary. The summaries describe the organization of the seminars as well as their difficulties and shortcomings. The report also includes recommendations for the future.

**Edwards, D. (2003). USAID Anti-Trafficking Workshop Report. Training Resource Group, Inc.: Tirana, Albania**

The report summarizes the results of a countertrafficking workshop in Albania. The report includes workshop goals and agenda, summary of findings presented to the workshop, summary of working group questions and discussions, and workshop advice to USAID.

**Ekberg, G. (2003). Best Practices for Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking of Women: The Swedish Law that Prohibits the Purchase of Sexual Services (1998:408). Ministry of Industry, Employment, and Communications: Stockholm, Sweden.**

This report provides an overview of the impact of the Swedish law prohibiting the purchase of sexual services on the reduction of prostitution and on the reduction of trafficking for the purpose of prostitution in Sweden.

**El-Cherkeh, T., Stirbu, E., Lazaroiu, S., and Radu, D. (2004). EU-Enlargement, Migration and Trafficking in Women: The Case of South Eastern Europe. Hamburgisches Welt-Wirtschafts-Archiv (HWWA) Hamburg Institute of International Economics: Hamburg, Germany.**

This research reports on the impact of EU expansion on changing migration patterns and trafficking in women from South Eastern Europe, particularly Bulgaria, Moldova, and Romania, to the European Union.

**Engel, J. (2001). Statistical Abstract and Summary Report of Russia's First Multi-Regional, Multi-Media Public Education Anti-Trafficking Campaign. Prepared for The Angel Coalition and Miramed Institute.**

Based upon a 100-day media campaign launched May 16, 2001, in Moscow, Nizhniy Novgorod, Yugoslav, Petrozavodsk, and Veliki Novgorod. The campaign included distribution of literature, bus posters, metro cards, and TV and radio spots. A telephone hotline was also opened. The report includes project description and evaluations. The report also includes a sample hotline response questionnaire.

**Engel, J. (2004). The Russian Project: Activity Report for Six Months February–July, 2004. Miramed Institute: Moscow.**

This is a report on the project activities from February to July, 2004. The program includes prevention work and victim services throughout Russia.

**GTZ (2004). Coercion in the Kidney Trade? A Background Study on Trafficking in Human Organs Worldwide. Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH: Eschborn, Germany.**

This study examines the scope and trends of trafficking in human organs around the world. The study explores the myths and realities of the trade in human organs, examines the cost of such trade to the donors or sellers of organs, and looks at policies and regulations to prevent these human rights violations.

**Gupta, R., Kurbiel, L., Shelley, L., and Tirnauer, J. (2004). Trafficking in the ANE Region: Problem Analysis and Proposed Framework for USAID Response. Development Alternatives, Inc.: Washington.**

The report provides a framework for anti-trafficking work in the Asia and Near East region. It identifies priorities for anti-trafficking efforts in the region and suggest methods to integrate anti-trafficking activities into specific USAID sectors.

**Hadley, E. (N.D.). Prostitution: Solutions for a Global Problem. Gender Policy Review, downloaded from [www.menstuff.org](http://www.menstuff.org), July 2004.**

This is a brief article articulating the author's reasons for believing that legalization of prostitution will not improve the lives of women in prostitution.

**Hughes, D. (2002). Trafficking of Sexual Exploitation: The Case of the Russian Federation, IOM: Geneva. Retrieved June 29, 2004, from [http://www.iom.int/DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/mrs\\_7\\_2002.pdf](http://www.iom.int/DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/mrs_7_2002.pdf)**

Hughes begins her examination of trafficking for sexual exploitation with an exploration into the factors contributing to the explosion of this phenomenon in Russia. She explores poverty and unemployment, economic inequality, and violence in Russian society (battering, sexual violence, sexual terror, etc.). The report spends quite a bit of time examining links between trafficking and Russian organized crime. Hughes also examines different forms of sexual exploitation in the context of the Russian Federation, including prostitution, pornography, and bride trafficking. The report also examines regional trafficking patterns, noting key origin, transit, and destination points.

**Huntington, D. (2002). Anti-trafficking Programs in South Asia: Appropriate Activities, Indicators, and Evaluation Methodologies. Population Council: New Delhi. [http://www.popcouncil.org/pdfs/rr/anti\\_trafficking\\_asia.pdf](http://www.popcouncil.org/pdfs/rr/anti_trafficking_asia.pdf)**

Based upon a Technical Consultative Meeting held in Kathmandu, Nepal, September 11–13, 2001, regarding appropriate activities to address human trafficking, this report focuses on three practical objects: clarification of conceptual frameworks to define trafficking, identification of intervention models in the South Asian context, and identification of program evaluation methodologies.

**Hunzinger, L., and Coffey, P. (2003). First Annual Report on Victims of Trafficking in South Eastern Europe. Regional Clearing Point, IOM, ICMC, Stability Pact for South Eastern Europe: Task Force on Trafficking in Human Beings: Vienna.**

This report examines the status of trafficking in Southeastern Europe, including a regional overview as well as specific country/entity studies of Albania, Bulgaria, Moldova, Romania, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Kosovo, FYR Macedonia, Montenegro, and Serbia. The report includes data regarding victim profiles, victim assistance and protection programs, numbers of victims identified, and methods of identification and referral for assistance. The report also identifies

areas for improvement and recognizes good practices and effective measures taken in programming.

**ICMC (International Catholic Migration Commission) Croatia (2003). Victims Assistance and Protection Program for Women Rescued From Trafficking. Final Report, submitted to USAID. International Catholic Migration Commission: Zagreb.**

**IHF (International Helsinki Federation) (2000a). An Investigation into the Status of Women's Rights in Central and South-Eastern Europe and the Newly Independent States. International Helsinki Federation.**

**IHF (2000b). A Form of Slavery: Trafficking in Women in OSCE Member States. International Helsinki Federation. Retrieved June 28, 2004, from [http://www.ihf-hr.org/viewbinary/viewdocument.php?doc\\_id=1948](http://www.ihf-hr.org/viewbinary/viewdocument.php?doc_id=1948)**

Provides brief descriptions of human trafficking in OSCE member states.

**ILO/IPEC (International Labour Organization/International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour) Ukraine (2003). Trafficking in Children for Forced Labour and Sexual Exploitation in Ukraine: Draft Report prepared by Center for Social Expertises, National Academy of Sciences, Ukraine.**

This report provides an overview of the problem of trafficking of children in Ukraine, addressing key areas including legislation, effective laws and national policies, profiles of trafficked children and groups at risk, recruitment processes and trafficking routes, working conditions and outcomes of the trafficking movement, withdrawal and reintegration, and the actions taken by the Ukrainian government to tackle this issue. The authors also provide recommendations of strategies to contribute to the implementation of concerted actions at the local, national, bilateral, and subregional levels.

**InterBilim (2001). Evaluation Report of the IOM Project: Building Capacity to Combat Trafficking of Human Beings in the Kyrgyz Republic. International Center ("InterBilim"): Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan.**

The purpose of the project is to raise the awareness among the population of the problem of trafficking in human beings in the Kyrgyz Republic and to develop programs of collaboration to combat trafficking in human beings in Kyrgyzstan. The evaluation includes project goals, project implementation, evaluation methodology, and project analysis (including analysis of strengths and weaknesses).

**IOM (International Organization for Migration) Central Asia (2003). Combating Trafficking in Persons in Central Asia: Prevention, Prosecution (Legislation), Protection. International Organization for Migration.**

Provides an overview of IOM's "three-pronged" approach to combating trafficking (prevention, protection, and prosecution) and how it will be applied to the countries of

Central Asia, including Kazakhstan, Tajikistan, and Uzbekistan. The report also provides an overview of IOM's regional approach. The report deals with each country specifically, including country summaries, project descriptions, information on legislation and implementation of laws, and specific work plans, expected results, and methods for evaluation.

**IOM Croatia (2003). Final Report: Prevention of Trafficking in Human Beings. Zagreb, Croatia. International Organization for Migration.**

Overview of awareness-raising campaign in Croatia, funded by USAID and in partnership with the Royal Netherlands Embassy and the Government of Croatia. Includes project description/goals, analysis of results, examination of activities, analysis of constraints, and discussion of financial matters. Report concludes with analysis of outcomes and basic conclusions/recommendations.

**IOM Georgia (N.D.). Summary Document: Trafficking and Irregular Migration Report. International Organization for Migration.**

This report based on research carried out in the first half of 2001 reveals the extent of trafficking and irregular migration from Georgia. A total of 577 trafficking victims, irregular migrants, and potential migrants were interviewed by IOM and Georgian NGOs.

**IOM Georgia. (2001). Hardship Abroad or Hunger at Home: A Study of Irregular Migration from Georgia. International Organization for Migration. Retrieved June 29, 2004, from [http://www.iom.int/DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/Georgia\\_report\\_sep\\_01.pdf](http://www.iom.int/DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/Georgia_report_sep_01.pdf)**

Based on small-scale research in 2000, IOM conducted in-depth research related to irregular migration from Georgia. The report includes a survey on irregular migration, information on asylum migration, transit migration, potentials for irregular migration from Georgia in the future, and the involvement of Government in Georgia. Recommendations are also provided, and appendixes include questionnaires, asylum applications, and statistics.

**IOM Helsinki (2002). Public Perception and Awareness of Trafficking in Women in the Baltic States (2). International Organization for Migration: Vilnius, Lithuania.**

**IOM Kazakhstan (2003). Final Report to the Swedish Agency for International Development (SIDA) and the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID): Combating Trafficking in Human Beings From, To, Through and Within Kazakhstan (Year II). International Organization for Migration**

This project report from project period August 1, 2002–September 30, 2003, provides a summary of project programs/initiatives, including a project description, list of activities, activity descriptions, and results.

**IOM Kosovo (2003). IOM Counter Trafficking Re-integration to Kosovar Victims of Trafficking: Project Activities and Implementation Interim Report, October 2003–December 2003. International Organization for Migration.**

Description and summary of a program, funded by USAID, that supports Kosovar women and children who have been entrapped within the network of human trafficking and/or who are highly vulnerable to becoming its future victims. The program provides direct assistance to Kosovar victims, in particular women and children, and supports and develops the resources and capacities of local governmental and nongovernmental institutions in counteracting trafficking.

**IOM Kosovo (2004). IOM Counter Trafficking Re-integration to Kosovar Victims of Trafficking: Project Activities and Implementation Interim Report, January 2004–March 2004. International Organization for Migration.**

Description and summary of a program, funded by USAID, that supports Kosovar women and children who have been entrapped within the network of human trafficking and/or who are highly vulnerable to becoming its future victims. The program provides direct assistance to Kosovar victims, in particular women and children, and supports and develops the resources and capacities of local governmental and nongovernmental institutions in counteracting trafficking.

**IOM Kyrgyzstan (2001). Final Report: Building Capacity to Combat Trafficking of Human Beings in the Kyrgyz Republic. Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan. International Organization for Migration.**

Includes project rationale, overview of goals and objectives, implementation procedures, and lessons learned/shortcomings encountered. The primary goal of this project was to raise awareness of the dangerous and inhumane conditions and treatment faced by trafficked migrants and to develop anti-trafficking programming with a focus on the criminalization of trafficking, the development of instructions for the police, sensitization against blaming the victim, information campaigns, and direct assistance projects.

**IOM Legal Frameworks (2003). Analysis of Institutional and Legal Frameworks and Overview of Cooperation Patterns in the Field of Counter Trafficking in Eastern Europe and Central Asia. International Organization for Migration.**

This report provides research related to countertrafficking legislation and institutional structures in Eastern European and Central Asian countries. The report provides a situation analysis, an analysis of national legislation, an analysis of regional and international legislation, an analysis of bilateral and multilateral instruments, an analysis of institutional structures and their activities, and an analysis of law enforcement aspects.

**IOM Romania (2001). Vulnerability to Trafficking in Human Beings of Young Female Population in Romania. International Organization for Migration: Bucharest.**

This report offers specific identification of what makes Romanian women vulnerable to trafficking. The report includes analysis of living conditions/situations, education, beliefs/values, and abuse in terms of the roles these factors play in contributing to a woman's vulnerability to trafficking. The report includes a profile of the vulnerable Romanian girl, a list of the main factors of vulnerability, and a section on research methodology.

**IOM Ukraine (1998). Information Campaign Against Trafficking in Women from Ukraine. International Organization for Migration.**

[http://www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/ukr\\_traf\\_wom\\_res\\_rep.pdf](http://www.iom.int//DOCUMENTS/PUBLICATION/EN/ukr_traf_wom_res_rep.pdf)

This report provides research on trafficking in Ukraine, including migration intentions, from migration intentions to trafficking, and characteristics of women at risk for trafficking. The report also includes a survey questionnaire and regional survey data.

**IREX (International Research & Exchanges Board) (N.D.). Women's Programs Information Sheet. International Research & Exchanges Board: Washington.**

Brief descriptions of IREX's Women's Programs, including Trafficking Prevention and Information Dissemination (TPID), Southeastern European Communities Against Trafficking (SECAT), and the Regional Empowerment Initiative for Women (REIW).

**IREX (N.D.). Tajikistan Fact Sheet. Eurasia Professional Exchanges and Training Program for Tajikistan: An Anti-Trafficking Program for Media Professionals. International Research & Exchanges Board: Washington.**

Information related to program funded by the Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs (ECA) of the U.S. Department of State. Includes information on training and consultation, the small grants program, and Web-based information resources. Program objectives are also listed, including increasing awareness of trafficking issues among media and increasing available information on the subject.

**IREX (2003a). Regional Empowerment Initiative for Women (REIW) Activity Highlights: March–May 2003, June–August 2003, and December–February 2003. International Research & Exchanges Board: Washington.**

Highlights of program activity during these quarters.

**IREX (2003b). Trafficking Prevention and Information Dissemination (TPID) Semi-Annual Report—April 1–September 30, 2003. International Research & Exchanges Board: Moscow.**

This report provides a summary and examination of IREX's administration of the USAID-funded Trafficking Prevention and Information Dissemination Program for the period April

1–September 30, 2003. Report includes a summary of the activities of all TPID organizations engaged in anti-trafficking activities and job skills, leadership, and business trainings, as well as an overview of IREX’s administration of the TPID program, covering all of the activities that support partner organizations in the field. Upcoming activities are also covered, including selection of new partner organizations and continuing oversight and administration of the established network.

**IREX (2004a). Trafficking Prevention and Information Dissemination (TPID) Semi-Annual Report—October 1–March 31, 2004. International Research & Exchanges Board: Moscow.**

This report provides a summary and examination of IREX’s administration of the USAID-funded Trafficking Prevention and Information Dissemination Program for the period October 1–March 31, 2004. Report includes a summary of the activities of all TPID organizations engaged in anti-trafficking activities and job skills, leadership, and business trainings, as well as an overview of IREX’s administration of the TPID program, covering all of the activities that support partner organizations in the field. Upcoming activities are also covered, including selection of new partner organizations and continuing oversight and administration of the established network.

**IREX (2004b). Analysis Report of REIW Follow-up Survey – draft. International Research & Exchanges Board: Washington**

**Kartusch, A. (2001). Reference Guide for Anti-Trafficking Legislative Review: With Particular Emphasis on South Eastern Europe. Luwig Boltzmann Institute of Human Rights, ODIHR, OSCE: Vienna.**

This book provides an overview of countertrafficking legislation and implementation of international instruments in the countries of Southeast Europe. The book also includes information on countertrafficking policies and program interventions in the region.

**Kelly, E. (2002). Journeys of Jeopardy: A Review of Research on Trafficking in Women and Children in Europe. IOM: London.**

Provides an assessment of the current state of knowledge regarding the trafficking of women and children in Europe. Includes current baseline data and analysis of the following: causes of trafficking, organization of trafficking (patterns and flows), sexual exploitation and its consequences, focus on traffickers and exploiters, and prevention and awareness-raising. Also includes information related to assessing countertrafficking strategies, gaps in knowledge, and linking local and global knowledge.

**Kilvington, J., Day, S., and War, H. (2001). Prostitution Policy in Europe: A Time of Change? *Feminist Review* Spring 2001, Volume 67, Number 1, Pages 78-93. Downloaded August 1, 2004 from <http://www.palgrave-journals.com/cgi-taf/DynaPage.taf?file=/fr/journal/v67/n1/abs/9496707a.html>**

**Kligman, G., and Limoncelli, S. (2004). Trafficking Women after Socialism: From, To and Through Eastern Europe. Retrieved June 29, 2004, from [http://www.europanet.org/conference2004/papers/F4\\_Kligman\\_Limon.pdf](http://www.europanet.org/conference2004/papers/F4_Kligman_Limon.pdf)**

Explores aspects of trafficking in Europe including trafficking routes, push/pull factors, and changes related to the collapse of communism in Eastern Europe.

**Kvinnoforum (2002). A Resource Book for Working Against Trafficking in Women and Girls: Baltic Sea Region. Retrieved June 30, 2004, from <http://www.qweb.kvinnoforum.se/misc/resurs2002x.pdf>**

The third edition of this book is broken down into three sections. Section I includes a global overview of trafficking. Section II introduces the networking projects conducted in six countries in the region. Section III provides resource details including contact information.

**La Strada Ukraine (N.D.). Activity Report: Project on Prevention of Trafficking in Persons. LaStrada Ukraine and the République Française: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This report provides highlights of La Strada's work and includes results from surveys of at-risk groups—comparing data from 2001 with data from 2003.

**La Strada Ukraine (2004a). Preventing Trafficking in People: Cooperation Between State Bodies and Non-Governmental Organizations. La Strada Ukraine and the Ministry for Family, Children and Youth Affairs: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This report provides an overview of trafficking in Ukraine and suggestions for ways in which NGOs and government can collaborate to combat trafficking. It also includes results from surveys of at-risk groups and trafficked women.

**La Strada Ukraine (2004b). Analysis of the Hotline Activity on Prevention of Trafficking in Persons in Ukraine and Possible Ways of their Development. La Strada Ukraine and the Ukrainian Institute for Social Research: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This report analyzes hotline usage in Ukraine and provides recommendations for the operation of hotlines and for improvement of the hotline system.

**La Strada Ukraine (2004c). National Referral Mechanism of Social Assistance to Trafficked Persons in Ukraine. La Strada Ukraine and the State Institute for Family and Youth: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This report analyzes the legislative and operational environment in Ukraine for its applicability to the delivery of social assistance for trafficked persons. The report also includes information from a survey of trafficked persons about their service needs.

**Lazaroiu, S., and Alexandru, M. (2003). Who Is the Next Victim? Trafficking in Romania. IOM.**

This report analyzes the results of a study of those considered at risk for trafficking.

**Levenkron, N., and Dahan, Y. (2003). Women as Commodities: Trafficking in Women in Israel 2003. Hotline for Migrant Workers. Isha L'Isha - Haifa Feminist Center, & Adva Center: Tel Aviv. <http://www.december18.net/web/docpapers/doc942.pdf>**

This report provides analysis of the following: trafficking worldwide, victims of trafficking (myth and reality), how the Israeli authorities deal with trafficking in women, and the protection and rehabilitation of trafficking victims. The report concludes with concrete recommendations on how to better combat trafficking in the Israeli context.

**Limanowska, B. (2003). Trafficking of Human Beings in Southeast Europe, 2003 Update on Situation and Response. UNICEF, OSCE, UNOHCHR.**

This report provides an in-depth description of trafficking in each of the countries of Southeast Europe, with a special focus on prosecution and victim services. The report also analyzes trends in the region, changing trafficking patterns, and gaps in current responses.

**Merriam-Webster (2004). Online Dictionary. Accessed on July 5, 2004, at <http://www.merriam-webster.com>.**

**Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications (2004). Prostitution and Trafficking in Women. Ministry of Industry, Employment and Communications: Stockholm.**

This is a fact sheet about the Swedish Government's response to prostitution and trafficking of women. It describes the impact of the law on prostitution in Sweden that penalizes those who purchase sex. The fact sheet also briefly describes some of Sweden's efforts to assist countries in the Balkans to combat trafficking of women.

**Minnesota Advocates (2000a). Trafficking in Women—Moldova and Ukraine. Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights.**

This report addresses current conditions, NGO and governmental responses, and obligations under international law for trafficking in Moldova and Ukraine. It specifically addresses the rights of women in Moldova and Ukraine being denied and failures to protect these women from trafficking abuses. The report provides specific recommendations to the governments of Ukraine and Moldova. The initial research was done in collaboration with Winrock International as part of a larger project entitled DOS-INL Anti-Domestic Violence and Trafficking in Women and Children Project.

**Minnesota Advocates (2000b). Domestic Violence in Moldova. Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights: Minneapolis.**

This report provides an overview of domestic violence in Moldova, including information on forms of abuse, responses to abuse, and breadth of abuse.

**Minnesota Advocates (2000c). Domestic Violence in Ukraine. Minnesota Advocates for Human Rights: Minneapolis.**

This report provides an overview of domestic violence in Ukraine, including sections on Ukrainian laws and implementation and Ukraine's obligations under international law (UN and the Council of Europe). The report also provides specific recommendations for the Ukrainian Government in terms of dealing with this issue. The initial research was done in collaboration with Winrock International as part of a larger project entitled DOS-INL Anti-Domestic Violence and Trafficking in Women and Children Project.

**MSI (Management Systems International) (1999). USAID/Ukraine Anti-Trafficking Program Strategy Review and Legal Component Design. Management Systems International.**

This report reviews USAID's strategy in combating trafficking in women in Ukraine and provides assistance in the design of a protection component. The report provides specific strategy priorities, including the design of a legal component. The study provides overall considerations, including a study of what is currently being done in-country, what gaps remain in data collection and root causes of trafficking in Ukraine.

**MSI (2003). Midterm Evaluation of the USDOL/IREX Regional Empowerment Initiative for Women: Romania, Bulgaria, Serbia, Moldova, and Lithuania. Management Systems International.**

Mid-term evaluation of pilot program to provide women with job skills and training to promote economic alternatives for women as a means to address trafficking in persons. Includes lessons learned and analysis of project descriptions, project performance, stakeholder commitment, project management, sustainability, project design and validity, and the U.S. Department of Labor's comparative advantage in anti-trafficking activities.

**Raymond, J. (2003). 10 Reasons for *Not* Legalizing Prostitution. CATW: Amherst, Massachusetts.**

The author articulates reasons why she believes that legalizing prostitution does not improve the life of women in prostitution and actually helps to create conditions in which trafficking can thrive.

**Renton, D. (2001). Child Trafficking in Albania. Save the Children.**

Provides an overview of trafficking in Albania, with emphasis and particular attention paid to the trafficking of women and girls into prostitution. The report includes information on fear and awareness in Albania, the reintegration of girls and women to Albania, and other forms of child trafficking. The report offers recommendations and case studies.

**Romanian Family Health Initiative (2002). Annual Report for Fiscal Year One: October 2001–September 2002.**

This reports on the project activities for the year 2001–2002.

**Romanian Family Health Initiative (2003). Annual Report for Fiscal Year Two: October 2002–September 2003.**

This reports on the project activities for the year 2002–2003.

**Roopnaraine, T. (2002). Child Trafficking in Kosovo. Save the Children Kosovo.**

This report provides analysis/research of trafficking in Kosovo including information regarding the demand side of trafficking, the supply side, trafficking routes, recruitment, and figures of trafficking in Kosovo. The report also addresses field data on victims and vulnerability, and concludes with analysis and recommendations.

**Rosenberg, R. (ed.) (2003). Trafficking of Indonesian Women and Children. Jakarta, Indonesia: ICMC and ACILS**

This book provides an overview of the problem of trafficking of women and children in Indonesia. The book compiles information from research on prostitution, migrant work, domestic work, child labor, and other areas related to trafficking. The authors analyze trafficking patterns, trafficking's consequences for victims and society, and victims profiles, as well as how cultural factors, corruption, and other factors form the environment in which trafficking takes place.

**Rosenberg, R., and Arnold, J. (2002). Gender Assessment and Plan of Action for USAID/Romania. Development Alternatives Inc: Bethesda.**

This assessment analyzes USAID's portfolio of activities in Romania from a gender perspective, looking for targets of opportunity for improving existing programs, ensuring that critical target groups were not inadvertently being left out of programs, and identifying gaps in programming.

**Rudd, J. (2001). A Report on Trafficking Prevention Efforts in Ukraine: Impact of the Women for Women Centers on At-Risk Teen and Adult Centers. Winrock International/USAID.**

This report provides an analysis of research conducted with younger participants of the Winrock anti-trafficking project activities in Ukraine. Detailed data from the study are provided.

**Rudd, J. (2002). Summary Report of Trafficking of Women in Ukraine. Winrock International/USAID.**

Provides a summary of the findings of two studies commissioned by Winrock International and funded by USAID to assess trafficking prevention efforts in Ukraine. Provides specific findings and recommendations based upon studies carried out through three of the Women for Women Centers and a UISS random sample of women and girls from five different oblasts in Ukraine.

**Rysaliev, A. (2003). External Evaluation Report: Technical Assistance to the Government of Kyrgyzstan in the implementation of the Plan of Action—Combating Trafficking and Smuggling in Human Beings. International Organization for Migration: Bishkek, Kyrgyzstan.**

**Shelley, L. (2003). The Trade in People from the Former Soviet Union. Crime, Law & Social Change: 231-249. Kluwer Academic Publishers: The Netherlands.**

Research on trafficking and smuggling in the former Soviet Union, with a special emphasis on Russia and Ukraine. Comparisons are made with smuggling and trafficking in China, and the document includes an analysis of the crimes from a business perspective. Some of the results are based on research funded through the Transnational Crime and Corruption Center at American University in Washington, D.C.

**SIDA (Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency) (2003). Evaluation of IOM Regional Counter-Trafficking Programme in the Western Balkans. Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency, Stiftelsen Kvinnoforum, Kvinna Till Kvinna: Stockholm.**

This report evaluates the SIDA-sponsored IOM Programme of Assistance for the Protection, Return, and Reintegration of Trafficked Women and Children in Albania, Bosnia-Herzegovina, FYR of Macedonia, Kosovo, Serbia, and Montenegro. Rather than an assessment of trafficking in the Western Balkans or an evaluation of IOM's overall programming, it is only an assessment of SIDA-sponsored programs. Bosnia-Herzegovina and Serbia are the two countries examined in detail, although a short overview of the region is provided. The evaluation specifically analyzes goal attainment and project outcome, as well as central issues and findings. The evaluation provides specific recommendations to both SIDA and IOM regarding future programming, including stronger collaboration, evaluation, and development of clear strategy.

**TDH (Terre des Hommes) (2003). Report on Trafficking of Albanian Children in Greece. Terre des Hommes.**

**TDH (2003-2004). TACT Quarterly Program Report to USAID—Nos. 1, 2, 3, & 4. Terre des Hommes**

This reports on the project activities for the year 2003 and the first part of 2004.

**Todosov, A. (2001). Activity Report - Contract 121-c-00-00-00829-00. Advertising-Information Agency. Submitted to USAID, Kiev, Ukraine.**

This internal report from the local producers to USAID reviews the steps taken in the development and distribution of a documentary film on trafficking in Ukraine.

**Tyuryukanova, E. (2002). Labor Migration of Women from Russia: Trafficking in Human Beings and HIV/AIDS. ILO: Moscow.**

The study reviews labor migration trends from Russia, with an emphasis on sex trafficking and HIV/AIDS.

**Tyuryukanova, E. (2004). Forced Labour in Modern Russia: Illegal Migration and Trafficking in People. ILO: Moscow.**

This report documents the different forms of forced labor and similar practices being applied to illegal migrants in Russia, methods used in their exploitation, factors creating the demand, and the legal and regulatory environment in which it takes place.

**Ukraine, Government of (2002). Comprehensive Program of Combating the Trafficking in People (2002–2005).**

Provides proposals for prevention programs to be implemented by the Government of Ukraine in the area of trafficking in persons. Includes proposals for further research, economic development, and information campaigns.

**Ukrainian Institute (2001). Nationwide Survey: “Trafficking in Women as a Social Problem in Ukrainian Society.” Summary of Findings. Commissioned by Winrock International and USAID. Social Monitoring Center and Ukrainian Institute of Social Studies: Kiev, Ukraine**

This report presents the findings from research on public attitudes and opinions on trafficking and migration in Ukraine.

**UNICEF (2003). Guidelines for the Protection for the Rights of Children Victims Trafficking in Southeastern Europe.**

Include specific guidelines in areas such as identification, appointment of guardian, questioning, interviewing and initial action, referral and coordination/cooperation, interim care and protection, regularization of status, individual case assessment and identification of a durable solution, access to justice, training, and victim/witness security and protection. This report also provides guidelines for implementation at the country level.

**UNICEF (2004). Trafficking in Ukraine: An Assessment of Current Responses. OSCE, UNICEF, USAID, British Council, Ministry of Family, Children and Youth of Ukraine: Kiev.**

This is a draft report of the trafficking situation in Ukraine. The report describes changing trafficking patterns in Ukraine and analyzes responses to trafficking in Ukraine. The report offers recommendations for future programming efforts.

**UNICEF UK. (2003). End Child Exploitation. Stop the Traffic.**

End Child Exploitation is an awareness-raising program to end child exploitation. This report is the second in a series and addresses, specifically, child trafficking. The report addresses the scale of the problem, the background/history of the problem, regional patterns, and methods employed to end child trafficking.

**USAID/Bucharest. (2002). Memorandum: Approval of the Micro, Small and Medium Sized Enterprises (MSME) Program. U.S. Agency for International Development: Bucharest, Romania.**

Memorandum regarding the approval of the project. Memo introduces the project, analyzes the scope of the problem and need for the project, explains the relationship of the activity to USAID/Romania's Results Framework, and provides a summary of activities and expected results, including building on the assistance initiated through the Legal, Regulatory and Bureaucratic Reform in Romania activity. There is a section on the analytical/consultation process, on the pre-obligation requirements, on the financial plan, and on an activity monitoring plan.

**USAID/Kiev (2004). Diagram: Anti-Trafficking Initiative. U.S. Agency for International Development: Kiev, Ukraine.**

A diagram of USAID anti-trafficking interventions in Ukraine.

**USAID/Moscow (N.D.). Scope of Work (SOW) for the Mandatory Gender Assessment Associated with the Preparation of USAID/Russia's Country Strategy.**

Scope of Work for a gender assessment by USAID/Russia, the goal of which is to identify key gender issues and gender constraints that need to be addressed in the proposed program as part of the process of developing the new strategic plan for FY 2006–2011, and to provide an assessment of the existing country program portfolio, outlining the main areas in which gender issues are of greatest importance. The SOW lists the primary tasks related to the assessment, the methodology to be used, and the deliverables expected.

**USAID/Pristina. (2003). Memorandum from USAID/Kosovo: Approval and Award of 18 month Cooperative Agreement with IOM. U.S. Agency for International Development: Pristina, Kosovo.**

Requests approval to award a \$518,804 cooperative agreement to the International Organization for Migration as a Public International Organization (PIO) for a proposed 18-month Reintegration Program for Kosovar Victims of Trafficking.

**USAID/Tblisi (2003). Trafficking in Persons—Georgia Appraisal, Inventory and Proposed Activity: Terms of Reference. U.S. Agency for International Development: Tblisi, Georgia.**

Terms of Reference for an assessment documenting the nature and scope of the problem of trafficking in persons in Georgia and activities currently underway to combat the problem.

**Vandenberg, Martina (2002). Hopes Betrayed: Trafficking of Women and Girls to Post-Conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina for Forced Prostitution. Human Rights Watch. Available at <http://www.hrw.org/reports/2002/bosnia/>.**

**Viall, Jeanne (2001, October 18). Idaba Faces Reality of Sex Tourism. Downloaded August 1, 2004 from [http://www.iol.co.za/index.php?set\\_id=1&click\\_id=13&art\\_id=ct20011018095820566S360355](http://www.iol.co.za/index.php?set_id=1&click_id=13&art_id=ct20011018095820566S360355).**

**Wijers and Doorninck (2002). Only Rights Can Stop Wrongs - A Critical Assessment of Anti-Trafficking Strategies.**

This paper was presented at EU/IOM STOP European Conference on Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings — A Global Challenge for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century. This paper examines programs used by both governmental and nongovernmental organizations to combat trafficking, with a focus on the impact on women. The report addresses such issues as strategies to prevent and combat trafficking, trafficking in women as a moral problem, trafficking in women as a labor problem, trafficking in women as a human rights problem, trafficking in women as a problem of organized crime, and trafficking in women as a problem of migration.

**Winrock Kyrgyzstan (2004). Second Quarterly Progress Report: Preventing Human Trafficking in Kyrgyzstan Project. Winrock International: Kyrgyzstan.**

Quarterly report addressing project goal, anticipated results, performance, monitoring and evaluation, statement of work, and financial information for Preventing Human Trafficking in Kyrgyzstan Project.

**Winrock Russia (2004). First Semi-Annual Progress Report: Path to Success. Winrock International: Russia.**

Progress report related to Path to Success, a Russia Far East anti-trafficking program emphasizing the importance of values. The report provides background information on the project, project goals and objectives, project management and coordination, programmatic planning, monitoring and evaluation activities, planned activities for the second half of the first year, and financial and contractual information.

**Winrock Ukraine (2003a). Third Quarterly Progress Report: Year Five—Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

This reports on the project activities.

**Winrock Ukraine (2003b). Fourth Quarterly Progress Report: Year Five—Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

This reports on the project activities.

**Winrock Ukraine (2003c). Indicator Chart: Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

An indicator chart reporting progress toward achievement of the indicators.

**Winrock Ukraine. (2003d). Twelfth Quarterly Progress Report: Women's Economic Empowerment. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

This reports on the project activities.

**Winrock Ukraine (2003e). Seventeenth Quarterly Project Report: Women's Economic Empowerment. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

This reports on the project activities.

**Winrock Ukraine (2004a). Twenty-first Quarterly Progress Report: Women's Economic Empowerment. Winrock International: Ukraine.**

This reports on the project activities.

**Winrock Ukraine (2004b). Statistical Analysis of Surveys of Human Trafficking Victims Who Sought Assistance at the Seven Regional Women for Women Centers of the Trafficking Prevention Project. Winrock International: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This report provides a statistical analysis of surveys of human trafficking victims who sought assistance at the regional Women for Women centers of the Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine.

**Winrock Ukraine (2004c). Winning Strategies: Trafficking Prevention Project in Ukraine: 1998–2004. Winrock International: Kyiv, Ukraine.**

This is a final program report that highlights key findings and lessons learned from Winrock's six-year countertrafficking project in Ukraine.

**Women for Future (2003). Trafficking of Women and Girls in Georgia: Sociological Survey.**

This report presents and analyzes data from two public surveys about trafficking in Georgia.

**World Learning (2002). Romanian American Sustainable Partnerships (RASP) Umbrella Grant Activity: Quarterly Reports of Activities (January–December, 2002). World Learning: Bucharest, Romania.**

Submitted to USAID/Romania, these four reports provide an overview of the activities conducted by the organizations that received countertrafficking grants through this project.

**World Learning (2003). Romanian American Sustainable Partnerships (RASP) Umbrella Grant Activity: Quarterly Reports of Activities (January–December, 2003). World Learning: Bucharest, Romania.**

Submitted to USAID/Romania, these four reports provide an overview of the activities conducted by the organizations that received countertrafficking grants through this project.

**Wyss, M. (2003). Evaluation of the Counter Trafficking Program in Moldova. SDC/HA**

An evaluation of the Swiss-funded portion of the IOM program in Moldova. The report includes analysis of coverage and impact, effectiveness and efficiency, operating environment and reintegration strategy options, organizational and institutional framework, key questions and findings, and recommendations.

**ANNEX B**

**INTERVIEWS AND OTHER COMMUNICATION**



## INTERVIEWS AND OTHER COMMUNICATION

### Albania

- Arian Giantris, USAID
- John Brogan, TDH
- Merita Mece, TDH

### Romania

- Daniela Nicoleta Andreescu National Labour Migration Office, Ministry of Labour and Social Affairs
- Irina Barbalata, Pro Women
- Adrian Caraboi, ARAS (Romania Association Against AIDS)
- Livia Deac, Partners for Change
- Ciprian Dron, Sanse Egale pentru Femei
- Nicoleta Druta, Partners for Change
- Moise Elena, International Labour Organization
- Cornel Fugaciu, Department for Preventing Illegal Border Crossing and Migration, Border Police
- Cosmin Grigorescu, Romanian Orthodox Church
- Daniel Kozak, International Organization for Migration Bucharest Mission
- Andreea Leitoiu, Sanse Egale pentru Femei
- Catalin Luca, Alternative Sociale
- Gabriela Manta, USAID
- Dana Munteanu, Save the Children Bucharest
- Mihai Toader, Ministry of Administration and Interior
- Marian Ursan, ARAS (Romania Association Against AIDS)
- S.V., Passport Department, Ministry of Interior

### Russia

- Natalia Abubikirova, Russian Association of Crisis Centers
- Natalia Alekhina, Winrock International
- Natalia Benediktova, USAID
- Larissa Boitchenko, Karelian Center of Gender Studies, Petrozavodsk
- Anastasia Danilina, IREX
- Juliette Engel, Miramed Institute
- Natalia Etskalo, Youth Union,
- Nancy Fisher-Gormley, USAID
- Boris Gavrilov, Investigative Committee, Ministry of Interior
- Steven Mackey, IREX
- Maria Melnikova, IOM
- Maria Mokhova, Sisters Center
- Olga Moshkova, USAID
- Maja Rusakova, NGO "Stellit," Saint Petersburg
- Natalia Scherbakova, ILO

- Eugenie Shvedov, Trade and Industry Office, Committee on Regulation of Entrepreneurial Activity
- Marianna Solomatova, (Angel Coalition?)
- Mikhail Tyurkin, Federal Migration Service, Ministry of Interior, Russia
- Natalie Vlassova, Employment Department, Ministry of Health and Social Development
- Sergei Yagodin, Main Office of Human Rights Ombudsmen in Russia
- Konstantin Zukov, Department of Human Rights and Humanitarian Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

## Ukraine

- Olga Avramenko, Successful Woman
- Svetlana Belyaeva, West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives”
- Eric Boyle, Eurasia Foundation
- Anna Corokovcka, Successful Woman
- Halyna Fedkovych, West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives”
- Susan Folger, Internews Network
- Nancy Godfrey, USAID
- Sheila Gwaltney, U.S. Embassy, Ukraine
- Darius Hyworan, Center for Ukrainian Reform Education
- Olena Kalbous, West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives”
- Larysa Kolos, State Committee of Ukraine on Family and Youth
- Iryna Konchenkova, School for Equal Opportunities
- Lyudmyla Kovalchuk, LaStrada Ukraine
- Olena Kustova, U.S. Embassy, Ukraine
- Kostyantyn Kvurt, Internews Ukraine
- Fredric Larsson, IOM
- Katerina Lebchenki, LaStrada Ukraine
- Gary Linden, USAID
- Luybov Maksymovych, West Ukrainian Center “Women’s Perspectives”
- Victoria Marchenko, USAID
- Wendy Maxwell, IOM
- Elena Mykytac, Successful Woman
- Tim O’Conner, IREX
- Tetyana Rastrigina, USAID
- Michael Scanlan, U.S. Embassy, Ukraine
- Hiedi Silvey, ABA/CIELI
- Kathryn Stevens, USAID
- Valerii Tantsiura, Ministry of Ukraine for Family, Children, and Youth
- Tatiana Timoshenko, USAID
- Tetiana Trischuk, Academy for Educational Development
- Hlib Yasnytsky, ILO
- Cordula Wohlmuther

**United States**

- Elizabeth Callender, USAID (formerly of IREX)
- Nancy Coan, IREX
- Amy Heyden, Winrock International
- Maggie McDonough, IREX
- Ruth Pojman, USAID
- Kelley Quinn, Winrock International

**ANNEX C**  
**TRAFFICKING PREVENTION FRAMEWORK**  
**AND INDICATORS**



**TRAFFICKING PREVENTION FRAMEWORK AND INDICATORS**

Strategic Objective: Reduction in the Number of People Trafficked From, To, or Through the Country.

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
Awareness Raising / Education	General population is aware of the risks and realities associated with migration/trafficking	General population is aware of trafficking and of the risks and realities migrant workers and prostituted women face	<p>1. Percentage increase in population who can name the main purposes for which people are trafficked, and the main ways in which people are recruited</p> <p>2. Percentage increase in target population who can name the main purposes for which people are trafficked, and the main ways in which people are recruited</p> <p>3.</p>	Survey of sample of population; focus group discussions (FGDs)	Research/survey company; internal or external evaluators; program implementers
	Those most at risk of being trafficked are aware of dangers associated with migration/trafficking				
	Those working with at-risk populations know about trafficking (health professionals, teachers, police, etc.)	Those working with at-risk populations know about trafficking (health professionals, teachers, police, etc.)			

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
Safe Migration	Those most at risk of being trafficked know precautions they can take to lower their risk of being trafficked		<p>4. Percentage of those at risk who know how to investigate the legitimacy of job offers and other ways of protecting themselves before departing</p> <p>5. Increase in use of centers or hotlines providing safe migration information and job-vetting services.</p>	<p>Survey of target population; FGDs</p> <p>Internal tracking mechanism</p>	<p>Research/survey company; internal or external evaluators; program implementers</p> <p>Program implementers</p>
		Those most at risk of being trafficked know how to seek help overseas if they have difficulties	<p>6. Increase in percentage of identified victims who actively sought assistance for themselves—from police, clients, NGOs, embassies, etc.—or ran away on their own (as opposed to being identified during police raids)</p>	Databases of identified victims	IOM; regional clearinghouse; police or immigration records; embassy records; NGOs
	Those most at risk of being trafficked prefer to stay in local area rather than migrating for work	Immigrants, especially those in sectors with high concentrations of trafficking victims, know how to seek help if they need it	7. Percentage of program participants who find and keep jobs locally	Follow-up survey of sample of program participants (checked after reasonable intervals—6 months, 12 months, etc.)	Program implementers
Employment/ Empowerment/ Community Enrichment					

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
			<p><b>8.</b> Percentage of program participants who have a significant increase in locally earned income</p> <p><b>9.</b> Change in number of program participants who are no longer interested in migrating from home</p> <p><b>10.</b> Change in number of program participants who believe it is possible to find gainful, interesting work in local area</p> <p><b>11.</b> Change in number of program participants who are no longer interested in migrating from home.</p> <p><b>12.</b> Number or percentage of clients whose problems are resolved locally</p> <p><b>13.</b> Percentage increase in target population who can name some of the conditions under which victims of trafficking for prostitution work</p>	<p>Follow-up survey of sample of program participants (checked after reasonable intervals—6 months, 12 months, etc.)</p> <p>Comparison of pre- and post-program surveys (post surveys after reasonable intervals—6 months, 12 months, etc.)</p> <p>Comparison of pre- and post-program surveys (post surveys after reasonable intervals—6 months, 12 months, etc.)</p> <p>Comparison of pre- and post-program surveys (post surveys after reasonable intervals—6 months, 12 months, etc.)</p> <p>Client case files</p> <p>Survey of sample of population; FGDs</p>	<p>Program implementers</p> <p>Program implementers</p> <p>Program implementers</p> <p>Program implementers</p> <p>Program implementers</p> <p>Research/survey company; internal or external evaluators; program implementers</p>
Crisis Intervention	People in crisis use local services to help solve their problems				
Demand Reduction		Users/potential users of prostitution understand what trafficking is and the conditions under which victims work			

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
		Use of prostitution becomes stigmatized/socially unacceptable	<p><b>14.</b> Changes in index measuring target population's interest in/social acceptance of the use of prostitution</p> <p><b>15.</b> Changes in target population's awareness of violence and commodification of women in prostitution</p>	Survey of sample of target population	Research/survey company; internal or external evaluators; program implementers
		Young men/boys are educated to reduce their social acceptance of the use of prostitution			
<b>Policies</b>					
Advocacy	Government resources are used for trafficking prevention	Government resources are used for trafficking prevention	<p><b>16.</b> Increase in percentage of national and/or local budgets dedicated to prevention of trafficking</p> <p><b>17.</b> Progress made on an index (to be developed)</p>	Review of national and local government budgets	Program implementers; government counterparts
	National coordination mechanism developed	National coordination mechanism developed		Review of national actions	Team of program implementers and USAID
Awareness Raising	A countertrafficking segment is developed and integrated into curricula at primary, secondary, tertiary schools and/or state institutions for children		<p><b>17.</b> Tracking of progress of implementation steps: materials developed, teachers trained, percentage of schools with functioning program</p> <p>See indicators from Awareness Raising / Education—numbers 2, 3, and 4</p>	Survey of teachers; survey of students	Program implementer

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
Criminalization		Use of services of trafficked or prostituted women is criminalized and violators are prosecuted	18. Target laws passed	Public record of legislative actions	Police, prosecutor, judiciary
			19. Number of people arrested and convicted of charges	Law enforcement data	
				20. Decrease in percentage of target population using services of prostitutes	Surveys or FGDs of sample target population
Regulation of Employment, Travel, Marriage Companies			See indicators from Demand Reduction—numbers 13, 14, and 15		
	Increase in public's knowledge of trafficking convictions and penalties		21. Percentage of general public who knows about prosecuted cases of trafficking and knows about the possible penalties that can be imposed	Survey of sample of population; FGDs	Research/survey company; internal or external evaluators; program implementers
		Reduction of trafficking through employment, travel, and/or marriage firms		22. Reduction in percentage of identified trafficking victims who report being recruited through such firms	Databases of identified victims

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
Government Labor Offices/ Employment Programs	Increased government services to support the unemployed at risk for trafficking		23. Increased number of government programs supporting those at risk for trafficking in finding employment or developing income-generating activities	Survey of government services; government records	Government counterparts; implementers
			24. Increased use of government employment services by those at risk for trafficking	Government records; survey of sample of population; FGDs	Government counterparts; implementers
Guest Worker Agreements	Increased number of overseas jobs available through legal options	Increased legal migration options	25. Increase in number of jobs available through guest worker agreements	Government records	Government counterparts; implementers
	Increased number of people employed through existing guest worker agreements	Increased number of people employed through existing guest worker agreements	26. Increase in number of people employed through guest worker agreements	Government records	Government counterparts; implementers
Border Controls	Posters and brochures readily available at border areas to inform migrants of their rights overseas and provide information about how to seek assistance abroad	Posters and brochures readily available at border areas to inform migrants of their rights in the destination country and provide information about how to seek assistance in the destination country	27. Existence and quality of materials	Random visits	Implementers

Category	Intermediate Result		Indicators	Method	Source
	Sending	Receiving			
	Border guards trained to identify migrants who may be at risk and to provide them with information without violating their human rights	Border guards trained to identify migrants who may be at risk and to provide them with information without violating their human rights	28. Improved rating on an index measuring ability to identify those at risk, if information is being provided, and how those at risk are being treated.	Reports from undercover visits to border posts by people role-playing as migrants in different circumstances	Implementers
			See indicators from Awareness Raising and Education—number 6		

Notes:

- 1) There is significant overlap in sending, receiving, or transit areas. Some countries may contain areas that are primarily sending and others that are primarily destination areas or others that are both or even all three—large cities as well as border/port areas are often all three. Therefore, countries may need a mix of interventions in order to ensure a full range of appropriate prevention interventions. A distinction is made between sending and receiving in the chart above only to help organize the framework.
- 2) Recent reports show that many countries that are traditionally known as countries of destination or transit in Europe and Eurasia are becoming sending countries as well because of difficult economic circumstances. Therefore, it is recommended that in all countries a minimum prevention strategy requires raising awareness about trafficking and risks of migration throughout the country.
- 3) Mission or implementers must use reliable research to identify those most at risk in each country.